REGULAR MEETING - ZONING BOARD OF APPEALS

CITY OF NOVI

October 14, 2014

Proceedings taken in the matter of the ZONING BOARD OF APPEALS, at City of Novi, 45175 West Ten Mile Road, Novi, Michigan, on Tuesday, October 14, 2014

BOARD MEMBERS
Brent Ferrell, Chairperson
Mav Sanghvi
David Ghannam
Cynthia Gronachan
Rickie Ibe
James Gerblick
Thomas Schultz
ALSO PRESENT: Thomas Walsh, Building Official
Beth Saarela, City Attorney
Coordinator: Angela Pawlowski, Recording Secretary

REPORTED BY: Jennifer L. Wall, Certified Shorthand Reporter
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case No.</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PZ14-0042</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PZ14-0043</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PZ14-0044</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Calling to order the Tuesday, October 14, 2014 regular scheduled ZBA meeting.

Please rise for the Pledge of Allegiance.

(Pledge recited.)

CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Ms. Pawlowski, can you call the roll, please.

MS. PAWLOWSKI: Member Gerblick is absent.

Member Ghannam?

MR. GHANNAM: Here.

MS. PAWLOWSKI: Member Gronachan?

MS. GRONACHAN: Here.

MS. PAWLOWSKI: Member Ibe?

MR. IBE: Present.

MS. PAWLOWSKI: Member Krieger is absent, excused.

Member Sanghvi?

MR. SANGHVI: Here.

MS. PAWLOWSKI: Chairperson
Ferrell?

CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Here.

This is a public hearing and the Rules of Conduct and the agenda is in the back, anybody wishes to get a copy of that. Also ask if anybody has cellphones or pagers, please silence them now.

Let everybody know, that we have some members that are missing from the board, if anybody wishes to table this to a further date, so we have a full board, you may do so. When I call you up, if you just want to let us know. You do need four out of five votes for it to pass.

Onto the approval of the minutes. Any additions or errors on that, need to be changed?

(No audible responses.)

CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Anything from the city?

MR. WALSH: No.

CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: All in favor of the approval of the August 12, 2014 minutes say aye.
THE BOARD: Aye.

CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Any opposed?

(No audible responses.)

CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Seeing none, onto September 9, 2014 minutes. Any additions or deletions?

Anything from the city?

(No audible responses.)

MR. SANGHVI: Motion to approve.

MR. GHANNAM: Second.

CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Motion and a second, all in favor?

THE BOARD: Aye.

CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Any opposed?

(No audible responses.)

CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Seeing none, approval of that.

Public remarks? If anybody have has anything they wish to address the board, that's not related to a case tonight, may come up now.

(No audible responses.)

CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Seeing
none. Okay. If anybody wants to come and have their case tabled to the next available date, may come up now and do so.

MS. PAPPAS: Mr. Chairman, Constantine Pappas representing Brightmoor Christian Church.

We would kindly request that we table the second item on the agenda to November.

One of the things based on the planner's report, I think there was a little bit of mixup between the application, and the actual submittal relative to the time that is needed in order to publicly let the public know about it.

So we kindly ask that the board of appeals give us that opportunity to get everything corrected, get it in and try to be on the agenda for November.

MR. GHANNAM: I'll go ahead and move to table item No. 2, Case PZ14-0041 to the November meeting.

MS. GRONACHAN: Second.

CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Have a motion and a second, all in favor say aye.
THE BOARD: Aye.

MS. PAPPAS: We do have one question whether there was any correspondence that came in relative to this issue?

MR. GHANNAM: I can look for you real quick.

No. You had 41 mailed items, five returned mail, zero approvals, zero objections.

MS. PAPPAS: Thank you so much.

CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Seeing none. Case No. PZ14-0041 has been tabled to November.

MS. PAPPAS: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Anybody else wish to table their case until next month?

(No audible responses.)

CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Seeing none, move onto Case No. PZ 14-0037, 25885 Strathaven.

Per the staff, they wish to withdraw the case?

MR. WALSH: That is correct.

CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Hear a
motion to have that case withdrawn. Do we have to do a motion for that?

