# REGULAR MEETING - ZONING BOARD OF APPEALS CITY OF NOVI

TUESDAY, OCTOBER 8, 2019 7:00 P.M.

Council Chambers/Novi Civic Center

#### BOARD MEMBERS:

Joe Peddiboyina, Chairperson

Linda Krieger, Acting Secretary

David M. Byrwa

Kevin Sanker

Michael Longo

Siddharth Mav Sanghvi

Clift Montague

#### ALSO PRESENT:

Elizabeth Saarela, City Attorney

Lawrence Butler, Community Development,

Deputy Director

Katherine Opperman, Recording Secretary

### Reported by:

Cynthia Ann Chyla

## 10/8/2019

		Page 2
1	Certified Shorthand Reporter	J
2	AGENDA	
3		Page
4	Call to Order	3
5	Pledge of Allegiance	3
6	Roll Call	3
7	Public Hearing Format and Rules of Conduct	4
8	Approval of Agenda	4
9	Minutes - August and September 2019	5
10	Public Remarks	6
11	Public Hearings	
12	PZ19-0034	6
13	PZ19-0036	32
14	PZ19-0037	54
15	PZ19-0038	59
16	PZ19-0039	70
17	PZ19-0040	75
18	Adjournment	82
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		

	Page 3	
1	Novi, Michigan	
2	Tuesday, October 8, 2019	
3	7:00 p.m.	
4		
5	CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Good evening and welcome	
6	to the Novi Zoning Board of Appeals on Tuesday,	
7	October 10th, 2019. We will call to order and, please,	
8	everybody stand up for the Pledge of Allegiance lead by	
9	Michael.	
10	(Pledge of Allegiance)	
11	CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you.	
12	Okay. Please call for the roll.	
13	Kathryn.	
14	MS. OPPERMAN: Member Byrwa.	
15	MEMBER BYRWA: Here.	
16	MS. OPPERMAN: Chairperson Peddiboyina.	
17	CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Yes, please.	
18	MS. OPPERMAN: Member Krieger.	
19	MEMBER KRIEGER: Here.	
20	MS. OPPERMAN: Member Longo.	
21	MEMBER LONGO: Here.	
22	MS. OPPERMAN: Member Sanker.	
23	MEMBER SANKER: Here.	

Page 4 1 MS. OPPERMAN: Member Sanghvi. 2 MEMBER SANGHVI: Here. 3 MS. OPPERMAN: And Member Montague. MEMBER MONTAGUE: Here. 4 5 MS. OPPERMAN: All present. 6 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Thank you. 7 All right. We have a Board enough and a quorum. 8 Public Hearing Rules of Conduct which we'll just have any --9 please turn off your silent mode on your phones and we have 10 a public hearing wherein each case is called, upon anyone 11 can make any remarks. 12 It is on the television at home. And the people 13 can come to the podium and speak and they will be an 14 overhead and that will show up on the computer for the 15 people at the home as well. And that when people come up to 16 the podium, state your name and spell for the court recorder 17 and be sworn by the secretary if you are not an attorney. 18 And then we have the agenda tonight. We have 19 almost -- how many cases? 20 MS. OPPERMAN: Six cases. 21 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Six cases. Okay. 22 Approval of agenda. Is there any changes? 23 MS. OPPERMAN: There are not.

Page 5 1 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you. All right. 2 And so move to -- we have a motion for that. 3 MEMBER KRIEGER: I move to approve the agenda. MEMBER SANKER: Second. 4 5 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you. All in 6 favor. 7 (All indicate aye) 8 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: So we have an agenda and 9 we have things approved in August or September? Meeting minutes last month and before? 10 MS. OPPERMAN: Correct, yes. 11 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Any changes? 12 13 Okay. Do you have any motion for that? 14 MEMBER KRIEGER: I move for August and September 15 minutes to be accepted. 16 MEMBER SANKER: Second. 17 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Say aye. 18 MEMBER KRIEGER: Yes. 19 MEMBER SANGHVI: I like to make an amendment in 20 the September minutes. On page 11, Line 21, it should read 21 I did get out of my car and went to the yard and looked 22 around instead of saying I didn't. That's why you saw my 23 dog. You remember, he made a comment about the dog.

Page 6 1 And on page 26, Line 20 should read on E. Lake 2 Drive. 3 Thank you. CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Any other things? 4 5 Okay. Say aye. 6 MEMBER SANGHVI: Thank you. 7 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Motion is approved. 8 MEMBER KRIEGER: All in favor. 9 (All indicate aye) 10 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you. 11 MEMBER KRIEGER: Opposed? Aye. 12 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Public remarks, anyone 13 have regarding, other than the cases, have something for the 14 ZBA you can come to the podium and say now, any comments on 15 the public apart from our agenda? Seeing none. Okay. And let's move to the first 16 17 case. PZ19-0034, John Harvey, 151 Pickford Street, east 18 19 of West Park Drive and south of W. Pontiac Trail, parcel 20 Number 50-22-03-153-007. 21 The applicant is requesting a variance from the 22 City of Novi Zoning Ordinance, Section 4.19(E)i, for a 758 23 square feet of variance for a proposed 1,608 square feet of

Page 7 garage space, 850 square feet and 14 feet height allowed by 1 2 The applicant is proposing an attached garage in addition to existing attached garage. This property is 3 zoned single family residence R-4. 4 5 Are you an attorney? MEMBER KRIEGER: I am not an attorney. 6 MR. HARVEY: 7 MEMBER KRIEGER: Do you swear or affirm to tell 8 the truth in this case? 9 MR. HARVEY: T do. 10 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Madam Secretary. 11 MEMBER KRIEGER: All right. Thank you. 12 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Please go ahead 13 and spell your name. 14 My name is John Harvey. I'm asking MR. HARVEY: for a variance at 151 Pickford Street in Novi. 15 16 The property is an old cottage and at some point in its history there was an outbuilding and there was an 17 18 addition put on, I think it was put on in the '70s, sort of 19 a breezeway that connects this outbuilding to the house. 20 So the house currently has an attached garage. Its square footage is a little over 900, I don't remember 21 the exact number but over 900 square feet. Although that 22 23 seems like a wonderful garage it's very low ceiling height.

Page 8

The garage is less than 7 feet high. It's just over 6 feet, so, really, only a small car can get in. And even though the footprint is 900 square feet, one-quarter of that is actually about 10 inches below the garage floor height. So, actually, there's a cutout in the corner and there's a wall inside the garage that holds up the ceiling and it's sort of a little workroom or a little utility room in the back of the existing garage.

Also, the house is on a crawlspace so there's no basement and, so, really the garage that's there is primarily used for storage. You know, we put old furniture out there, you know, the washer and dryer that you're not going to throw away that belong to your parents, things like that that gets stored in there.

We can get one car in but what we're proposing is to build a detached garage, 24 x 28 along the side of the house. There's plenty of room on the side. We're respecting the side yard setback. We're respecting the front setback, the rear setback. We're respecting the lot coverage requirement. We're 10 feet from the house as is required and, really, the only variance I need is -- the height requirement is okay. It's just a standard 8-foot high garage, nothing tall, and the only variance I need is

for the total allowable square feet of storage space because this existing garage and the new garage together exceed the 850-foot requirement.

Also, the property is down near the lake. We have lake access at the end of the street so we've got kayaks and boats and trailers, and I really want to just try to and get that stuff in the garage so that looks better and it's easier to maintain. It's hard to cut the grass around the trailers and, you know, keep it to look nice. So I think putting the stuff inside helps protect the things that we own and also will look better in the neighborhood.

CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Anything you want to say?

MR. HARVEY: That's it.

CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you.

Anyone in the audience want to speak on this case, please come up to the podium, please.

Thank you.

MEMBER KRIEGER: By the way, do you have a picture you can put on the overhead for viewers to see at home?

MR. HARVEY: I apologize. I didn't bring any. I thought you guys would have it as part of the copies that were printed.

MR. HEAD: My name is Kyle Head. I live at 144
Pickford Street, which is the property directly across the
street from the property in question which is my
mother-in-law's house. She's here. I live there with my
mother-in-law, my wife and my 4-year old daughter.

There's something here that this gentleman is not being truthful about. This property is being used as a commercial storage facility currently and that's what he's trying to do, is trying to keep the City from knowing what he's doing over there.

I have watched in the last 2 weeks five or six different people that are not this gentleman come. There is a number of different boats, there's a number of different broken down cars, there's a number of different trailers, five or six different vehicles pulling in and out of there. Three of them have hit our mailbox, one of which I was standing on the porch. The gentleman looked at me, put his hand on the mailbox, it's now leaning, looked at me and got in his vehicle and went away.

I've never seen this gentleman before in my life.

This is a rental property. He is sitting here portraying to you like this is his home and these are his things that he's worried about storing. That is not the truth. He rents

this house out and this house has been a rental property for a number of years. My mother-in-law has been in the neighborhood for 45 years. Her father was one of the people that built six houses in this neighborhood.

I can tell you right now that the way this is being portrayed is not exactly the situation and I feel like this gentleman felt like he was going to slip this variance in and nobody from the neighborhood was going to show up and say anything, and I'm actually pretty perturbed that the home owners association didn't show up, and my mother-in-law and me are the only ones here speaking up about this.

Because this is going to -- if he does this this is going to decrease our property value and the property value of everybody's house there on the street if there's a storage facility, a commercial storage building being ran out of a residential neighborhood which is -- which is happening, and I can bring pictures of all of this if you would like.

And that's all I have to say.

CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Thank you.

Anyone else?

MR. HARVEY: Am I allowed to rebut that?

23 MEMBER KRIEGER: In a minute.

CHAIRMAN PEDDIBOYINA: One second, please.

Thank you.

MR. EBERLEIN: Hi. My name is Greg Eberlein. I live at 137 Pickford Street which is the house directly next door. I can verify, yeah, there are many broken down vehicles and trailers and I have never seen that guy before. I've been living there a year now and I want to just say no to the proposal.

CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you.

Okay. Anyone in the audience, please?

Okay. Please you can come and ....

MR. HARVEY: So, I'm not trying to deceive anybody. Some of the things that the gentleman said are true. I do rent the house out. I purchased it as a second home quite some time ago. I live on the lake and, so, I use -- I rent out the house and I store some trailers there because I don't have any space on the lake where I live.

Everything that's in the yard is behind the plane of the house, it all meets the requirements of the City and everything that's there belongs to me. We don't rent it to anybody or lease out any commercial space. The cars that he's referring to, they all have license plates on them. My pickup truck, I store it over there sometimes because my

driveway is too full. I've got a number of cars, and my
daughter's car is there right now because she's at college
so I parked it over there so that I can park in my driveway
at my house. And that's why I want this garage, so I can
put my kids' cars and my extra car in there. And my kids
are graduating college in the next couple of years and so I
have plans to use this house and that's why I purchased --

MR. HEAD: So why have we never seen you and only seen a half dozen --

CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Sorry, sorry, one second, please. Let him talk. Thank you.

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

MR. HARVEY: As far as the cars that came out of there that hit his mailbox, I don't have any knowledge if somebody else's parked in that lot unbeknownst to me.

Certainly if I ever hit one of my neighbor's mailbox I would certainly take care of that. But I don't know, I don't know what he's referring to.

I can assure you that everything that's in that lot is mine. It's all registered, it all has license plates on it. Everything there belongs to me.

CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Thank you.

Okay. Anybody in the audience that wants to speak, please?

Page 14 1 MR. HEAD: Now I do again. I have a rebuttal to 2 that. 3 This is ridiculous. This man is going to sit up here and just say -- I just said and another neighbor just 4 5 came and said that they haven't seen him. All right. My mother-in-law can testify to this, my wife can testify to 6 7 I just said a number of different people who have not 8 been this gentleman have pulled different vehicles out of that lot and taken trailers and property out of that lot and 9 10 hit my mailbox that weren't him. So what he just said to 11 you is a blatant lie. 12 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you. 13 MR. HEAD: Period. 14 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Please come up to 15 the podium. 16 MEMBER KRIEGER: You're the petitioner. Come stay 17 up here. 18 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: If you can stand at the 19 podium, please. You can stand --20 MR. HARVEY: You want me go up there? 21 CHAIRMAN PEDDIBOYINA: Yeah, you can stand next to 22 the podium. Thank you. 23 MR. EBERLEIN: I also would like to point out the

Page 15 fact that currently there are prefabricated trusses in the 1 2 garage door sitting on the property right now. I don't know what his intentions are with those, but do what you want 3 4 with that. 5 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. And the final 6 call for the public hearing in this case, please. 7 Okay. Seeing none. 8 Okay. And from the City? MR. BUTLER: The only comment I'd say is I have 9 10 not seen any history of any ordinance violations of any extra vehicles that were like disabled or trashed up in the 11 yard, but we can follow up on that just for the history of 12 13 it. 14 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Thank you. 15 Corresponding Secretary. MEMBER KRIEGER: 16 In Case Number PZ19-0034, 48 17 letters were sent, zero returned, one approval contingent, two objections. 18 19 The first one is: We object to the proposal for the following reasons: The home is used as a rental 20 21 property. We have heard that he is also using to rent 22 storage space for the various vehicles and trailers on the

property. If this -- if this true that means he is using

23

the property as commercial property. He also has trusses assembled on the property for structure of some type. We believe he intends to proceed with construction. That's from Greg Eberlein, E-B-E-R-L-E-I-N on Pickford.

Hello, my name is Rebecca Walker and my husband

Marty Eakin -- E-A- K-I-N -- and I live at 1980 S. Lake

Court, Novi. Our property is located directly behind 151

Pickford. Currently there is a large section of broken and missing fence bordering the parcel that the proposed detached garage would be located. This section of fence has been damaged for over a year. It is suspected that the fence was knocked over by a boat that was backed into the lot for storage. Please see the attached pictures for reference. Our approval of this domestic variance is contingent upon repair of the fence before or during construction of the attached garage. And please let me know if you have any questions or any additional information.

Thank you, Rebecca Walker.

And the third one is: Please note my objection to the request variance. Please take into consideration the property owner does not live at this location. This is a rental property zoned single family residential, and adding another building for storage to be used by someone other

Page 17 1 than the person who lives at the location should be 2 considered a storage unit, not a garage. For that purpose 3 this should not be approved. He states on his application 4 the subdivision is close to and has access to Walled Lake. 5 He needs additional space to store his boats, Jet Ski, et cetera. These items are from his home located at 1321 6 7 Lake, not from the renter's located at 151 Pickford. 8 The property owner also stated on his application the 9 current garage on the property has a step in the floor and a 10 low ceiling height, unusable for large vehicles and boats. 11 They should probably repair the garage already on the property. We strongly object to adding another building on 12 13 this property. Mark and Kathy H-A-T-C-H-I-G-I-N. 14 Thank you. That's it. CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you, Secretary. 15 16 And I would like to request any in the audience 17 and I don't want to now -- please come to the podium first 18 to talk at the podium only. Thank you so much. 19 Now I'm putting this case to the Board. 20 want to speak on the .... 21 Okay, Mr. --22 MEMBER SANGHVI: Thank you. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

Thank you, Mr. Harvey. I came and looked at the property

23

Page 18 1 which you are talking about and I did see quite a few things 2 in your yard, and my question is why aren't you calling this a 3 storage space instead of a garage? MR. HARVEY: Because of the size of it. 4 5 MEMBER SANGHVI: You need a place to keep things 6 in; right? Storage space you are looking for? 7 MR. HARVEY: Yeah. I mean, it's going to have a 8 garage door and it will have cars in it as well as, like I said, boats and trailers, so that's why I -- I wasn't -- I 9 10 called it a garage because that's what I thought it was. 11 MEMBER SANGHVI: Because the one you have described so far you really need to put stuff inside in this 12 13 kind of weather to store things. 14 MR. HARVEY: Honestly, I was trying to just clean 15 the property up. You know, there's a lot of stuff there and 16 it looks unsightly to me, so I assume it looks unsightly to 17 everyone else. 18 MEMBER SANGHVI: Okay. I have a question for 19 Mr. Butler. What is the difference, the requirement for a 20 garage and a storage shed? 21 MR. BUTLER: It is an accessory building. 22 it's a considered an accessory building, a garage which is

also an accessory building. He has already an existing

23

Page 19 1 garage. He wants another as a garage. He can call it 2 either a garage or an accessory building. If he's using it 3 for storage, he's using it for storage but by definition it's still a garage. 4 5 MEMBER SANGHVI: But aren't there difference in 6 the ordinance about requirement for a garage rather than a 7 storage? MR. BUTLER: No. It still falls under --8 They're both identical? 9 MEMBER SANGHVI: 10 MR. BUTLER: No. 850 square feet. 11 MEMBER SANGHVI: I don't have any more questions. 12 Thank you. 13 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you. Anyone else on the Board? 14 15 Okay. Linda. 16 MEMBER KRIEGER: For counsel, the ownership of the 17 property, is that necessary for additions? MS. SAARELA: Well, if he owns it, he can file the 18 19 application whether he's renting it out or not. 20 MEMBER KRIEGER: Okay. 21 MS. SAARELA: So it sounds like the neighbors are indicating that he rents it out to third parties. He's 22 23 still the owner, he still can apply for a variance.

MEMBER KRIEGER: So he's paying the taxes on the property?

MS. SAARELA: I don't know that, but as the owner he would probably be getting the tax bill unless he directed it elsewhere.

MEMBER KRIEGER: Okay. And then for you you're asking for 758 square feet larger? Is that the smallest that you can create for an additional garage?

MR. HARVEY: Well, actually, the existing attached garage is already in excess of the 850, so the garage that I'm proposing is less than 700 more. It's 28 by 24. I don't remember the numbers exactly, but I could type it on my calculator.

I mean, it's -- I was trying to be able to get as much of this stuff inside as possible so that it could look nice. And I intentionally moved it far away from my neighbor that's on the east side, you know, that's really the person that it would be closest to. The requirement was for a 6-yard setback there and I made it 10, because I could line it up with the backside of the other house. I was trying to make it fit as best I could.

MEMBER KRIEGER: So if he calls it -- to the City, if he calls it a garage and he already has a garage, is that

why the number is so big?

MR. BUTLER: Because he's cutting the square footage of existing plus the one he's putting up. That's why the number is so big total. I believe that is what you're implying?

MR. HARVEY: That's the only variance is that together they exceed 850.

MEMBER KRIEGER: And regarding the statements and the correspondence that was -- regarding that property, the repair and upkeep of the property, you're going to put another building on for storage.

I drove by, I saw that there was another -- that the garage was there. You have a fence around it. I've noticed that, though, from like previous cases and other areas in the City there are no fences that visitors from out of town come and park on other people's properties without a fence. And, so, for the fence in the back, according to that -- could you address that, please.

MR. HARVEY: Well, there was a dog ear fence in the back of the property. The entire property was surrounded by a fence when I purchased it.

The poles have rotted out and the fence fell down, but it was -- I concluded that it was on my property. This

Page 22 1 happened a couple of years ago and I haven't heard from the 2 neighbor, there's been no contact. Quite honestly I was 3 planning on putting the fence back up before I put the 4 garage up so I have no issue with that. 5 MEMBER KRIEGER: So you could repair that first 6 before? 7 MR. HARVEY: Yeah, yeah, I would be willing to do 8 that. Okay. That's it. 9 MEMBER KRIEGER: 10 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you. 11 You mentioned that all the vehicles are on your 12 name? 13 MR. HARVEY: Say that again. 14 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: The vehicles. 15 MR. HARVEY: Well, the one vehicle belongs to my 16 daughter because she's up at school, but they belong to my 17 family, me -- all of them belong to me except for the one 18 that belongs to my daughter. And the trailers are all mine. 19 I know it's hard to believe, but I like boats. I have a lot 20 of boats. 21 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: How many vehicles are in 22 your family? 23 MR. HARVEY: How many?

