



CITY of NOVI CITY COUNCIL

Agenda Item 4
April 4, 2011

SUBJECT: Approval to award a construction contract for the 2010 Neighborhood Road Program (Concrete) project to Hard Rock Concrete, Inc., the low bidder, in the amount of \$426,900.

SUBMITTING DEPARTMENT: Department of Public Services, Engineering Division *B7c*

CITY MANAGER APPROVAL: *[Signature]* *R74*

EXPENDITURE REQUIRED	\$426,900
AMOUNT BUDGETED	\$828,300
LINE ITEM NUMBER	203-203.00-865.431 (Local Street Fund)

BACKGROUND INFORMATION:

[The 2010 Neighborhood Road Program was approved for FY10/11 but construction was deferred until spring 2011 to ensure the availability of adequate funding in the Local Street Fund. For consistency, the project title has remained the same.]

For several years, the City Council has made it a goal to invest annually in neighborhood streets to maintain the City's local road network. To implement this goal, the City selects several residential streets to be addressed based on an evaluation of the pavement condition using PASER ratings, field observations by staff, and resident concerns. The 2010 Neighborhood Road Program will implement the City's Asset Management approach for pavements that was established in 2009. The asset management program stresses the importance of using preventative maintenance to preserve good quality roads using low-cost rehabilitation techniques, rather than allowing the roads to deteriorate to a point that requires reconstruction involving much more effort at a higher cost. Roads that have deteriorated significantly will be addressed with rehabilitation methods such as overlays, panel replacements, and joint repairs to allow more efficient application of available road funds to maximize the number of neighborhood streets included in each year in the program.

This year's program will consist of two separate contracts: one for concrete pavement and the other for asphalt. This contract addresses the rehabilitation of concrete streets listed below:

Road Segment	From	To	PASER	Treatment
Sutherland	Portsmouth	Amherst	3	Discrete panel replacement and joint repair
Sheffield	Worcester	Daleview	3	Discrete panel replacement and joint repair
Glen Haven East/Cir	Eight Mile	Broquet	3-4	Discrete panel replacement and joint repair
Cumberland	Center St (N)	Center St (S)	5	Discrete panel replacement and joint repair
White Pines	Taft	Foxmoor	4	Discrete panel replacement and joint repair

The treatment technique proposed for these streets will result in an appearance similar to that depicted in the attached photographs.

Thirteen (13) bids were received and opened on March 22, 2011 following a public bid solicitation period. The lowest bidder is Hard Rock Concrete. Hard Rock's bid is recommended as being in the best interest of the City as it is responsive (i.e., Hard Rock has complied with all requirements of the bidding instructions) and it is the lowest price. (SDA's award recommendation letter including the bid tabulation dated March 25, 2011 is attached.) A summary of the thirteen bids is as follows:

Contractor	Base Bid (Discrete Panel Replacement)	Alternate No. 1 (Partial-Depth Joint Repair)	Alternate No. 2 (Full-Depth Joint Repair)	Total Bid Price Base Bid + Alternate No. 2
Hard Rock Concrete	\$314,245.00 ✓	\$263,173.52	\$128,030.00 ✓	\$442,275.00
C & L Enterprizes	\$315,937.10	\$258,450.26	\$148,219.00	\$464,156.10
Lacaria Concrete	\$339,533.30	\$272,846.00	\$200,046.00	\$539,579.30
G.V. Cement	\$385,226.00	\$275,950.00	\$154,792.00	\$540,018.00
Fiore Enterprises	\$385,836.40	\$261,048.16	\$154,843.80	\$540,680.20
Hartwell Cement	\$409,924.40	\$407,645.00	\$169,500.00	\$579,424.40
Major Cement Paving	\$391,095.50	\$494,425.00	\$220,050.60	\$611,146.10
Audia Concrete	\$401,732.69	\$327,049.35	\$291,284.00	\$693,016.69
Florence Cement	\$406,056.80	\$200,472.76	\$205,838.00	\$611,894.80
Carlo Construction	\$425,818.90	\$288,101.58	\$187,449.28	\$613,268.18
Zuniga Cement	\$441,362.70	\$299,916.00	\$439,910.00	\$881,272.70
Goretski Construction	\$478,725.20	\$263,671.76	\$141,568.00	\$620,293.20
Dominic Gaglio Const. Inc.	\$521,439.20	\$103,342.50	\$236,487.00	\$757,926.20