MR. SCHULTZ: Yes, probably should.

MR. GHANNAM: Motion to deny it or just --

MR. SCHULTZ: Just to approve --

MR. GHANNAM: I'll move to approve the withdrawal.

MS. GRONACHAN: Second.

CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Motion and a second, all in favor say aye.

THE BOARD: Aye.

CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Any opposed?

(No audible responses.)

CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Seeing none, case will be withdrawn.

Onto Case No. PZ14-0042, 41800 West Nine Mile Road. Please come up to the podium, if you are not an attorney, raise your right hand, be sworn in by the secretary.

Please state and spell your name for the court reporter.
MR. GHANNAM: State your name.

MR. HUTCHINSON: David Hutchinson.

MR. GHANNAM: Do you swear or affirm to tell the truth in this case?

MR. HUTCHINSON: Yes, sir.

CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Spell your name for the reporter, please.

MR. HUTCHINSON: D-a-v-i-d, H-u-t-c-h-i-n-s-o-n.

CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Go ahead.

MR. HUTCHINSON: I'm new to this, so I may not get the format right, but I took a lot of coaching from Tom and Charles, so hopefully I get his right.

We recently acquired a piece of property, a home from Mrs. Carol Butsky (ph), over on Nine Mile. It's a 10-acre parcel, a little over 10 acres.

Today the house is a very traditional 30 year-old, 35 year-old saltbox English style home where it's 30 by 40. It does not have an attached garage to it.

So our plan to -- I think we submitted all the plans to Tom and Charles,
and kind of show what we want to do.

We really want to add a four-car garage. We are going to expand it and move some walls out, add a couple thousand square feet to the home.

I have three children, so I need a little bit more living space.

What we are trying to do is take that house and be able to put a attached four car garage to it.

The problem we have is because of the zoning, there is a barn on the property that's 40 by 30, so the barn square footage is approximately 1,200 square feet. We are allowed 1,500 square feet according to the zoning rules.

There is also a -- what's referred to as a cow barn. It's really an open faced shed. It doesn't even have doors or -- it has three walls we plan to turn into a cabana. So it will be part of a patio with a whirlpool. Our built-in pool will be in the backyard, so that will eventually kind of go away. It won't go away, it will just become more of an open area for seating and
patio and ceiling fans and all of that kind
of stuff.

So I don't know what specific
question you want.

So the architect, I can show a
picture of kind of like what the house is
going to look like from the rendering that we
are working on so far.

But it is a little over 10 acres.
We don't have any infringements on any
properties.

We are -- the closest property is
the neighbor south of us, which is over
200 feet away. The garage will be moving in
the other direction, so we are asking for
permission to -- our architect asked us to
put in 1,500 square feet. We believe the
garage will actually be smaller.

But not knowing exactly because
we are going through the architect drawings
now, before we submit to the city for the
overall renovation project, so this is the
first step in the process of making the old
home a little bit more of a retro fit to our
needs and our family's needs.
CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Thank you.

MR. HUTCHINSON: There is one number on here I did catch. It says that it's over -- the variance would be greater than 2,564, if that's taking into consideration accessory footage around that cow shed, I don't know if that's really accessory footage, that may be calculated as such, that will eventually become no more than an awning or an overage for stuff underneath it that sits behind the built-in pool.

So maybe it's considering that. So the barn will stay, the four car garage will hopefully get added. Then the cow barn will be converted into a seating area. Just for clarification.

CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Is that it?

MR. HUTCHINSON: Yes, sir. Any questions?

CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Hold on one second.

Anybody in the audience have any questions or comments about this case?

(No audible responses.)
CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Seeing none, Mr. Secretary anything correspondence-wise?

MR. GHANNAM: We have 31 mailed notices, zero returned mail, two approvals, and zero objections.

The first approval comes from Carol Butsky, 48100 Nine Mile Road, Novi, Michigan, it just simply says approval and it's circled.

Second approval comes from John and Diane Kroll, 48050 Nine Mile, again it just simply circles the word approval.

That's it.

CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Thank you. Anything from the city?