Page 23 1 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Vehicles. MR. HARVEY: There's only one car there now, it's 2 3 my daughter's. I have my pickup truck at my house because I 4 was using it this week. 5 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Thank. 6 Anyone else on the Board? 7 Okay. Please go ahead. 8 MEMBER SANKER: So do you intend to rent out that 9 garage space as storage? 10 MR. HARVEY: No. I mean, I'm planning on using it 11 for myself or I'll rent it with the property to the people 12 that are living there, not to anyone else. 13 MEMBER SANKER: And why can't you build a garage 14 on your primary property? 15 MR. HARVEY: Because there's no room. 16 lakefront lot and there's no room to build an additional 17 garage there. MEMBER SANKER: Okay. It seems like a reasonable 18 19 option would be to rent out storage space. There's a lot of 20 places that you can just rent storage and store RVs and 21 boats and things like that. Why can't you do that? 22 MR. HARVEY: Well, I mean, I could do that, but I 23 own this property and so I have the right to park things

behind the front plane of the house. I'm not in violation of any ordinances. There's been no calls or any complaints.

I actually -- you know, I talked to the ordinance officer a few times since I live in Novi. I've lived in Novi for 23 years. But I've never had a call or complaint from her. If I did I would take care of it immediately.

And, so, I have this property and I'm planning on owning it, you know, for quite some time and I think it would be an upgrade, an addition to the value of the home, and with the lakefront access that's why I bought this house when I did because I think that, you know, having access to the lake, and it's a ranch house, is something that I'm going to want to have in the future, so I'm just trying to build it so it's going to work for me does what I want it to do.

MEMBER SANKER: And have you ever had any issues with the tenants as far as you using the property for storage of the vehicles before?

MR. HARVEY: No. No. I don't rent -- you know, it's -- because it's like a second home, you know, some people own a second home up north and they'll rent it out to people and they'll come and ski and use the house, you know, and they keep a room for themselves in the home. And it's

Page 25 1 pretty common for a second home for people to not rent the 2 whole thing. And, so, when people rent, I tell them that, 3 you know, I'm using the side but I'm renting them the rest. 4 MEMBER SANKER: Okay. 5 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you. 6 Go ahead. 7 MEMBER KRIEGER: A question for the City, I've 8 forgotten. The renter for -- can you on a property do it as 9 a commercial business where you can have other people store 10 stuff on it and then charge them? MR. BUTLER: It's not zoned for a commercial 11 business, it's zoned for residential, so he's renting it as 12 13 a property, as a rental, as a house to rent. He can do that. That's what I believe he said he's doing. But he 14 15 can't rent it as a business unless it's designed for 16 business. 17 MEMBER KRIEGER: Would they need a license for that? 18 19 MR. BUTLER: That I would not know. 20 MEMBER KRIEGER: Okay. 21 MS. SAARELA: He would need a rezoning for that. 22 MR. BUTLER: Yeah. 23 MEMBER KRIEGER: And there's no way to know that

Page 26 1 that's done? Is there a way to know that's done? 2 MS. SAARELA: There would not be a way to know at this point whether he's renting his garage for commercial 3 4 use without further investigating him, no. 5 MEMBER KRIEGER: Okay. 6 MR. HARVEY: That's true of anybody in any 7 neighborhood. 8 MEMBER KRIEGER: For the renter that's there now, the space that's -- I couldn't -- I didn't see the back, but 9 10 that whole spot that's going to be a garage, would that -that would usually be like a play area, so the renter that 11 you have they don't have children or pets? 12 13 MR. HARVEY: No, they do. There's an entire fenced-in yard behind the house that they're using today. 14 15 They have -- their dog runs back there. Like I said, with 16 the existing house and the garage together, the total lot 17 coverage is less than the 25 percent required, so 75 percent 18 of my property is still grass. 19 MEMBER KRIEGER: Okay. Thank you. CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: 20 Thank you. 21 I have another question. Since how long you 22 rented this property? 23 MR. HARVEY: How long have I rented it?

1 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Um-hmm.

MR. HARVEY: I purchased it in 2005.

CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Since then you have

rented the property?

MR. HARVEY: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: How many renters changed

7 the property since 2005?

MR. HARVEY: Oh, I don't know. The people that are in there now have been in there about a year. The people that were there before them were there for about 3 years. We've had a couple of tenants that were there for a year and one that was there for 6. So it just varies. It depends on sort of the economy and what's going on.

But, you know, I mean I'm available, my cell phone is available if the neighbors ever have any concerns. I actually got some feedback from the renters that somebody walked into their house, thought it was the wrong one and people were parking on the grass, so I've been kind of going over there to see what's going on. Because they were complaining themselves about some activity in the neighborhood. But I haven't had anybody complain about them. And, of course, people always have the right to call the police or call the City if they have any issue and I'm

Page 28 1 sure the City would contact me directly if there was a 2 problem. 3 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Does your renter have any vehicles? 4 5 MR. HARVEY: Do they what? 6 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Does your tenant have 7 any vehicles? 8 MR. HARVEY: Do they have any? 9 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Vehicles, any cars or 10 anything for your tenant. 11 MR. HARVEY: Do they have cars? 12 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Yeah. 13 MR. HARVEY: Yeah. There's a driveway in front of 14 the garage there. 15 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: How many are here for 16 them? 17 MR. HARVEY: I think they have 2 cars. 18 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Two cars. 19 MR. HARVEY: I don't know for sure, to be honest. 20 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: And you're using the 21 garage for storage for your purpose, not for the tenant? 22 MR. HARVEY: Well, I want to add the garage with 23 the property. So, I can't promise you that I won't rent it

Page 29 1 with the garage. Somebody -- if these people move out and 2 somebody moves in and they have a lot of stuff and they want to put it in the garage and they're going to pay me extra 3 rent for the house with the extra garage, I may rent that 4 5 space to them. It just depends on, you know, what makes 6 sense to the renter, the person that's arriving. 7 I know that right now the garage that's there I 8 get people that tell me when they come to look at it and 9 rent it that they can't pull a car in there. They can't 10 pull a full-size car. You can pull a little small car in 11 but the ceiling height is too small. 12 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Did you rent the 13 property along with the garage or it's separate? 14 MR. HARVEY: With the garage that's attached? 15 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Yes. 16 MR. HARVEY: I rent that with the house. 17 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: With the house. 18 MR. HARVEY: That's how it's rented today. 19 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Rented to the renter 20 currently, but you're using your place? 21 MR. HARVEY: Pardon me? 22 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: You're using for that

23

property, no?

MR. HARVEY: I have some of my trailers and stuff stored on the side of the property next to the garage behind them, behind the plane of the house.

CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay.

MR. HARVEY: If I park that stuff all in my yard it would all be on, you know, the lakefront and I'm just trying to find the best way to deal with it, you know.

CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Thank you.

Do the Board have any other questions?

MEMBER KRIEGER: No.

CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay, Linda.

Go ahead, motion.

MEMBER KRIEGER: In Case Number PZ19-0034 for John Harvey, 151 Pickford east of West Park and south of West Pontiac Trail, parcel 50-22-03-153-007, applicant is requesting variances from the City of Novi Zoning Ordinance Section 4.19(E)i for a 758-square foot variance for a proposed 1608 square feet of garage space, 850 square feet and 14-foot height allowed by code. Applicant is proposing a detached garage in addition to existing attached garage.

The -- I move that we deny the variance in this case sought by the petitioner because he has not shown a practical difficulty requiring the amount of increase, 758

feet in the garage.

The circumstances and features of the property including its footprint and topography are not unique because they exist generally throughout the City. The circumstances and features of the property relating to the variance request are self-created because the person owns two properties and rented -- and the house is rented and petitioner can choose other options.

The failure to grant relief will result in mere inconvenience or inability to attain higher economic or financial return. Based on the petitioner's statement, the petitioner has these two properties and other options are available.

The variance would result in interference in the adjacent and surrounding properties by the increase.

Granting the variance would be consistent with the spirit and intent of the ordinance because it's not a minimal request.

MEMBER BYRWA: I second.

CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay.

21 MEMBER KRIEGER: Council.

22 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Go ahead, Kathryn, call

23 the role.

Page 32 1 MS. OPPERMAN: Member Sanker? 2 MEMBER SANKER: Agreed. 3 MS. OPPERMAN: Member Sanghvi? MEMBER SANGHVI: No. 4 5 MS. OPPERMAN: Member Longo. 6 MEMBER LONGO: Agreed. 7 MS. OPPERMAN: Member Krieger. 8 MEMBER KRIEGER: Yes. 9 MS. OPPERMAN: Chairperson Peddiboyina? 10 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: 11 MS. OPPERMAN: Member Byrwa. 12 MEMBER BYRWA: Yes. 13 MS. OPPERMAN: And Member Montague? MEMBER MONTAGUE: Yes. 14 15 MS. OPPERMAN: Motion passes. 16 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you. 17 MR. HARVEY: Thank you very much for your time. 18 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Let's go for Case Number 2. It's a long case number. For you, if anything, I'm 19 20 going too fast let me know, I can slow down. Thank you. PZ19-0036, the Goddard School, 39659 Thirteen Mile 21 22 Road west of Haggerty and south of Thirteen Mile Road, 23 Parcel Number 50-22-12-20 0-050.

The applicant is requesting a variance from the City of Novi Zoning Code Section 4.12.i.a for a proposed 19,033 square feet of outdoor recreation area, 23,400 square feet required by code.

Section 4.12.2.i.a for a proposed recreation area occupying 63.87 percent of the exterior side yard, up to 25 percent of the distance between the building and the property allowed by code.

Section 5.4.3 for the absence of a loading zone. Section 5.2 for the deficiency of parking space, 40 space proposed, 41 required by code.