The project bid included a base bid for full-panel repairs, and alternate bids for joint repairs. Alternate No. 1 includes partial-depth milling and patching with a quick-setting concrete. Alternate No. 2 includes full-depth joint repairs with standard concrete. Staff recommends award of the base bid plus Alternate No. 2. The full-depth joint repair is a longer lasting method of repair, and was the less expensive option for this contract.

The project was included in the FY2010-11 capital improvement program in the budgeted amount of \$828,300, of which \$426,900 is now being recommended for award to Hard Rock for construction. The remaining budget will fund a second phase of the neighborhood road program for asphalt streets to be bid mid summer and completed late summer or fall. Construction engineering services for the current concrete streets project is being recommended for award to SDA as a separate item on this agenda.

Construction is scheduled to begin in May 2011 and completion is anticipated by Fall 2011.

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Approval to award a construction contract for the 2010 Neighborhood Road Program (Concrete) project to Hard Rock Concrete, Inc., the low bidder, in the amount of \$426,900.

	1	2	Y	N
Mayor Landry				
Mayor Pro Tem Gatt				
Council Member Fischer				
Council Member Margolis				

	1	2	Y	N
Council Member Mutch				
Council Member Staudt				
Council Member Wrobel				

EXAMPLES OF CONCRETE REHABILITATION PROJECTS





SPALDING DEDECKER ASSOCIATES, INC.

905 South Boulevard East • Rochester Hills • Michigan 48307 • Tel 248 844 5400 • Fax 248 844 5404

March 25, 2011

Mr. Benjamin Croy, PE, Civil Engineer
City of Novi
26300 Delwal Drive
Novi, Michigan 48375

Re: **Recommendation for Award**
2011 Neighborhood Road Program - Concrete
SDA Project No.: NV10-001

Dear Mr. Croy:

On March 22, 2011 at 3:00 p.m. construction bids were opened and publicly read at the City of Novi Civic Center for the 2011 Neighborhood Road Program - Concrete project.

The City Clerk's office received thirteen (13) sealed bids for this project. The project bid included a base bid for full-panel concrete repairs, and alternate bids for joint repairs. Alternate No. 1 was for partial-depth milling and patching with latex modified concrete, which is a quicker operation with a short cure time. Alternate No. 2 was for full-depth joint repairs with standard concrete.

Hard Rock Concrete had the lowest base bid, C&L Enterprizes had the lowest base plus Alternate No. 1 bid, and Hard Rock had the lowest base plus Alternate No. 2 bid. Following the bid opening, Spalding DeDecker Associates (SDA) reviewed all of the bids received and prepared the attached bid tabulation for the project, correcting for errors in the as-read figures as noted.

It is our recommendation that the project be awarded to the low bidder, Hard Rock Concrete Inc. for the Neighborhood Road Program – Concrete project for the Base Bid and Alternate No. 2 in the amount of \$426,900.00, which is the total bid of \$442,275 minus \$15,375 for crew days bid. //*

Upon award by the City Council, our office will coordinate the completion of the Contract Agreement, Bonds and Insurance information with Hard Rock, and issue the Notice to Proceed upon execution of the contract documents.

Very Truly Yours,
SPALDING DEDECKER ASSOCIATES, INC.

David P. Eno, P.E. – Project Manager

enclosure: Bid Tabulation
cc: Mr. Rocco Grimaldi, Vice President – Hard Rock Concrete Inc.