MR. WALSH: Just one comment, if the existing shed that's opened on all three sides is going to remain with just a rough structure, then the square footage would still be included in the overall accessory building.

CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Okay. Open it up to the board for discussion.

MR. SANGHVI: Sir, hi, good
evening. What do you use the barn for?

MR. HUTCHINSON: It's the coolest thing on the whole property. I have got some tractors in there. I have got all my tools and got a couple --

MR. SANGHVI: You have a tool shed, separate tool shed?

MR. HUTCHINSON: It's kind of attached to the barn. It's a very small, like 12 feet by 8 feet. All it is where you hang all your shovels and all that kind of stuff.

So it's just there. I don't know if I will keep that. It's kind of neat to have, but -- it's not --

MR. SANGHVI: You know what the ordinance is -- you have an enormous property there.

MR. HUTCHINSON: Yes, sir.

MR. SANGHVI: Nine acres, is it?

MR. HUTCHINSON: Huh?

MR. SANGHVI: How big is the property?

MR. HUTCHINSON: It's a little over 10 acres. It butts right between
Beckingham, Chelkingham and --

MR. SANGHVI: Ten acre property
and ordinance for one acre property. I don't
know how related -- what it is when you talk
about that kind of size of the property.
I have no problem granting your
request.

MR. HUTCHINSON: Thank you, sir.

CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Anybody
else?

MS. GRONACHAN: Good evening. I
know you mentioned this. I understand that
you're in the early stages, but I would like
to get clarification on what is the largest
part of the garage. What's the biggest
square footage that you would go on the
garage?

MR. HUTCHINSON: The 1,500 is
maximum. We think it's less. We basically
took the measurement of the garage we have
now and it's about 1,427 square feet.
It's all we need, so not
knowing -- we didn't want to go, it would be
1,437 square feet and we are out of variance.
So we are asking for what we think is a
little more, but it will come in less than
that I'm almost certain.

MS. GRONACHAN: Thanks for the
clarification. That's all I have.

CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Hear a
motion?

MS. GRONACHAN: I will give it a
shot.

In Case No. PZ14-0042, 48101 West
Nine Mile, I move that we approve the
applicant's request for the variance to allow
construction of a 1,500 square foot attached
garage to the proposed house, based on the
comments made by the petitioner and the
questions asked by the board members, that
the square footage would not exceed 1,500
square feet.

This decision is based on the
size of the lot and the conformity of the lot
and that there is no direct impact to the
neighbors or adjacent properties.

MR. SANGHVI: Second.

CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Okay.

MS. GRONACHAN: Do you need
anything else?
MR. SCHULTZ: That's good.

CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Any further discussion.

(No audible responses.)

CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Motion and a second. Ms. Pawlowski, can you call the roll, please.

MS. PAWLOWSKI: Member Ghannam?

MR. GHANNAM: Yes.

MS. PAWLOWSKI: Member Gronachan?

MS. GRONACHAN: Yes.

MS. PAWLOWSKI: Member Ibe?

MR. IBE: Yes.

MS. PAWLOWSKI: Member Sanghvi?

MR. SANGHVI: Yes.

MS. PAWLOWSKI: Chairperson Ferrell?

CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Yes.

MS. PAWLOWSKI: Motion passes five to zero.

MR. HUTCHINSON: Thank you very much. We will invite you guys for our first Fourth of July party.

CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Case No. PZ14-0043, 26425 Novi Road, Novi Crescent II.
Raise your right hand and be sworn in by the secretary and state and spell your name for the reporter, please.

MR. RYAN SCHULTZ: Ryan Schultz, R-y-a-n, S-c-h-u-l-t-z.

MR. GHANNAM: Sir, in this case do you swear or affirm to tell the truth?

MR. RYAN SCHULTZ: I do.

MR. GHANNAM: Plead proceed.

MR. RYAN SCHULTZ: My name is Ryan Schultz, vice president Feldman Versa Companies, current owners of Novi Crescent Phase I, building located at the corner of Novi Road, Crescent Place Boulevard.

We are here tonight before you to seek a few variances from what we call Novi Crescent Phase II, located on the Melting Pot property as it currently sits.