Section 4.19.2.f for a proposed dumpster located in the front yard. Dumpsters are required to be located in the rear yard by code.

Section 4.19 for the location of play/shade structures in the exterior and interior side yards and than less 10 feet from the main building. By the code accessory structure must be located in the rear yard and must be located greater than 10 feet from the main building.

Section 5.11 for the location of a fence in the exterior side yard. By code no fence shall extend into front or exterior side yard. The proposed plan has a fence around the outdoor recreation area in the exterior side yard

Page 34 1 on the east side. 2 City of Novi Code of Ordinance Section 28-5(a) for 3 a second ground sign. One ground sign allowed by code. 4 Section 28-6 for an overtime, oversize temporary 5 ground sign. This property is zoned Office Service 6 Technology (OST). 7 Thank you. Okay. 8 Okay. Please state your name for the recorder for the record. 9 10 MR. POLLARD: Yes, good evening. My name is Jim Pollard. I'm with Professional Engineering Associates. My 11 address is 2430 Rochester Court, Suite 100, Troy, Michigan 12 13 48083. I'm here on behalf of the applicant, the Campbell 14 Group, LLC. 15 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Are you an attorney? 16 MR. POLLARD: I am not. I'm an engineer. 17 MEMBER KRIEGER: Do you swear or affirm to tell the truth in this case? 18 19 MR. POLLARD: I do. 20 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Please go ahead. 21 MR. POLLARD: So we have quite a few items in 22 front of you this evening requesting a variance. 23 The subject property is approximately 2 acres.

It's zone OST. It's located on the south side of Thirteen
Mile Road on the west side of Cabot Drive.

There is an ITC overhead power line adjacent to the site to the west. There's an existing stormwater detention system here, and underneath all that power line and extending to the west is a regulated wetland. So the site has obviously some geometrical configuration challenges. What we are proposing is a 10,000 square foot single story chid care facility, the Goddard School. There is one currently in Novi. They are already a branded product.

I notice in the application that I received online some of the documentation in the back is inconsistent. It seems like a repeat of everything, and then the notation in front I think you received in your packet. What I'd like to do is go through if you would indulge me through the application, this portion which lists the 1 through 10 items.

Put this in the right configuration, north being up. Thirteen Mile Road and Cabot Drive and then the ITC corridor.

The first variance that we are seeking is for the outdoor recreational area. The City's ordinance requires

150 square feet per student. We are requesting a reduction in variance. Typically Goddard's requirements are 120 square feet per student. So we request a variance down to 19,333 square feet for that.

The next variance that we're requesting is to omit the loading zone. For a dwelling like this, child care, we really don't need a dedicated loading area, so we would request a variance for that. Deliveries are made by small vehicles and there's ample parking on site to accommodate deliveries.

The next variance we're requesting is for the dumpster. Obviously we have a frontage on Thirteen Mile Road, we have frontage on Cabot Drive. The dumpster is located in this area. We pushed it back as far as we can to the west property line but we're still within the front yard of the building so we are asking for a variance for that.

The next one is the two accessory structures.

Typically in the ordinance accessory structures are detached garages or sheds. In this instance these are play structures for the children. There are two of them on site.

One is located in this area on the east side of the building, the other is on the west side of the building.

These are child play facilities for them.

The next variance that we're requesting is to allow for the building -- for these structures to be placed 10 feet from the building, less than 10 feet from the building.

2.1

The one, next variance Number 6 is to allow for a percentage of play area in the side yard setback, from our graphic. The City's zoning ordinance allows for 25 feet.

Again, this is the building. These are -- the black lines are denoting the side yards and the play areas, which hatched in this area and this dark area are the play areas, and we exceed that. We're at 63 percent, approximately 63.78 percent if we take these shaded areas. So we're asking for a variance for that.

Obviously it's a child facility, and safety to children are important. The areas are fenced. The fence extends essentially around the periphery of the site from here all the way around in that area. So we are requesting to be allowed to install a fence within the front yard, and are on site.

The reduction in required parking. The zoning ordinance has two requirements for parking for a facility like this. Number 1, it's based on its useful square footage. Using the usable square foot we have to have 21

parking spaces. In addition, to that they require parking for a number of employees. In this facility we have 20, so we have 41 parking spaces. But the interesting thing you're somewhat double-dipping because you have employees that are in the usable space so we're asking for a variance of just one parking space.

Signage. For the building we are proposing and requesting a variance. We do have a ground sign here. We are requesting in the next variance an additional ground sign in this location on Thirteen Mile Road, and then on the building, on this face of the building, we are requesting a signage on the building as well.

Again, the site has some unique characteristics, double frontages, the narrowness of the site. It does have some topography to it. We are going to build a retaining wall to keep the child area intact. There's wetlands that we're not going to impact.

So we've got some physical challenges with the site and we think we've done the best we can, and in looking at this I think any development that would come forward would have to have some sort of variances granted for its development.

Again, we're specific use and some of the stuff

Page 39 we're asking for relate to the outside recreational area, 1 2 the accessory structures, things like that are related to our use and certainly wouldn't be related to another project 3 but certainly for what we're doing. 4 5 So if you have any questions I'm certainly willing 6 to answer them. I have the representative of the owners, 7 the contractor and Goddard School if you have any questions 8 specifically related to that. 9 Thank you. 10 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you. 11 Okay. Anyone in the audience on this case, 12 please. 13 Seeing none. 14 Okay. From the City? 15 MR. BUTLER: The only comment I would make from 16 the City is just be aware that this site plan was ran 17 through Planning, and Planning, they did all of the -- I was 18 actually out for surgery at the time, so I did not endeavor 19 in this, but this did go through Planning and our staff for everything that he outlined what he needed to speak towards. 20 21 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you. 22 Madam Corresponding Secretary. 23 MEMBER KRIEGER: In Case Number PZ19-0036, the

1 Goddard School, 11 letters were sent, letters returned zero, approvals 1, objections zero. Approval is from Matthew 2 Sosin, S-O-S-I-N: President, Dear Members of the Zoning 3 Board of Appeals, Northern Equities Group has developed 4 5 Haggerty Corridor Corporation Park and owner of many of the 6 buildings located nearby the proposed Goddard School 7 development is in full support of this development. We are excited to bring this amenity into our professional business 8 9 park. Many of our existing tenants have requested having 10 such a use in the park. We're excited to have Goddard School providing this much needed amenity and hope that the 11 Zoning Board of Appeals approves their application. 12

That's it.

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you.

When I drove -- when I came recently I drove your property I saw that and you showed the presentation. So I was impressed on that and I have no questions. I wish you good luck. And Board people, they can speak up. Anybody on the Board?

Dave, go ahead.

MEMBER BYRWA: Yeah. I had a question more for Larry here. In the beginning when he started speaking he mentioned a reduction in the square footage per pupil from

Page 41 1 150 to 120. Is that a Novi ordinance or is that a state 2 law? MR. BUTLER: That is the Novi that he is -- for 3 our school district. 4 5 MEMBER BYRWA: Novi set that square footage. 6 Because I know the state sets square footages on that, too. 7 And if it was the state he should be applying to the state 8 for a variance. MR. BUTLER: No, he's referring to the Novi one. 9 10 MEMBER BYRWA: Okay. Thank you. 11 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Thank. 12 Mr. Sanghvi, please go ahead. 13 MEMBER SANGHVI: Thank you. 14 Is this going to be a second campus? Are you 15 going to close the first one on Grand River? MR. POLLARD: I'm sorry? 16 17 MEMBER SANGHVI: You have already one campus --18 MR. POLLARD: Correct. 19 MEMBER SANGHVI: -- on Grand River. So is this 20 going to be a second campus? 21 MR. POLLARD: It will be a second campus, yes. 22 MEMBER SANGHVI: Two campuses you're going to have 23 in Novi?

Page 42 1 MR. POLLARD: Correct. 2 MEMBER SANGHVI: Okay. Now, will you please show me where is the detention basin you were talking about --3 4 MR. POLLARD: Sure. 5 MEMBER SANGHVI: -- as compared to where you are 6 putting the building. 7 MR. POLLARD: Here is the building. 8 MEMBER SANGHVI: Yes. 9 MR. POLLARD: Here is the outside play area. Here 10 is the stormwater retention basin. 11 MEMBER SANGHVI: So you're going to be fenced out completely --12 13 MR. POLLARD: Yeah. MEMBER SANGHVI: -- from the detention basin? 14 15 MR. POLLARD: Because of the topography -- see 16 this heavy dark line? That's a retaining wall. 17 MEMBER SANGHVI: Yeah. 18 MR. POLLARD: A couple feet high and on top of 19 that. MEMBER SANGHVI: The orientation of the building 20 21 you are showing on one of your diagram? 22 MR. POLLARD: Yes. 23 MEMBER SANGHVI: Is going to be east side, the

Page 43 1 main building is facing the east side? 2 MR. POLLARD: The main building, let me grab the elevation of the building. 3 4 All right. So what you see, this elevation is the 5 south. MEMBER SANGHVI: It is the south elevation? 6 7 MR. POLLARD: So that's the entry into the 8 building. Okay? This is the -- that faces Thirteen Mile Road. 9 10 MEMBER SANGHVI: That's north, yes. MR. POLLARD: Yeah, that's the north face of the 11 building. 12 13 MEMBER SANGHVI: I'm just trying to figure out what is going to be facing the M-5. Because you're not too 14 15 far from M-5. 16 MR. POLLARD: What will be facing M-5 would be this. 17 MEMBER SANGHVI: So there is no access for 18 19 children to go back on the west side? 20 MR. POLLARD: No. I mean, there's an area, an 21 outside area for them. There's a structure out there. 22 MEMBER SANGHVI: Because my main concern is the safety of the children. 23

Page 44 1 MR. POLLARD: Absolutely, 100 percent. 2 MEMBER SANGHVI: And I want to make sure that they are safe from the detention basin. I don't want the 3 children go and drown into water there. Because you are 4 5 going to have very young children there; right? MR. POLLARD: That is correct. 6 7 MEMBER SANGHVI: Do you know what the age group 8 going to be? 9 MR. POLLARD: Brian. 10 MR. JOHNSTON: Good evening, I'm Brian Johnston 11 with Goddard Systems, 1016 W. 9th Avenue, King of Prussia. The age groups --12 13 MEMBER KRIEGER: Do I have to swear him in? think --14 15 MR. POLLARD: You have to be sworn in. 16 MEMBER KRIEGER: Do you swear or affirm to tell the truth in this case? 17 18 MR. JOHNSTON: I do. 19 MEMBER KRIEGER: Thank you. 20 And then could you -- I'm sorry, could you spell 21 your name for the court recorder. 22 MR. JOHNSTON: Sure, Brian, B-R-I-A-N, Johnston, J-O-H-N-S-T-O-N. 23

MEMBER KRIEGER: Thank you.