Engineering Consultants

Infrastructure • Land Development • Surveying

2011 - Neighborhood Road Program - Concrete
 Bid Tabulation of Low 6 bidders - 13 bids received, opened 3/22/2011

BASE BID					Engineer's Estimate		Hardrock Concrete		C&L Enterprizes		Lacaria Concrete		G.V. Cement		Fiore Enterprises		Hartwell Cement	
Item No.	Ref Spec	Item Description	Qty	Unit	Unit Price (\$)	Total Price (\$)	Unit Price (\$)	Total Price (\$)	Unit Price (\$)	Total Price (\$)	Unit Price (\$)	Total Price (\$)	Unit Price (\$)	Total Price (\$)	Unit Price (\$)	Total Price (\$)	Unit Price (\$)	Total Price (\$)
1.	M150	Mobilization (5% max.)	1	LS	14,800.00	14,800.00	1,000.00	1,000.00	10,000.00	10,000.00	9,000.00	9,000.00	1,000.00	1,000.00	18,300.00	18,300.00	3,000.00	3,000.00
2.	30.09	Pre-Construction Video Review	1	LS	3,200.00	3,200.00	2,500.00	2,500.00	2,500.00	2,500.00	1,750.00	1,750.00	2,500.00	2,500.00	1,665.50	1,665.50	2,200.00	2,200.00
3.	30.10	Soil Erosion & Sedimentation Control	1	LS	7,900.00	7,900.00	100.00	100.00	3,000.00	3,000.00	1,000.00	1,000.00	1,000.00	1,000.00	2,500.00	2,500.00	800.00	800.00
4.	30.11	Tree Protection	12	EA	250.00	3,000.00	50.00	600.00	50.00	600.00	65.00	780.00	200.00	2,400.00	25.00	300.00	50.00	600.00
5.	30.12	Maintaining Traffic	1	LS	4,300.00	4,300.00	1,500.00	1,500.00	4,000.00	4,000.00	4,500.00	4,500.00	1,000.00	1,000.00	4,000.00	4,000.00	3,000.00	3,000.00
6.	02.06.03	Regrade Ditch	200	FT	2.50	500.00	30.00	6,000.00	5.00	1,000.00	30.00	6,000.00	20.00	4,000.00	5.00	1,000.00	15.00	3,000.00
7.	30.14	Pavt, Rem	2179	SYD	5.50	11,984.50	6.00	13,074.00	6.00	13,074.00	8.50	18,521.50	5.00	10,895.00	5.50	11,984.50	6.05	13,182.95
8.	M204	Sidewalk, Rem	333	SYD	5.00	1,665.00	6.00	1,998.00	3.60	1,198.80	4.50	1,498.50	5.00	1,665.00	4.50	1,498.50	6.05	2,014.65
9.	M205	Excavation, Earth	325	CYD	4.00	1,300.00	18.00	5,850.00	10.00	3,250.00	8.00	2,600.00	8.00	2,600.00	11.00	3,575.00	6.50	2,112.50
10.	30.15	Subgrade Undercut	100	CYD	15.00	1,500.00	18.00	1,800.00	10.00	1,000.00	25.00	2,500.00	8.00	800.00	19.00	1,900.00	5.00	500.00
11.	M302	Aggregate Base, 21AA, 8 inch	1723	SYD	8.00	13,784.00	5.00	8,615.00	8.00	13,784.00	6.00	10,338.00	5.00	8,615.00	7.75	13,353.25	5.10	8,787.30
12.	30.22	Geotextile Separator	1723	SYD	1.50	2,584.50	1.50	2,584.50	2.50	4,307.50	1.50	2,584.50	6.00	10,338.00	2.00	3,446.00	2.40	4,135.20
13.	30.16	Underdrain, 6 inch, w/Geotextile Wrap	900	FT	6.00	5,400.00	9.00	8,100.00	8.00	7,200.00	9.50	8,550.00	11.00	9,900.00	9.50	8,550.00	9.50	8,550.00
14.	M403	Dr Structure Cover, Adj, Case 1	42	EA	350.00	14,700.00	375.00	15,750.00	200.00	8,400.00	165.00	6,930.00	190.00	7,980.00	250.00	10,500.00	350.00	14,700.00
15.	30.27	Gate Well Cover, Adj, Case 1	1	EA	435.00	435.00	400.00	400.00	300.00	300.00	180.00	180.00	190.00	190.00	450.00	450.00	350.00	350.00