We are here asking for a couple variances, staff supported we have worked for the last two and a half months developing the site plan, coming up with the building square footage and we are here before you tonight seeking a 14-foot sideyard setback.

This is a variance along the
entrance ramp from 96 onto Novi Road.

We are also asking for a variance for the loading zone based on the lineal footage of the building frontage. We are required to provide 1,770 square feet of loading zone. We currently provide 1,751 square feet on this current plan.

There is one more variance that we are also requesting tonight. That is a variance from the sideyard setback for the south boundary.

That's currently provided a 3-foot buffer and this configuration. We do need to see a 20 foot buffer in that scenario, some of the unique circumstances that exist on this property, similar to when we developed our phase one of this project.

We are fronted on both sides by major thoroughfares. It causes some kind of unique situations, given the sideyard, front yard and rear yard setbacks that apply to us.

We are trying stay consistent with the TC center district pushing the building right on top of the right-of-way.

Given these kind of unique
parameters and development, we are here
before you seeking these variances.

CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Thank you.

Anybody in the audience have any questions or
comments pertaining to this case?

(No audible responses.)

CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Seeing
none, Mr. Secretary, any correspondence?

MR. GHANNAM: Yes, we have 13
mailed notices, one return mail, zero
approvals and zero objections.

CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Okay.

Anything from the city?

MR. WALSH: No comments at this
time.

CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Open it up
to the board for discussion.

MR. GHANNAM: Sir, I have no
problem with the requests. In fact, any of
them I know -- we had a lot of material
actually on this. It appears that
everything -- you're planning very, very
carefully. Obviously you need several
variances to accomplish your goals and they
all seem, based on the entire package,
reasonable under the circumstances, so I have no problem.

MR. RYAN SCHULTZ: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Anybody else?

MR. SANGHVI: I have no problem. Thank you.

MS. GRONACHAN: I just think you did an excellent job on all the work that you did. It should be recognized.

I appreciate a new business coming into Novi and doing the minimum, and I believe that you did that in this situation, and I congratulate you on all your work.

MR. RYAN SCHULTZ: We appreciate that.

We view this as certainly a keystone property for us, keystone property for the City of Novi. We are happy to extend that TC center district even further and extend that design, that design thought out through the end.

Thank you. I appreciate it.

CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Hear a motion?
MR. IBE: Sure. Mr. Chair, in Case No. PZ14-0043, Novi Crescent Phase II, I move that we grant the applicant's request as requested by the applicant for the following reasons.

One, that there are unique circumstances or physical conditions of the property, such as narrowness, the shape, the topography, some physical conditions that currently exist which makes the need for a variance very necessary not only for the applicant to meet its goal.

Second, the need is not self-created. Obviously, the geographical location of this property itself and all the other difficulties that surround it, makes it such that the only way for the applicant to develop this property as fit, will be to seek and be granted a variance.

Third, strict compliance regarding governing area setbacks, frontage, height, bulk, density other than the natural requirements, will unreasonably prevent the applicant from using the property for a permitted purpose.
And fourth, the requested variance is the minimum variance that is necessary to do substantial justice to the applicant as well as the other property owners in the district.

And finally, the requested variance will not cause an adverse impact on surrounding properties. In fact, I think the development of this particular parcel will significantly improve the property values in the area, and will enhance the area.

Based on the aforementioned reasons as well as the reasons stated by the applicant, I move that we grant the variance as requested.

MS. GRONACHAN: Second.

CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: I have a motion and a second.

Any further discussion?

(No audible responses.)

CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Seeing none, Ms. Pawlowski, can you call the roll, please.

MS. PAWLOWSKI: Member Ghannam?