MR. JOHNSTON: The school serves age groups 6
weeks to 6 years and the playgrounds are divided age
specifically, so the playground on the east -- on the west
side, I mean, sorry, is for the infant and toddler age group
which would be up to 24 months. And the -- I'm sorry,
36 months. And the playground on the Cabot Drive side which
would be the east side will serve from 3 years to 5 years,
36 to 60 months.

MEMBER SANGHVI: So what do you think is going to be estimated number of students in this campus?

MR. JOHNSTON: The estimated capacity is 144.

However, with our rotations, there will never be more than
40 students out at one time.

The maximum number on the west side would be 16 due to student-to-teacher ratios. The maximum on the east side would be 24. I believe they're -- depending on various scheduling will be up to the franchisees to determine if we have rotations, 3 or 4 rotations per day. So the max at any one time total would be 40 students out there at one time.

MEMBER SANGHVI: Because I notice somewhere in your application that you have one or two classes outside for recreation outdoors at the same time. So how large are

Page 46 1 your classes? 2 MR. JOHNSTON: I'm sorry, how loud? MEMBER SANGHVI: What is the size of your --3 MR. JOHNSTON: 16 or 24, depending on the age 4 5 The maximum would be 24 and that would be for the 3-6 to 5-year class. 7 So, again, on the east side the maximum number out 8 at any one time would be 24. On the west side the maximum number out at any one time would be 16. 9 10 MEMBER SANGHVI: So you have about 80 kids 11 together? 12 MR. JOHNSTON: 40. 13 MEMBER SANGHVI: 40. 14 MR. JOHNSTON: Correct. One classroom per 15 playground at a time. 16 MEMBER SANGHVI: Yeah. I noticed that. 17 why I'm asking you what the size of your classroom, because 18 classroom doesn't tell me how many kids will be out there. 19 MR. JOHNSTON: Right. 20 MEMBER SANGHVI: Thank you. 21 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you. Anyone on 22 the Board? 23 MEMBER KRIEGER: Could you tell me what the

Page 47 1 fencing is like? Would it be different for the toddlers 2 versus the infants? MR. JOHNSTON: So the fencing will be standard for 3 both. It is a 6-foot tall steel picketed fence. 4 5 pickets will have a minimum spacing between them 3 5/8 6 inches which is typical for that sort of safety. 7 We prefer -- as a system we prefer to have a 8 see-through fence, a picketed fence so the teachers may be proactive to see if anything is happening outside the fence 9 10 rather than having something that's totally opaque. And, I'm sorry, the fencing would be 6-foot tall 11 for the perimeter and then any fencing that would be 12 13 separating within that would be 4-foot tall. Gates would be self-closing, have panic bar and delayed egress hardware on 14 15 the perimeter and/or just self-closing and lockable on the 16 interior. 17 MEMBER KRIEGER: Thank you. 18 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you. Linda?

19 Anyone on the Board?

20

21

22

23

Yeah, go ahead, please.

MEMBER SANKER: And thanks for going through these one by one. That will clarify a lot. There's a couple things I need a little more clarification on.

Page 48 1 For the first one are you requesting the 2 120-square foot per child, is that the variance that you're 3 requesting? And I think you said that that's what the 4 policy is to have or is that what you're --5 MR. JOHNSTON: State licensing is typically 6 75 square feet per child and that would be per child using 7 the space at any one given time. So if you do the math, 8 it's a tremendous reduction in what we're even providing here. We're attempting to meet somewhere in the middle from 9 10 what the state requirements are as to what the Novi 11 requirements are. We're actually getting a lot closer to 12 what the Novi requirements are. 13 MR. POLLARD: So it's not a direct math. just the area that's available is what we're asking for. 14 15 MEMBER SANKER: And what is that area? 16 MR. POLLARD: 19,033. 17 MEMBER SANKER: Okay. All right. For the Number 18 5 you had -- you're asking about a play/shade structure less 19 than 10 feet from a building? 20 MR. POLLARD: Correct. 21 MEMBER SANKER: How much less are you looking for? 22 MR. POLLARD: Six feet. 23 MEMBER SANKER: Six feet?

Page 49 1 MR. POLLARD: Six feet. So the request is to 2 reduce it down to 6 feet from 10. 3 MEMBER SANKER: Okay. Perfect. Thanks. Okay. The last one is Number 6, the percentage of 4 5 play area. I wasn't following what you were saying there. 6 MR. POLLARD: Okay. 7 MEMBER SANKER: So could you just explain --8 MR. POLLARD: Not a problem. I'll bring up the 9 graphic one more time. 10 So the ordinance allows us to have up to 25. We're asking for a variance for that shaded area and these 11 12 two shaded areas combined and what that becomes is, if my 13 math is correct, 67.87 percent versus 25. 14 MEMBER SANKER: Okay. I'm sorry. Can you just 15 explain one more time for us. 16 MR. POLLARD: Okay. 17 MEMBER SANKER: You're combining the two? 18 MR. POLLARD: We're combining the two for the 19 So we're allowed 25 percent. So we're taking, if you sum this and this versus the total of these it's 63.87. 20 21 MEMBER SANKER: Okay. Thank you. 22 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you, Kevin. 23 Anyone on the Board?

1 Okay.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

Okay. Linda.

MR. JOHNSTON: Could I add something to that.

Part of the reason why we're asking for the variance for the 67 and change percent is partially to get as close as we can to the 150 square feet per child, so it's kind of a balancing act there if it helps clarify.

CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you. Okay.

Linda, do you want to make the motion. Thank you.

MEMBER KRIEGER: In the Case Number PZ19-0036 The Goddard School at 39659 Thirteen Mile Road for parcel 50-22-12-200-050, I move that we grant the request for the petitioner, shown a practical difficulty for their site. The topography, the need for the bordering, bordering neighbors, the M-5 so move to accept the 19,033 square feet of outdoor recreation area to be to the -- near to the state requirement of 150 but also being in the 120 Novi

in.

The 25 between the building and property allowed

exterior side yard proposed recreation area as well for the

same reasons, for the state requirements for kids to play

requirement. The area occupying 63.87 percent of the

The 25 between the building and property allowed by code Section 5.4.3 for the absence of a loading zone,

this is for the request for a play area, not for loading materials.

Section 5.2 for the deficiency of parking spaces they proposed an extra one space. Accepting that.

Proposed dumpster in the -- located in the front side yard. Dumpsters are required to be located in the rear yard.

The location has many -- has two frontages or potentially three for the M-5. Section 4.19 for the location of play/shade structures in the exterior and interior side yards so that they're close -- less than 10 feet from the main building closer for little toddlers to get in and out of. By code accessory structures it's a play area so it's different located in the rear yard and must be -- okay.

Section .11 for location of a fence in the exterior side yard. By code no fence shall extend. This is for the safety of toddlers and infants in playing, and as explained and gone through the Planning Department -- the Planning Commission and what they explained for the fencing for the kind of fencing that they will be using for the protection of children.

The proposed plan has Section 25.5(a) for a second

ground sign, the ground sign location being at the intersection at Thirteen Mile and Cabot Drive.

And without the variance petitioner will be unreasonably prevented or limited with respect to the use of the property because it's for children. The property is unique because of its topography, water retention basin and power ITC corridor. The petitioner did not create the condition because of its as stated location and use for children.

The relief granted will not unreasonably interfere with adjacent or surrounding properties because it will not be a -- it will be an increased value for the -- potentially for the work areas for parents dropping off their children and having a place closer by where their children are at. The relief is consistent with the spirit and intent of the ordinance because it is the minimum and reasonable request.

MEMBER SANGHVI: Second.

CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you.

Second. Can we hear a motion.

MR. POLLARD: Mr. Chairman, there was a request for a wall sign. I don't think you brought that up in your --

MEMBER KRIEGER: Wasn't that part -- you have one

Page 53 1 by right and then you were asking for --2 MS. OPPERMAN: You were only requesting one to my 3 knowledge which you're already permitted by right. 4 MR. POLLARD: The wall sign. 5 MS. OPPERMAN: Yes. 6 MR. POLLARD: Okay. Thank you. Fabulous. 7 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. The motion is 8 seconded. Do we have a motion? Any other discussions. Hearing none, all in favor? 9 10 MEMBER KRIEGER: Call the roll. 11 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Kathryn, please call for 12 the roll. 13 MS. OPPERMAN: Member Byrwa? MEMBER BYRWA: 14 Yes. 15 MS. OPPERMAN: Chairperson Peddiboyina? CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Yes, please. 16 17 MS. OPPERMAN: Member Krieger? 18 MEMBER KRIEGER: Yes. 19 MS. OPPERMAN: Member Longo? MEMBER LONGO: Yes. 20 21 MS. OPPERMAN: Member Sanghvi? 22 MEMBER SANGHVI: Yes. 23 MS. OPPERMAN: Member Sanker.