16.	M403	Dr Structure Cover	2000	LB	1.00	2,000.00	1.25	2,500.00	1.00	2,000.00	1.00	2,000.00	1.65	3,300.00	1.00	2,000.00	1.05	2,100.00
17.	M403	Dr Structure, Tap, 6 inch	5	EA	110.00	550.00	75.00	375.00	50.00	250.00	125.00	625.00	130.00	650.00	100.00	500.00	25.00	125.00
18.	30.20	Reconstruct Drainage Structure	37	FT	150.00	5,550.00	175.00	6,475.00	100.00	3,700.00	175.00	6,475.00	190.00	7,030.00	100.00	3,700.00	125.00	4,625.00
19.	30.21	Point-Up Drainage Structure	1	EA	200.00	200.00	75.00	75.00	100.00	100.00	200.00	200.00	150.00	150.00	250.00	250.00	350.00	350.00
20.	M602	Conc Pavt with Integral Curb, Nonreinf, 7 inch	1723	SYD	27.00	46,521.00	27.00	46,521.00	27.00	46,521.00	26.50	45,659.50	35.00	60,305.00	27.50	47,382.50	29.90	51,517.70
21.	30.23	Pavt Repr, Rem, Modified	3569	SYD	10.00	35,690.00	6.00	21,414.00	8.00	21,414.00	9.00	32,121.00	5.00	17,845.00	8.50	30,336.50	12.50	44,612.50
22.	30.24	Pavt Repr, Nonreinf Conc, 8 inch, Modified	327	SYD	34.00	11,118.00	30.00	9,810.00	29.00	9,483.00	27.50	8,992.50	36.00	11,772.00	38.50	12,589.50	95.00	31,065.00
23.	30.24	Pavt Repr, Nonreinf Conc, 9 inch, Modified	3242	SYD	34.00	110,228.00	32.00	103,744.00	32.50	105,365.00	31.00	100,502.00	38.00	123,196.00	41.00	132,922.00	43.00	139,406.00
24.	M602	Cement	4	TON	200.00	800.00	160.00	640.00	100.00	400.00	165.00	660.00	50.00	200.00	170.00	680.00	175.00	700.00
25.	30.26	Resawing and Sealing Pavement Joints and Cracks, Modified	10310	FT	2.00	20,620.00	0.90	9,279.00	0.80	8,248.00	0.85	8,763.50	1.00	10,310.00	0.80	8,248.00	1.10	11,341.00
26.	M801	Driveway, Nonreinf Conc, 6 inch	456	SYD	24.00	10,944.00	30.00	13,680.00	23.40	10,670.40	21.40	9,758.40	34.00	15,504.00	30.00	13,680.00	29.00	13,224.00
27.	30.17	Sidewalk, Conc, 4 inch	1638	SFT	3.50	5,733.00	2.75	4,504.50	2.30	3,767.40	2.30	3,767.40	2.50	4,095.00	3.00	4,914.00	3.50	5,733.00
28.	30.18	Sidewalk Ramp	1265	SFT	4.00	5,060.00	3.00	3,795.00	3.00	3,795.00	3.00	3,795.00	5.00	6,325.00	3.25	4,111.25	4.50	5,692.50
29.	30.19	Detectable Warning Surface	272	SFT	25.00	6,800.00	15.00	4,080.00	15.00	4,080.00	18.00	4,896.00	18.00	4,896.00	16.00	4,352.00	14.00	3,808.00
30.	02.07.02	Seeding and Mulching	3203	SYD	4.00	12,812.00	2.00	6,406.00	3.00	9,609.00	3.50	11,210.50	5.00	16,015.00	4.30	13,772.90	0.70	2,242.10
31.	30.27	Inspection Crew Days @ \$615/day	*	Days	35	21,525.00	15	9,225.00	18	11,070.00	35	21,525.00	60	36,900.00	35	21,525.00	40	24,600.00
32.	30.05	WCDCPS Permit	1850	DLR	1.00	1,850.00	1.00	1,850.00	1.00	1,850.00	1.00	1,850.00	1.00	1,850.00	1.00	1,850.00	1.00	1,850.00
TOTAL BASE BID PRICE:					\$	385,054.00	\$	314,245.00	\$	315,937.10	\$	339,533.30	\$	385,226.00	\$	385,836.40	\$	409,924.40