MS. GRONACHAN: Yes.
MS. PAWLOWSKI: Member Gronachan?
MS. GRONACHAN: Yes.
MS. PAWLOWSKI: Member Ibe?
MR. IBE: Yes.
MS. PAWLOWSKI: Member Sanghvi?
MR. SANGHVI: Yes.
MR. WALSH: Chairperson Ferrell?
CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Yes.
MS. PAWLOWSKI: Motion passes five to zero.
MR. RYAN SCHULTZ: Thank you very much everyone.
CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Onto Case No. PZ14-0044, 41795 Twelve Mile, Triology Health Services.
Please state and spell your name for the reporter and then raise your hand and be sworn in by the secretary.
MR. PETRU: Greg Petru, G-r-e-g, P-e-t-r-u.
MR. GHANNAM: Raise your right hand, sir.
Do you solemnly swear or affirm to tell the truth in this case?
MR. PETRU: I do.
MR. GHANNAM: Thank you.

MR. PETRU: Good evening. My name is Greg Petru. I'm here with Kebbs, Incorporated. We are the civil engineer for the Triology project.

We are here tonight to ask for a variance for section 2507.3 and 2303.8.1.

It's to allow us to have a loading area on the side of our courtyard. The ordinance states it should be in the rear yard.

We have been going through with the city since in February, March. We have went through woodland, wetland, and preliminary site plan approval already with the city.

And one of the unique things about this property, there is a lot of regulated wetland, there is a big regulated woodland. And, you know, it got the site laid out to the point where it's -- you know, really can't move anything else around yet.

We have storm water detention, we have wetland mitigation that we had to provide. We are trying to save as many trees
as we can. So I mean, I think that's one of
the more unique things about the site. It's
just really hard to work with.

There is also 30 feet of fall on
the site. So we have kind graded it, to a
point where we have to move it around, kind
of changed the whole scope of the site, as
far as storm water detention and mitigation
areas.

The other one is in regards to
the building itself. With Triology we have
an entrance on both ends of the building.
And this makes it real difficult to put the
courtyard in the back how we have it laid
out.

If the building were to twist
sideways, it could have been weird, but with
the size of the property, we weren't able to
put it sideways in this case.

So those are two of the things
that, you know, we like to keep it there.
You know, looking at the screened courtyard
too, if you look at the side, it's 400 feet
back from the road, wouldn't be visible from
Twelve Mile, wouldn't be visible from the
east or the south because of the courtyard. Then we also are willing to put up, you know, whatever type of screen we have to on the west side.

There is already an existing pine tree row on the property line. And the neighboring property, they also have their loading area kind of adjacent to where ours is in relation to that, so they're about in the same spot.

So, you know, I ask you guys to consider our variance.

If you have any questions for me, feel free.

CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Thank you. Anybody in the audience have any questions or comments pertaining to this case?

(No audible responses.)

CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Seeing none -- or Mr. Secretary, correspondence?

MR. GHANNAM: We have 14 mailed notices, zero returned, zero approvals and zero objections.

CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Anything from the city?
MR. WALSH: No comments.

CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Thank you.

Open it up to the board for discussion.

MS. GRONACHAN: Good evening. I would just like clarification because in our packet it indicated that the loading area must be relocated to the year or receive a variance.

So when you touched on it a little bit, I just want to clarify for the record.

If you put it to the rear of the property, you would have to reconfigure the entire site, is that what you're indicating?

MR. PETRU: Yes. I mean, where the parking lot is at the south end, from the south end of that parking, we have a slope then it's all mitigation area, the storm water detention.

So, I mean, to do something in the rear of the lot, I mean, I'm not even sure we could make some of the stuff work at the bottom.

MS. GRONACHAN: So basically because of the topography of the property,
that's why it really can't go into the rear?

MR. PETRU: Correct.

MS. GRONACHAN: That's my only question. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Thank you.

MR. SANGHVI: Same thing. I appreciate that you are trying to save the wetlands. I thank you for doing that and I don't mind approving this -- granting your application because you are trying to save the wetlands. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Anybody else? Hear a motion.

MS. GRONACHAN: Again? I have two attorneys sitting here though.

In Case No. PZ14-0044, 41795 Twelve Mile, Triology Health Services, I move that we approve the request that the applicant -- the request for variances that the applicant presented in front of us to allow a 600 square foot of loading area in one of the interior courtyards located west of the building.