Page 54 1 MEMBER SANKER: Yes. 2 MS. OPPERMAN: Member Montague. MEMBER MONTAGUE: Yes. 3 MEMBER KRIEGER: Congratulations. 4 5 MR. POLLARD: Thank you. CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you. 6 And Case Number 3, PZ19-0037. It's Signarama --7 8 S-I-G-N-A-R-A-M-A -- Troy, 41000 Bridge Street, east of 9 Meadowbrook Road and north of Eleven Mile Road, Parcel 10 Number 50-22-13-352-003. 11 The applicant is requesting a variance from the 12 City of Novi Code of Ordinance Section 28-6 for a proposed 13 oversized 48 square foot temporary real estate sign. 14 is 5 feet over height and use beyond the 64-day limit 15 allowed by code. This property is zoned light industrial 16 (1-1).17 Okay. Please state your name for our court 18 recorder. 19 MS. DAMICO: Hello. My name is Marissa Damico. 20 I'm here for C. Barry and I work for Signarama. 21 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Are you an attorney? 22 MS. DAMICO: I'm sorry? 23 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Are you an attorney?

Page 55 1 MR. SANKER: Are you an attorney? 2 MS. DAMICO: No. 3 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Please raise your hand for my secretary. 4 5 MEMBER KRIEGER: Do you swear or affirm to tell the truth in this case? 6 7 MS. DAMICO: I do. 8 MS. OPPERMAN: Could you please spell your name for our record. 9 10 MS. DAMICO: Yeah. It's Marissa, M-A-R-I-S-S-A, Damico, D-A-M-I-C-O. 11 12 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you. Please go 13 ahead. 14 MS. DAMICO: Our client C. Barry is looking to 15 have a larger than approved real estate sign installed. 16 location is 41000 Bridge Street in Novi. The location is 17 off of the freeway 275, so a 4 foot x 4 foot sign is 18 difficult to read as you're driving by, so they're looking 19 to have a larger sign to achieve maximum visibility for 20 potential buyers. 21 The sign is being placed in an open area so there 22 is not any other signage or building that is on a vacant lot 23 that is available for sale or lease. So the site is here,

Page 56 1 so there's not any existing signage anywhere near the sign, 2 so they're just looking to have that maximum visibility. CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. You want to say 3 any other things? Do you want to say anything? 4 5 MS. DAMICO: No. 6 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Anyone in the 7 audience, please. 8 Okay. Seeing none. 9 From the City. Mr. Butler? 10 MR. BUTLER: No comments. CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: No comments. Thank you. 11 12 Corresponding Secretary. 13 MEMBER KRIEGER: Thank you. Case Number PZ19-0037 Signarama - Troy for 41000 14 15 Bridge Street. 15 letters were sent, zero returned, zero 16 approvals, zero objections. That's it. 17 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you. 18 Okay. And anyone on the Board can speak. 19 MR. SANKER: I just have a question. 20 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Go ahead. 21 MEMBER SANKER: How long do you need the variance 22 for? 23 MS. DAMICO: So they would be looking to keep the

Page 57 1 sign up for the length of when the property is for sale. If 2 there was a standard that you guys wanted us to follow we could definitely let the client know. 3 MEMBER SANKER: Okay. Do we have a standard? 4 5 Two years or one? 6 MEMBER KRIEGER: We can do one. CHAIRMAN PEDDIBOYINA: Yeah, we could do that. 7 8 MEMBER SANGHVI: We could do one year or whatever comes first. 9 10 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Anyone on the Board, 11 please? 12 Okay. Seeing none. Okay. Make a motion. 13 MEMBER SANKER: Sure. I move that we grant the variance in Case Number 14 15 PZ19-0037 signed by petitioner for an increased sign size 16 and a term for beyond the 64-day limit because petitioner 17 showed a practical difficulty requiring the variance. 18 Without the variance the petitioner will be unreasonably 19 prevented or limited with respect to use of the property 20 because the sign will not be visible to the public from 21 public roads. The property is unique because it is 22 difficult -- the sign would be difficult to be seen from the 23 highway. The petitioner did not create the condition

Page 58 1 because it is using the property for marketing purposes. 2 The relief granted will not unreasonably interfere with 3 adjacent or surrounding properties because the sign does not 4 obstruct views from or to surrounding properties, and the 5 relief is consistent with the spirit and intent of the ordinance because it will create more awareness to the 6 7 property that it is for sale or lease. And I quess the 8 variance is subject to a 1-year term. 9 MEMBER SANGHVI: Or the sale, whatever comes 10 first. MEMBER SANKER: Or the sale or lease of the 11 12 property. 13 MS. DAMICO: Yeah. 14 MEMBER SANGHVI: Thank you. 15 MEMBER KRIEGER: Second. 16 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Thank you. 17 have a motion. Okay. And any -- seeing none, Kathryn, 18 please call for the roll. 19 MS. OPPERMAN: Member Montague. MEMBER MONTAGUE: 20 Yes. 21 MS. OPPERMAN: Member Sanker. 22 MEMBER SANKER: Yes. 23 MS. OPPERMAN: Member Sanghvi.

	Page 59
1	MEMBER SANGHVI: Yes.
2	MS. OPPERMAN: Member Longo.
3	MEMBER LONGO: Yes.
4	MS. OPPERMAN: Member Krieger.
5	MEMBER KRIEGER: Yes.
6	CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Chairperson Peddiboyina.
7	MEMBER BYRWA: Yes, please.
8	MS. OPPERMAN: Member Byrwa.
9	MEMBER BYRWA: Yes.
10	MS. OPPERMAN: Motion passes.
11	MS. DAMICO: Thank you.
12	CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you and
13	congratulations.
14	Okay. Case Number 4, PZ19-0038, ID Associates
15	Incorporation, 44075 Twelve Mile Road west of Novi Road and
16	south of Twelve Mile Road, Parcel Number 50-22-15-200-112.
17	The applicant is requesting variance from the City
18	of Novi Code of Ordinance Section 28-5(a) and 28-5(b) for
19	multiple oversized signs, one sign allowed per code. This
20	property is zoned Regional Center (RC). Okay.
21	Please spell your name.
22	MEMBER SANGHVI: May I be excused for 5 minutes?
23	MEMBER KRIEGER: You want a recess?

i	
	Page 60
1	CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Please go ahead. You
2	want to wait or
3	MEMBER KRIEGER: 5-minute recess. So we'll meet
4	back in what, 8:15?
5	CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: 12.
6	MEMBER KRIEGER: Okay.
7	(A short recess was taken).
8	CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you. Please go
9	ahead. Thank you for your patience.
10	MEMBER KRIEGER: Are you an attorney?
11	MR. POTTS: I am not an attorney.
12	MEMBER KRIEGER: Do you swear or affirm to tell
13	the truth in this case?
14	MR. POTTS: I do.
15	MEMBER KRIEGER: If you could spell your name for
16	our court recorder.
17	MR. POTTS: Certainly.
18	MEMBER KRIEGER: Thank you.
19	MR. POTTS: G-A-R-R-Y, P-O-T-T-S, Garry Potts.
20	My offices are at 58171 Dragon Fly Court in
21	Osceola, Indiana. I'm here tonight representing Spiegel
22	Properties, the property owner, ID Associates, the sign
23	vendor, and Floor & Decor who is the proposed tenant for the

1 property.

We are seeking multiple variances for external signage of which I will go through maybe one by one.

The main ID is the Floor & Decor Tile, Wood and Stone Sign. The sign has a 5-foot letter set for each letter, so the floor is 5 feet tall, the decor is 5 feet tall and the tile, wood, and stone is 2 foot four-and-a-quarter which gives it a total square footage 516.66 square feet right down here.

We also are asking for additional signage here, their floor and decor which is their slogan which is about 48 square feet, so for that facade we're about 564 square feet on that facade.

The sign B is another Floor & Decor sign. The square footage on that is 403 square feet. Again, a 5-foot letter set, same would match the sign on the other elevation, would not have the tile, wood, stone illuminated channel letters on that.

And then the customer pickup sign which is more of an ancillary sign just gives way of finding for the customers to come. It's about 13 square feet.

On the rear elevation we have another Floor & Decor sign, 327 square feet, it's 4 foot 6 inch letter.

Those are internally illuminated channel letters with the logo and that is 327 square feet.

And then, lastly, is the Floor & Decor over the west facade which is a 3-foot letter to stacked letter set so, again, you're actually a little over 6 feet, 6'4" for the total height, and the logo itself is 6-foot 4 by 6-foot 4 square, so it's 145.19 square feet.

As far as the circumstances and conditions we're asking for the signs because of the setback. We're about 950 linear feet from I-96. We have foliage between the property and the interstate and lining the perimeter of the parking area. The visibility for the Floor & Decor wall sign is negatively impacted by both setback and foliage.

The scale of the building, the lot frontage it would be -- the footprint of the building is 85,000 square feet, approximately. Two elevations are in excess of 400 linear feet and two elevations are in excess of 240 linear feet, so the proposed signage is well within the scale of the building.

Item E, it's not self-created. Based on the setback from the main roadway, foliage between the building and the roadway and the overall size of the building the proposed signage is necessary for optimal visibility and way

Page 63 1 finding for the potential customers. The magnitude of the 2 building may enhance proportionate signage requiring 3 proposed to exceed allowance. 4 I'm happy to answer any questions that you have or 5 if you want to open the subject. 6 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Thank you. 7 Anyone in the audience want to speak about this 8 case? 9 Seeing none. From the City. 10 MR. BUTLER: No comments from the City. 11 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you. 12 Okay. Corresponding Secretary. 13 MEMBER KRIEGER: For PZ19-0038, 40 letters were 14 sent, three returns, zero approval, zero objections. That's 15 it. 16 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Anyone on the 17 Board? MS. OPPERMAN: Pardon me, sir. I don't believe 18 19 you spelled your name for our court reporter. 20 MR. POTTS: I did. 21 MS. OPPERMAN: You did? My apologies. 22 MR. POTTS: No problem. 23 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you.