ALTERNATE NO. 1 - partial-depth concrete joint repairs

Item No.	Ref Spec	Item Description	Qty	Unit	Engineer's Estimate		Hardrock Concrete		C&L Enterprizes		Lacaria Concrete		G.V. Cement		Fiore Enterprizes		Hartwell Cement	
					Unit Price (\$)	Total Price (\$)	Unit Price (\$)	Total Price (\$)	Unit Price (\$)	Total Price (\$)	Unit Price (\$)	Total Price (\$)	Unit Price (\$)	Total Price (\$)	Unit Price (\$)	Total Price (\$)	Unit Price (\$)	Total Price (\$)
1.	M150	Mobilization (5% max.)	1	LS	9,500.00	9,500.00	1,000.00	1,000.00	-	-	8,000.00	8,000.00	1,000.00	1,000.00	7,500.00	7,500.00	7,000.00	7,000.00
2.	30.09	Maintaining Traffic	1	LS	2,500.00	2,500.00	1,500.00	1,500.00	2,000.00	2,000.00	4,000.00	4,000.00	1,000.00	1,000.00	100.00	100.00	3,000.00	3,000.00
3.	30.25	Joint Spall Repair, Modified	8443	FT	16.00	135,088.00	30.00	253,290.00	29.50	249,068.50	30.00	253,290.00	25.00	211,075.00	29.80	251,601.40	15.00	126,645.00
4.	30.25	Concrete for Spall Repair, Modified	176	CYD	160.00	28,160.00	0.02	3.52	0.01	1.76	1.00	176.00	200.00	35,200.00	0.01	1.76	1,400.00	246,400.00
5.	30.27	Inspection Crew Days @ \$615/day	*	Days	12	7,380.00	12	7,380.00	12	7,380.00	12	7,380.00	45	27,675.00	3	1,845.00	40	24,600.00
TOTAL ALT NO. 1 PRICE:					\$	182,628.00	\$	263,173.52	\$	258,450.26	\$	272,846.00	\$	275,950.00	\$	261,048.16	\$	407,645.00