There are unique circumstances as presented by the petitioner. There are
physical conditions of the property, such as
narrowness, shallowness, shape, topography
and similar physical conditions and then the
need of the variance is not due to the
applicant's personal or economic difficulty.
As clarified in testimony, the petitioner
indicated that this is actually saving
wetlands and woodlands and the water
retention basin.

The need is not self-created
based on previous statements. Strict
compliance and regulations governing area
setback, frontage, height, bulk, density or
other dimensional requirements would be
unreasonable and prevent the property owner
from using the property for the permitted
use.

The requested variance is the
minimum variance necessary to substitute --
to do substantial justice to the applicant as
well as to the other property owners. Again,
as mentioned by the petitioner, the
neighboring business also has the same
location for their site.

The requested variance will also
not cause an adverse impact on surrounding
property, property values or the use and
enjoyment of the property in the neighborhood
or zoning district because this area is zoned
appropriately for a business district.

MR. SANGHVI: Second.

CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: A motion
and a second, any further discussion?
(No audible responses.)

CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Seeing
none, Ms. Pawlowski, can you call the roll,
please.

MS. PAWLOWSKI: Member Ghannam?

MR. GHANNAM: Yes.

MS. PAWLOWSKI: Member Gronachan?

MS. GRONACHAN: Yes.

MS. PAWLOWSKI: Member Ibe?

MR. IBE: Yes.

MS. PAWLOWSKI: Member Sanghvi?

MR. SANGHVI: Yes.

MS. PAWLOWSKI: Chairperson Ferrell?

CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Yes.

MS. PAWLOWSKI: Motion passes
five to zero.
MR. PETRU: Thank you very much.
I appreciate it.
CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Other matters? Anything else from the city?
MR. WALSH: Agenda for next year.
CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: We need to approve the agenda, is that how it works?
MR. SCHULTZ: If you agree with them all, if you don't think you need to move for anything.
CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Do I hear a motion?
MR. GHANNAM: I will move to approve the 2015 proposed Zoning Board of Appeal meeting dates as contained in our packets.
MS. GRONACHAN: Second.
CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Motion and a second, all in favor say aye.
THE BOARD: Aye.
CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Any opposed?
(No audible responses.)
CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Seeing none, we have a calendar for next year.
Do I hear a motion for adjournment?

MR. GHANNAM: I move to adjourn.

MS. GRONACHAN: Second.

CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Motion and a second motion, all in favor say aye.

THE BOARD: Aye.

CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Any opposed?

(No audible responses.)

CHAIRPERSON FERRELL: Seeing none, we are adjourned.

(The meeting was adjourned at 7:35 p.m.)

**  **  **
STATE OF MICHIGAN  )
  ) ss.
COUNTY OF OAKLAND  )

I, Jennifer L. Wall, Notary Public within and for the County of Oakland, State of Michigan, do hereby certify that the witness whose attached deposition was taken before me in the above entitled matter was by me duly sworn at the aforementioned time and place; that the testimony given by said witness was stenographically recorded in the presence of said witness and afterward transcribed by computer under my personal supervision, and that the said deposition is a full, true and correct transcript of the testimony given by the witness.

I further certify that I am not connected by blood or marriage with any of the parties or their attorneys, and that I am not an employee of either of them, nor financially interested in the action.

IN WITNESS THEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand at the City of Walled Lake, County of Oakland, State of Michigan.