Page 64 1 MR. POTTS: I can do it again if you need to. 2 MS. OPPERMAN: No. That's okay. 3 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Anyone else on the Board, please? 4 5 Okay. 6 MEMBER KRIEGER: The request you had, there were 7 in there about nine -- is it total of nine signs? 8 this going to be the anchor company or business for the site that you have the directional signs and then allow the other 9 10 smaller businesses to put their names on the directional 11 signs? That's what it seems to look like from page 6 for E, 12 F and G. 13 MR. POTTS: Bear with me. MEMBER KRIEGER: Okay. The only other thing is I 14 15 couldn't miss that sign. I drove across the bridge. I had 16 a 3-D effect from Powerhouse, the -- what was the third one? 17 Oh, yeah. When I was on Novi Road the -- what's the 18 furniture store? Gardner White and then that third one just 19 jumps at you from the back. So, I wanted to ask, too, is the Floor & Decor is 20 21 that going to be just the lettering or is it going to have that background, the white background as well? 22

MR. POTTS: Which sign -- I'm sorry, which sign

23

Page 65 1 are you speaking about? The E, F, G, for the -- I guess 2 MEMBER KRIEGER: there's going to be directional -- they're asking for 3 4 directional signs in here. So you have the building -- the 5 building signs which I don't remember if those were from 6 previous grantings or came with when Sears had that for 7 the --8 MR. BUTLER: They should have all been removed. 9 There signs are --10 MEMBER KRIEGER: Right. They're, what do you call 11 them, mock-up signs are up? 12 MR. BUTLER: Yeah, those are mock-up. 13 MEMBER KRIEGER: But the previous one is Sears, so it only goes with the business or can they have --14 15 MR. BUTLER: Goes with the business. MEMBER KRIEGER: The signs, the four facing signs? 16 17 They have east, west, north and south signage. 18 MS. OPPERMAN: Previous variances would stay with 19 the property per Maureen Underhill what they're requesting 20 exceeds previous variances. MEMBER KRIEGER: I mean, it's proportional with 21 22 the building but the mock-up sign with the white on it makes 23 it look bigger.

Page 66 1 MR. POTTS: Oh, the banner? 2 Yes. MEMBER KRIEGER: 3 MR. POTTS: It will not, no. These are just --MEMBER KRIEGER: So Floor & Decor, the lettering 4 5 will be on the building, and the and is the only, I don't 6 know, connects the two words. 7 MR. POTTS: Correct. 8 MEMBER KRIEGER: Okay. 9 MR. POTTS: Yeah, there will not be a backer panel 10 if that's what you're asking, like a white backer panel or 11 anything to offset it. 12 MEMBER KRIEGER: Right. 13 MR. POTTS: No, it will match the existing facade of the building. 14 15 MEMBER KRIEGER: And then when I was reading the 16 package it said direct -- multiple directional signs, and I 17 didn't notice the number requested, but then I counted out 18 nine, so then I saw this for the -- our page 6, I don't know 19 if you have it or not, but after D there is E, F, G and they look like directional signs for ground signs for roads where 20 the customer is driving through. But I also see the need --21 22 MR. POTTS: I do have -- I do have that on the 23 proposal. However, it's not on my copy in the color set.

MEMBER KRIEGER: Okay. So the request for them, they would be the main sign for direction and then add on the other businesses I guess is my main question.

MR. POTTS: Correct, it would have a panel in that multi-tenant sign. Those signs should already be there, is the way I understand it.

MEMBER KRIEGER: I don't remember seeing those directional signs when I was driving through.

MR. POTTS: Yes. So like on page 6 -- and my copy is really bad.

MEMBER KRIEGER: Yeah.

MR. POTTS: Where it says F, there's an existing directional and existing directional.

MEMBER KRIEGER: Yeah.

MR. POTTS: So they're just putting new panels in there. What said Sears now they're going to say Floor & Decor.

MEMBER KRIEGER: I guess it's because I know where I'm going. I just don't know the businesses.

I can see the need. I wasn't too sure about the size except for the, I was thinking maybe the size of the panel with the white on it was distracting me from size for the request and that the need for it is there since there's

Page 68 1 the competition between online shopping and coming to a 2 place and shopping. So I do see the need, and then for signage as far as you can see, it grabs your attention right 3 away when you're out there driving. So at night it will be 4 5 lit up as well? MR. POTTS: It is internally illuminated, correct. 6 7 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you. Anyone else on the Board, please? 8 Okay. Motion time. David. 9 10 MEMBER BYRWA: Yeah. I'd like to make a motion to 11 grant the variance for multiple signage requested by the petitioner on Case Number PZ19-0038. 12 13 The property is unique because of the size and the area where it's located. Petitioner did not create the 14 15 condition. The relief granted by the variance would not 16 unreasonably interfere with adjacent or surrounding 17 properties. The relief is consistent with the spirit and intent of the ordinance because of the size, location and 18 19 the need for multiple signage on the property. 20 MEMBER SANGHVI: Second. 21 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Motion seconded. 22 Any other discussions? 23 Call all in favor.

	Page 69
1	MEMBER KRIEGER: Roll call.
2	CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Roll call by Kathryn.
3	MS. OPPERMAN: Member Krieger.
4	MEMBER KRIEGER: Yes.
5	MS. OPPERMAN: Member Longo.
6	MEMBER LONGO: Yes.
7	MS. OPPERMAN: Member Byrwa.
8	MEMBER BYRWA: Yes.
9	MS. OPPERMAN: Chairperson Peddiboyina.
10	CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Yes, please.
11	MS. OPPERMAN: Member Sanghvi.
12	MEMBER SANGHVI: Yes.
13	MS. OPPERMAN: Member Sanker.
14	MEMBER SANKER: Yes.
15	MS. OPPERMAN: Member Montague.
16	MEMBER MONTAGUE: Yes.
17	Motion passes.
18	CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you.
19	Congratulations.
20	MEMBER KRIEGER: Are you doing the next one?
21	MR. POTTS: I am.
22	CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Case Number PZ19-0039,
23	ID Associates, Inc. and Scrubs & Beyond, 43530 West Oaks

Page 70 Drive B104, west of Novi Road and South of Twelve Mile Road, 1 2 Parcel Number 50-22-15-200-059. The applicant is requesting a variance from the City of Novi Code of Ordinance 3 Section 28-5 (b)(1)a for a variance of 16.7 square feet for 4 5 a proposed 66.70 square foot wall sign, 50 square feet 6 allowed by code. This property is zoned Regional Center 7 (RC.) 8 Okay. Please go ahead and state your name. 9 think he already did unless he wants to do it again. 10 MEMBER KRIEGER: Do we have to do it again, repeat 11 his name and --12 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Go ahead and repeat your 13 name and spell your name for the court recorder and you are 14 not an attorney. 15 MS. SAARELA: You probably should say it for the 16 I don't think he needs to be sworn in again. 17 MEMBER KRIEGER: Okay. 18 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Go ahead and spell your 19 name. 20 MR. POTTS: Garry Potts, G-A-R-R-Y, P-O-T-T-S. 21 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Please go ahead 22 and proceed. 23 MR. POTTS: I'm here today represent owner Ramco

Page 71

West Oaks II, LLC, ID Associates who is the sign vender, and Scrubs & Beyond. Scrubs & Beyond is seeking a sign for the property at 45530 West Oaks Drive in Novi. The sign is — the letters are 2 feet in height, however with the backer panel behind it it does exceed what is allowed for the property by 16.7 square feet. We are allowed 50 square feet and if you include the blue backer we are over slightly. I hope you can see that. Sorry. Learning technology as we speak.

The extraordinary circumstances or conditions, this is abutting property, Scrubs & Beyond requests exception to the wall sign allowance due to the client space in the back corner of a large L-shaped center, the building in front on out-parcels and fully adjoining the perimeter of the center. And this was not self-created. Due to the tenant space being approximately 1200 feet from Novi Road and being tucked into the corner of an L-shaped center. It's also further hindered by out-parcel buildings and foliage lining the perimeter of the center.

That is all that I have at this time.

CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Thank you.

Anyone in the audience speak up with this case?

Seeing none.

Page 72 1 Okay. From the City. 2 MR. BUTLER: No comment. 3 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Corresponding 4 Secretary. 5 MEMBER KRIEGER: For Case Number PZ19-0039 for 6 Scrubs & Beyond, 40 letters were sent, zero returned, zero 7 approval, zero objections. That's it. Thank you. 8 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: 9 I go over to the property and I see that was 10 created and I have no objections on that. 11 And now to the Board, anyone can speak on that. 12 MEMBER KRIEGER: My question, the background, the 13 blue part is going to stay? 14 MR. POTTS: Yes, it will stay in this particular 15 instance. They did try that sign without a backer and it 16 just -- it didn't work. Nobody was happy including the 17 customers for some reason, they said they couldn't decipher 18 it. 19 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Thank you. 20 Linda. 2.1 Anyone on the Board, please? Okay. It is the motion time. Linda. 22 23 MEMBER KRIEGER: All righty. Ready for Case

Number PZ-0038, for ID Associates, Inc. for Scrub -- wrong number, PZ19-0039, ID Associates, Inc. Scrubs & Beyond.

43530 West Oak Drives, B104, west -- Parcel Number 50-22-15-200-059.

Applicant is requesting variance from the City of Novi Code Ordinance Section 28.B(1)a for a variance of 16.7 square feet for a proposed 66.70 square feet wall sign, square 50 allowed. Property is Regional Center.

I move that we grant the request sought by the petitioner. He's shown a practical difficulty requiring need for the increase in size for visibility from a distance. It's difficult, it's not in plain site. It's in an L-shape. The petitioner will unreasonably be prevented or limited with respect to use of the property. There is landscaping, but luckily for Michigan foliage and shopping time being at the end of the year the leaves will drop and the signs will just, poof, will appear out of nowhere.