ALTERNATE NO. 2 - full-depth concrete joint repairs

Item No.	Ref Spec	Item Description	Qty	Unit	Engineer's Estimate		Hardrock Concrete		C&L Enterprizes		Lacaria Concrete		G.V. Cement		Fiore Enterprizes		Hartwell Cement	
					Unit Price (\$)	Total Price (\$)	Unit Price (\$)	Total Price (\$)	Unit Price (\$)	Total Price (\$)	Unit Price (\$)	Total Price (\$)	Unit Price (\$)	Total Price (\$)	Unit Price (\$)	Total Price (\$)	Unit Price (\$)	Total Price (\$)
1.	M150	Mobilization (5% max.)	1	LS	5,000.00	5,000.00	1,000.00	1,000.00	7,000.00	7,000.00	5,500.00	5,500.00	1,000.00	1,000.00	7,000.00	7,000.00	7,000.00	7,000.00
2.	30.09	Maintaining Traffic	1	LS	2,500.00	2,500.00	1,500.00	1,500.00	2,000.00	2,000.00	4,000.00	4,000.00	1,000.00	1,000.00	500.00	500.00	3,000.00	3,000.00
3.	30.29	Pavt Repr, Rem. Joint, 30 inch width	7944	FT	5.00	39,720.00	4.00	31,776.00	7.00	55,608.00	12.50	99,300.00	5.00	39,720.00	5.50	43,692.00	6.50	51,636.00
4.	30.30	Pavt Repr, Nonreinf Conc, Longit Joint, 9 inch	1182	SYD	48.00	56,736.00	40.00	47,280.00	35.00	41,370.00	38.00	44,916.00	39.00	46,098.00	45.90	54,253.80	45.00	53,190.00
5.	30.30	Pavt Repr, Nonreinf Conc, Transv Joint, 8 inch	338	SYD	46.00	15,548.00	38.00	12,844.00	32.00	10,816.00	38.00	12,844.00	37.00	12,506.00	42.75	14,449.50	43.00	14,534.00
6.	30.30	Pavt Repr, Nonreinf Conc, Transv Joint, 9 inch	687	SYD	48.00	32,976.00	40.00	27,480.00	35.00	24,045.00	38.00	26,108.00	39.00	26,793.00	45.50	31,258.50	45.00	30,915.00
7.	30.27	Inspection Crew Days @ \$615/day	*	Days	15	9,225.00	10	6,150.00	12	7,380.00	12	7,380.00	45	27,675.00	6	3,690.00	15	9,225.00
TOTAL ALT NO. 2 PRICE:					\$	154,205.00	\$	128,030.00	\$	148,219.00	\$	200,046.00	\$	154,792.00	\$	154,843.80	\$	169,500.00

SUMMARY

	Engineer's Estimate	Hardrock Concrete	C&L Enterprizes	Lacaria Concrete	G.V. Cement	Fiore Enterprizes	Hartwell Cement
Base Bid:	\$ 385,054.00	\$ 314,245.00	\$ 315,937.10	\$ 339,533.30	\$ 385,226.00	\$ 385,836.40	\$ 409,924.40
Base + Alt 1:	\$ 567,682.00	\$ 577,418.52	\$ 574,387.36	\$ 612,379.30	\$ 661,176.00	\$ 646,884.56	\$ 817,569.40
Base + Alt 2:	\$ 539,259.00	\$ 442,275.00	\$ 464,156.10	\$ 539,579.30	\$ 540,018.00	\$ 540,680.20	\$ 579,424.40

* NOTE: Number of Inspection Crew Days bid by contractor entered in Unit Price column for bid tabulation purposes

C&L Enterprizes - as-read base bid was \$315,087.10 (-1,850.00 from actual) no line item errors; as-read Alt. 1 was \$258,449.76 (+0.50 from actual) error in item #3

Lacaria - as-read base bid was \$296,948.80 (-42,584.50 from actual) no line item errors

Fiore - as-read base bid was \$385,815.75 (-20.65 from actual) error in lines 11, 25

Other bids received

Firm	Base Bid	Base + Alt 1	Base + Alt 2
Major Cement	391,095.50	885,520.50	611,146.10
Audia	401,732.69	728,782.04	693,016.69
Florence	406,056.80	606,529.56	611,894.80
Carlo	425,818.90	713,920.48	613,268.18
Zuniga	441,362.70	741,278.70	881,272.70
Goretski	478,725.20	742,396.96	620,293.20
Gaglio	521,439.20	824,781.70	757,926.20

MAP INTERPRETATION NOTICE

Map information depicted is not intended to replace or substitute for any official or primary source. This map was intended to meet National Map Accuracy Standards and use the most recent, accurate sources available to the people of the City of Novi. Boundary measurements and area calculations are approximate and should not be construed as survey measurements performed by a licensed Michigan Surveyor as defined in Michigan Public Act 132 of 1970 as amended. Please contact the City GIS Manager to confirm source and accuracy information related to this map.

City Of Novi



0 237.5475 950 1,425 1,900
Feet

2011 Neighborhood Road Program