________________    _________________________
Date              Jennifer L. Wall CSR-4183

Oakland County, Michigan
My Commission Expires 11/12/15

Luzod Reporting Service, Inc.
313-962-1176
applicant's 16:11
22:3 30:5
applicant 6:12
29:10
apply 19:21
appreciate 21:11
21:15,23 29:7
32:2
appropriately 31:5
approval 4:16,24
5:19 13:7,9,11,13
25:15
approvals 7:8 13:5
20:11 27:22
approve 5:10 8:7,9
16:10 29:18 32:7
32:14
approving 29:9
approximately
10:14
architect 11:5,16
11:20
area 10:25 12:16
22:21 23:11,11
25:9 27:8 28:6,18
29:21 30:12 31:4
areas 26:9
asked 11:16 16:15
asking 11:15 15:25
18:19 19:2
attached 9:23 10:9
14:9 16:12 34:6
attorney 1:17 8:21
attorneys 29:15
34:14
audible 4:19 5:4,9
5:17,24 7:18 8:16
12:25 17:4 20:6
23:20 27:18 31:9
32:23 33:10
audience 12:23
20:4 27:16
August 4:24
available 6:2
awning 12:10
dye 4:25 5:1,14
6:25 7:1 8:12,13
32:19,20 33:6,7
cabana 10:21
calculated 12:8
calendar 32:25
call 3:12 4:13 17:6
18:16 23:22 31:11
Calling 3:5
car 10:10 12:14
carefully 20:23
Carol 9:17 13:8
case 2:2 5:22 6:2,21
7:12,16,20,23 8:1
8:18,19 9:5 12:24
16:9 17:24 18:6
20:5 22:24 24:13
24:24 26:19 27:17
29:16
catch 12:3
cause 23:7 31:1
causes 19:19
celling 11:1
cellphones 4:7
center 19:23 21:20
certain 16:2
certainly 21:17
Certified 1:20
certify 34:5,13
Chair 22:1
Chairman 6:4
Chairperson 1:9
3:5,11,25 4:2,20
4:23 5:2,5,12,15
5:18,25 6:24 7:11
7:15,19,25 8:11
8:14,17 9:7,11
12:1,18,21 13:1
13:15,23 15:9
16:5,23 17:2,5,16
17:18,24 20:3,7
20:12,16 21:4,24
23:17,21 24:7,8
24:13 27:15,19,24
28:2 29:5,12 31:7
31:10,21,23 32:3
32:6,11,18,21,24
33:5,8,11
changed 4:18 26:7
Charles 9:14,25
Chelkinson 15:1
children 10:6
Christian 6:6
Church 6:6
circled 13:10
circles 13:13
circumstances
19:15 21:1 22:7
29:24
city 1:2,6,17 4:21
5:8 11:21 13:16
25:16 27:25 32:4
34:18
civil 25:4
clarification 12:17
15:14 16:4 28:5
clarified 30:6
clarify 28:10
closest 11:12
coaching 9:14
come 5:23 6:1,3
8:20 16:1
comes 13:7,11
coming 18:22 21:12
comment 13:17
comments 12:24
16:14 20:5,14
27:17 28:1
Commission 34:22
Companies 18:12
compliance 22:20
30:12
computer 34:10
conditions 22:7,9
30:1,3
Conduct 4:4
configuration 19:13
conformity 16:19
congratulate 21:14
connected 34:13
consider 27:12
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>year-old 9:21,21</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Z</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZBA 3:7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>zero 7:8,8 13:5,6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17:20 20:10,11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24:10 27:22,22,23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31:25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>zone 19:3,6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>zoned 31:4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>zoning 1:1,5 10:12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:16 31:4 32:14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1,200 10:14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1,427 15:21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1,437 15:24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1,500 10:15 11:17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15:18 16:12,16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1,751 19:6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1,770 19:5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 9:19 11:9 14:25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10-acre 9:18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11/12/15 34:22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 4:24 14:10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13 20:9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14 1:3,7 3:2,6 27:21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14-0037 7:20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14-foot 18:24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26:21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2,564 12:5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20 19:14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>200 11:14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014 1:3,7 3:2,6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4:24 5:6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015 32:14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22 2:4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2303.8 1 25:7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2507.3 25:7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25885 7:20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26425 17:25</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| 3              |
| 3-foot 19:13   |
| 30 9:21,22 10:13|
| 26:4           |
| 31 13:4        |
| 32 2:5         |
| 35 9:21        |

| 4              |
| 40 9:22 10:13  |
| 400 26:23      |
| 41 7:7         |
| 41795 24:14 29:16|
| 41800 8:19     |
| 45175 1:6      |
| 48050 13:12    |
| 48100 13:8     |
| 48101 16:9     |

| 5              |

| 6              |
| 600 29:21      |

| 7              |
| 7:00 3:3       |
| 7:35 33:13     |

| 8              |
| 8:2:3 14:10    |

| 9              |
| 9:5:6          |
| 96 19:1        |