And the property is unique because it is an L-shaped and the store will be in the corner section, so more difficult to be viewed. The petitioner did not create the condition because of the design of the building already. The relief granted will not unreasonably interfere with adjacent or surrounding properties because it will also

	Page 74
1	increase show that there is less vacancies and increase
2	draw for shoppers. The relief is consistent with the spirit
3	and intent of the ordinance because it's a minimum request.
4	MEMBER SANGHVI: Second.
5	CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you.
6	Okay. Motion we have a motion and seconded
7	and, please, roll call for the
8	MS. OPPERMAN: Member Byrwa.
9	MEMBER BYRWA: Yes.
10	MS. OPPERMAN: Chairperson Peddiboyina.
11	CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Yes, please.
12	MS. OPPERMAN: Member Krieger.
13	MEMBER KRIEGER: Yes.
14	MS. OPPERMAN: Member Longo.
15	MEMBER LONGO: Yes.
16	MS. OPPERMAN: Member Sanghvi.
17	MEMBER SANGHVI: Yes.
18	MS. OPPERMAN: Member Sanker.
19	MEMBER SANKER: Yes.
20	MS. OPPERMAN: And Member Montague.
21	MEMBER MONTAGUE: Yes.
22	MS. OPPERMAN: Motion passes.
23	MEMBER KRIEGER: Congratulations. Have a safe

Page 75 1 trip back home. 2 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank and good luck and 3 congratulations. 4 And for today, the last case, PZ19-0040, Phillips 5 Sign and Lighting. Beaumont Urgent Care, 43535 Grand River Avenue west of Novi Road and south of Grand River Avenue, 6 7 Parcel Number 50-22-22-227-029. The applicant is requesting a variance from the 8 City of Novi Code of Ordinance Section 28-5(a) for a 9 10 proposed second wall sign. One sign allowed by code. 11 property is zoned Town Center-1 (TC-1). 12 MEMBER KRIEGER: I'm sorry, I have a question for 13 our lawyer. I work for Ascension which would be a 14 competitor of Beaumont so should I recuse myself? 15 MS. SAARELA: No, you don't have any financial 16 interest. 17 MEMBER KRIEGER: Okay, good. 18 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Thank you. 19 Please spell your name first and last name for the 20 court recorder. 21 MR. BRETZ: My name in Steven Bretz, S-T-E-V-E-N, 22 last name Bretz, B-R-E-T-Z. 23 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Are you an attorney?

Page 76 1 MR. BRETZ: No, I am not. 2 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Please swear him in, 3 Madam Secretary. 4 MEMBER KRIEGER: Do you swear or affirm to tell 5 the truth in this case? 6 MR. BRETZ: I do. 7 MEMBER KRIEGER: Thank you. CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Go ahead, proceed. 8 MR. BRETZ: Okay. Again, my name is Steven Bretz 9 10 from Philips Sign & Lighting and with me tonight is Scott 11 Hughes from the Beaumont Urgent Care. 12 We are here tonight to request your approval for 13 the installation of a second wall sign on the east elevation 14 of the wall of the new Beaumont Urgent Care located at 43535 15 Grand River. We thank you for your approval of the wall sign on the north elevation of the building. Our request is 16 for an identical sign in copy and in size, 40 square feet, 17 the same size as the north elevation. 18 19 Our concern is for the safety of the citizens when a time in a stressful situation looking for a Beaumont 20 Urgent Care may have difficulty locating the building due to 21 22 the trees and the landscaping out front of the building.

This sign would be especially helpful for those approaching

23

Page 77 1 from the Grand River and Novi intersection. 2 Beaumont Urgent Care is proud and excited to be a 3 member of the Novi community and they look forward to serving its citizens. I want to thank you tonight for your 4 5 time and consideration of this proposal. 6 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Thank you. You 7 want to speak? 8 MR. HUGHES: Yeah. 9 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Please tell your name 10 for the court recorder. MR. HUGHES: Scott Hughes, S-C-O-T-T, H-U-G-H-E-S. 11 12 MEMBER KRIEGER: Are you an attorney? 13 MR. HUGHES: I am not. 14 MEMBER KRIEGER: Do you swear or affirm to tell 15 the truth in this case? 16 MR. HUGHES: I do. 17 MEMBER KRIEGER: Thank you. 18 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Please proceed. 19 MR. HUGHES: Yes. I am the marketing manager for 20 Beaumont Urgent Care. And we really would appreciate 21 approval of this sign. We've been having -- a lot of people 22 is having a visibility issue, even though the sign is -- on 23 the other elevation is a nice size sign, there's a lot of

Page 78 1 foliage with the trees -- a lot of foliage with the trees 2 and it's hard to see the sign. And, also, if you're coming from the Novi -- from Novi Road its very hard to see the 3 4 sign based on the position of the building. The angle of 5 the building is as such until you're right up upon it you 6 really can't see the Beaumont Urgent Care sign. And we've 7 actually been struggling with patient volume at this 8 particular facility, so I think a lot of that has to do with visibility and lack of visibility, and we just really feel 9 10 that an additional sign on the other side of the building would really improve visibility and improve patient access 11 so they can see the sign more readily when they're in a 12 13 position where they need urgent care. 14 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Thank you. 15 Anyone in the audience? Okay. 16 Thank you. 17 From the City? 18

MR. BUTLER: No comments.

21

22

23

19 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Corresponding 20 Secretary.

MEMBER KRIEGER: For PZ19-0040, Phillips Sign & Lighting and Beaumont Urgent Care. 39 letters were sent, one returned, zero approvals, zero objections.

Page 79 1 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you. 2 Recently me and my friend came for your Beaumont Urgent Care and I agree there is a need for the sign and an 3 4 additional sign. I put it to my Board and let's discuss and 5 place on the Board. Thank you. 6 Go ahead, Mr. Sanghvi. 7 MEMBER SANGHVI: Thank you, Mr. Chair. 8 I came and looked at your place. I know your 9 parking on the side you need a sign to tell where the patients 10 have to go. So I have no problem and I'm in full support of 11 your application. Thank you. CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you, Mr. Sanghvi. 12 13 Anyone on the Board, please. MEMBER SANKER: I have a question. Are any of 14 15 those on the property that you own, those trees, I should 16 say? 17 MR. HUGHES: Yes, there are some on the property. 18 We actually had them trimmed back, a lot of those trees. 19 MEMBER SANKER: Are they all on your property in 20 this picture? 21 MR. HUGHES: What's that? 22 MEMBER SANKER: Are they all on your property? 23 MR. HUGHES: Yes, yes. I believe the majority of

Page 80 1 them are -- I don't think any of those are City property 2 trees, I do believe those are mostly on the property. don't own the building, we're a tenant of the building, but 3 we did ask to have the trees trimmed back. And they trimmed 4 5 them a little. It didn't really help. You could see a 6 little bit more from underneath but on top there they didn't 7 have the reach apparently to trim the top portion of those 8 trees and that's really where the visibility issue comes in. MEMBER SANKER: They grow, too. It's tough. 9 10 MR. HUGHES: Exactly, yeah. MEMBER SANKER: 11 It would be good to have it on the east side of the --12 13 Oh, yeah, definitely. MR. HUGHES: MEMBER SANKER: That's my only question. 14 15 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you. Anyone on the Board, please. 16 17 Mr. Sanghvi, go ahead. 18 MEMBER SANGHVI: I move that we grant 19 the variance in case of PZ19-0040 sought by Beaumont Urgent 20 Care for a second sign on their business. 21 Without the variance the petitioner will 22 be unreasonably prevented from or limited with respect to 23 the use of this property because the parking lot is located

Page 81 1 where they need the sign. The second sign is needed. 2 And this property is unique because the way it is located and more or less nestled between Grand 3 4 River and Novi Road and it's not very easily visible from 5 either of the two main roads. And petitioner did not create the 6 7 condition. Because of the configuration of this building as 8 such there is no other way of doing it. The relief granted will not unreasonably interfere with any adjacent or 9 10 surrounding property and the relief is consistent with the spirit and intent of the ordinance. 11 12 And this sign is needed for business 13 identification. Thank you. 14 MEMBER KRIEGER: Second. 15 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you. Okay. Please call for the role. 16 17 MS. OPPERMAN: Member Montague. MEMBER MONTAGUE: 18 Yes. 19 MS. OPPERMAN: Member Sanker. MEMBER SANKER: Yes. 20 21 MS. OPPERMAN: Member Sanghvi. 22 MEMBER SANGHVI: Yes. 23 MS. OPPERMAN: Member Longo.

	Page 82
1	MEMBER LONGO: Yes.
2	MS. OPPERMAN: Member Krieger.
3	MEMBER KRIEGER: Yes.
4	MS. OPPERMAN: Chairperson Peddiboyina.
5	CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Yes, please. Thank you.
6	MS. OPPERMAN: And Member Byrwa.
7	MEMBER BYRWA: Yes.
8	MS. OPPERMAN: Motion passes.
9	CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you.
10	Congratulations.
11	MR. HUGHES: Thank you. I appreciate it.
12	CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Any other business apart
13	from this?
14	Okay.
15	MEMBER KRIEGER: Move to adjourn.
16	CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Move to adjourn.
17	All in favor.
18	(All indicated aye)
19	(The meeting concluded at 8:38 p.m.)
20	
21	
22	
23	

	Page 83
1	CERTIFICATE OF REPORTER
2	
3	STATE OF MICHIGAN )
4	) SS
5	COUNTY OF OAKLAND )
6	
7	I, Cynthia Ann Chyla, hereby certify that I
8	reported stenographically the foregoing proceedings and
9	testimony under oath at the time and place hereinbefore set
10	forth; that thereafter the same was reduced to computer
11	transcription under my supervision; and that this is a full,
12	true, complete and correct transcription of said
13	proceedings.
14	` 15
16	13
17	ss/ Cynthia Ann Chyla, CSR 0092
18	Notary Public
19	Oakland County, Michigan
20	My Commission expires: May 12, 2023
21	
22	
23	