



cityofnovi.org

CITY of NOVI CITY COUNCIL

Agenda Item H
February 25, 2008

SUBJECT: Approval to award contract for Architectural/Engineering Services to CDPA Architects for the Critical Needs Project at the Novi Police Department for a not to exceed amount of \$46,224.

SUBMITTING DEPARTMENT: Police

CITY MANAGER APPROVAL:

EXPENDITURE REQUIRED	\$46,224
AMOUNT BUDGETED	\$519,050 (Federal Forfeiture Funds)
APPROPRIATION REQUIRED	N/A
LINE ITEM NUMBER	266-266.00-976.000 (Federal Forfeiture Funds)

BACKGROUND INFORMATION:

As part of the Novi Police Department Critical Needs Project, the City of Novi entered into an agreement with Plante & Moran CRESA, Real Estate Consultants, to assist and advise the Novi Police Department (NPD) in its selection of an Architectural/Engineering (AE) firm.

A Request for Proposals (RFP) for the architectural services was developed and posted on Bidnet. All bids were due on February 6, 2008. Four (4) proposals were submitted and carefully reviewed by Plante & Moran CRESA and the Police Department's Administration using a Qualification Based Selection (QBS) Criteria to insure that all specifications were met. Of the four (4) proposals submitted, only three (3) met the RFP requirements. The bid opening of the three qualifying proposals yielded the following results:

		<u>Weighted Scale</u>
1. CDPA Architects	\$46,224	3.20
2. Rama Rao & Alfred, Inc.	\$41,000	2.90
3. Sarnacki & Associates Architects	\$38,000	2.60

The Police Department in conjunction with Plant & Moran CRESA conducted interviews with the three (3) Firms on February 14, 2008. While the quote from CDPA Architects was the highest, the results of the QBS criteria, clearly established them as the more qualified firm. CDPA Architects scored the highest on the QBS scoring sheet with a weighted score of 3.2 out of 5.0 possible points. CDPA has completed over 30 police facility projects including the original NPD headquarters and Training Center expansion. The proposed Architect has been with the firm for over eleven (11) years and has personally completed the last nine (9) police facility renovations for the firm. In addition to the project Architect, CDPA has included a field representative who will be on-site throughout the construction process in their proposal. CDPA Architects has established a solid reputation for the successful completion of several City of Novi projects.

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Approval to award contract for Architectural/Engineering Services to CDPA Architects for the Critical Needs Project at the Novi Police Department for a not to exceed amount of \$46,224.

	1	2	Y	N
Mayor Landry				
Mayor Pro Tem Capello				
Council Member Crawford				
Council Member Gatt				

	1	2	Y	N
Council Member Margolis				
Council Member Mutch				
Council Member Staudt				

February 15, 2008

Deputy Chief Thomas Lindberg
Novi Police Department
45175 West 10 Mile Road
Novi, Michigan 48375

RE: A/E Services – Novi Police Department – Headquarters Renovation

Dear Deputy Chief Lindberg:

This letter transmits an update from Plante & Moran CRESA, LLC (P&MC) who has completed its engagement to assist and advise Novi Police Department (NPD) in its selection of an Architectural/Engineering (AE) firm for the Headquarters Renovation project. This update represents the mutual efforts of P&MC and the key staff from the Police Department to present a framework in order to identify, evaluate, and select an AE firm for the project.

PMC was engaged by NPD and it was indicated that a Qualification Based Selection (QBS) process would be used to provide information relating to municipal and police facility experience, quality assurance, the ability to stay on schedule and budget, and in-house professional services from qualified firms. This framework is to provide an order of importance of the responding firms' experience to allow NPD to make an informed decision regarding hiring of an AE firm for the project in addition to the proposed cost.

The Request for Qualifications (RFQ), Request for Proposals (RFP), attachments, and an amended copy of the AIA Agreement with business terms, were submitted to NPD and its legal counsel for review and were approved. On January 24, 2008, the RFQ/RFP was publicly advertised on the City of Novi's purchasing web site as well as sent to firms who expressed interest in the project.

On January 30, 2008, NPD in conjunction with PMC, conducted a mandatory prequalification meeting at 2:00 p.m. EST in the Training Facility for the RFQ/RFP with interested AE firms as advertised.

On February 6, 2008, NPD received four (4) RFQ / RFP responses. Copies of the responses from these firms are available in the Clerk's office.

In evaluating the AE qualifications / proposals, PMC considered firm qualifications as well as economic factors. Based on the experience as an AE, including municipal and police facility experience, quality assurance, the ability to stay on schedule and budget, in-house professional services from qualified firms and proposed costs for services, three (3) firms met the minimal requirements established by NPD.

NPD in conjunction with PMC conducted interviews with the three (3) firms on Thursday, February 14, 2008. The attached spreadsheet provides a summary of qualifications, proposed fee, and other evaluation factors for each firm.

CDPA Architects scored the highest on the QBS scoring sheet with a weighted score of 3.20 out of 5.0 possible points. CDPA has completed over 30 police facility projects including the original NPD headquarters and Training Center expansion. The proposed Project Architect has been with the firm for over eleven (11) years and has personally completed the last nine (9) police facility renovations for the firm. In addition to the Project Architect, CDPA has included a field representative who will be on-site throughout the construction process in their proposed fee.

It is the opinion of PMC, based on the QBS criteria established by the NPD, that the City Council could engage the CDPA Architects based on the QBS score, firm qualifications and their proposed fee. Formal engagement should be contingent upon successful negotiation of an agreement between NPD and CDPA Architects

PMC is available to answer any questions about the AE selection process and the methodology used to prepare it.

Sincerely,

PLANTE & MORAN CRESA, LLC



Greg VanKirk



Paul R. Wills, AIA

Enclosures: (1) – A/E RFQ and RFP Analysis

Novi Police Department
Headquarters Renovation Project
A/E QBS Spreadsheet
February 15, 2008

0 = No info

1 = Least

5 = Best

5 total points
available

ARCHITECT	ARCHITECT SELECTION CRITERIA	RANK (POINTS)	WEIGHT FACTOR	WEIGHTED SCORE
CDPA Architects	Municipal Experience	0.15	5.00	0.75
	Relevant Police Complex Experience	0.20	5.00	1.00
	Quality Assurance Program	0.20	3.00	0.60
	Ability to stay in budget & on-time	0.20	1.00	0.20
	Proposed Fee	0.20	3.00	0.60
	In-House Professional Services	0.05	1.00	0.05
	TOTAL			18.00
Rama Rao / Redstone	Municipal Experience	0.15	3.00	0.45
	Relevant Police Complex Experience	0.20	3.00	0.60
	Quality Assurance Program	0.20	3.00	0.60
	Ability to stay in budget & on-time	0.20	1.00	0.20
	Proposed Fee	0.20	4.00	0.80
	In-House Professional Services	0.05	5.00	0.25
	TOTAL			19.00
Sarnacki & Associates Architects	Municipal Experience	0.15	2.00	0.30
	Relevant Police Complex Experience	0.20	2.00	0.40
	Quality Assurance Program	0.20	3.00	0.60
	Ability to stay in budget & on-time	0.20	1.00	0.20
	Proposed Fee	0.20	5.00	1.00
	In-House Professional Services	0.05	2.00	0.10
	TOTAL			15.00

Notes / Clarifications based on the RFQ and RFP responses received:

Municipal Experience rank is based on the following of # projects completed: >15 projects = 5 pts.; 10 to 14 projects = 4pts; 5 to 9 projects = 3 pts.; 3-4 projects = 2 pt.

Relevant Police Experience rank is based on the following # of completed of projects >15 projects = 5 pts.; 10 to 14 projects = 4pts; 5 to 9 projects = 3 pts.; 3-4 projects = 2 pt.

Quality Assurance is the percentage of Errors and Omissions Change Orders for previous project and is based on the following: = or <1.5% = 5 pts.; = or <1.75% = 4 pts.; = or <2.0% = 3 pts.; = or <2.25% = 2 pts.; = or <2.50% = 1 pt.; = or <2.75% = 0 pt.

Ability to stay on-budget and on-time is based on the ability to complete this project within the constraints of the RFP: Yes = 1 pt., No = 0 pt.

Proposed Fee is based on the following: = or <9.0% or less = 5 pts.; = or <10.0% = 4 pts.; = or <11.0% = 3 pts.; = or <12.0% = 2 pts.; = or <13.0% = 1 pt.; = or <14.0% = 0 pt.

In-house professional services is based on the following: >6 categories = 5 pts.; >5 categories = 4pts; >4 categories = 3 pts.; >3 categories projects = 2 pt; >2 categories = 1 pt.

**NOVI POLICE DEPARTMENT
HEADQUARTERS RENOVATION
A-E RFQ ANALYSIS FEBRUARY 15, 2008**

Project: City of Novi - Police Department Facility
RFP Due Date: February 6, 2008

	CDPA Architects	Rama Rao / Redstone Architects	Sarnacki Associates	Gillett Associates
Firm licensed in the State of Michigan - (Year)	Yes - 1961	Yes - 1979	Yes - 1993	Yes - 1956
Min. of relevant experience in Municipal Projects	Yes - 40	Yes - 9	Yes - 6	Yes - 3
Min. police projects in excess of \$500,000	Yes - 34	Yes - 6	Yes - 3	No - 2
Relevant experience in Southeast Michigan	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Professional and Liability Insurance (Aggregate)	\$ 2,000,000	\$ 2,000,000	\$ 2,000,000	\$ 2,000,000
Location of Firm	Southfield, MI	Detroit, MI	Wyandotte, MI	Farmington Hills, MI
Joint Venture	No	Yes - Redstone	No	No
Staff Count (FTE)	19	19	6	16
Municipal Experience (% of Firm Work)	95%	85%	40%	15%
Consultants (M-E)	EAM	-	MA Engineering	MA Engineering
Total worth of Work in Process	\$ 2,568,000	\$ 1,120,000	\$ 650,000	\$ 2,443,884
RFP Information				
Phase 1- Programming	\$1,280	\$2,000	\$1,140	
Phase 2 - Site Planning	\$0	\$0	\$0	
Phase 3 - Schematic Building Design	\$5,520	\$6,000	\$5,700	
Phase 4 - Design Development	\$9,200	\$8,000	\$7,600	
Phase 5 - Construction Documents	\$18,614	\$15,000	\$15,200	
Phase 6 - Contractor Procurement	\$0	\$0	\$0	
Phase 7 - Construction Contract Administration	\$10,550	\$8,000	\$7,600	
Phase 8 - Post Construction Services	\$1,060	\$2,000	\$760	
Sub-Total: Phase 1 through 8	\$46,224	\$41,000	\$38,000	
Consultants (if not included in above)	\$0	\$0	\$0	
Total	\$46,224	\$41,000	\$38,000	
Percentage of Construction Cost (\$455,000)	10.16%	9.01%	8.35%	
Reimbursements	\$5,500	\$3,750	\$4,100	
Standard of Care Percentage	2.0%	2.0%	2.0%	
Total Rating-QBS Spreadsheet (based on 5 pts.)	3.20	2.90	2.60	
Notes:				