City of Novi
13 Mile/Novi Road Area Study
A Market Assessment and Land Use Study
May 14, 2015
Acknowledgements

City Council
Bob Gatt, Mayor
David Staudt, Mayor Pro Tem term
Andrew Mutch
Wayne Wrobel
Laura Marie Casey
Gwen Markham
Doreen Poupard

Planning Commission
Tony Anthony
David Baratta
Robert J. Giacopetti
David Greco
Michael J. Lynch
Mark Pehrson
Ted Zuchiewski

City Manager
Pete Auger

Community Development Department
Charles Boulard, Community Development Director
Barbara McBeth, Deputy Community Development Director
Kristen Kapelanski, Planner
Sri Komaragiri, Planner

Clearzoning, Inc.
The Chesapeake Group (TCG)
Table of Contents

Executive Summary 4
History of Subject Property 7
Existing Conditions 9
Market Assessment 13
Alternatives 21
Appendix 27

The Study Area
Executive Summary

This land use study was prompted by a request from a property owner interested in developing a 21-acre parcel on 13 Mile and Novi Roads. Development of this parcel is subject to a 2002 consent judgment (CJ) that specifies that this parcel will be developed with up to 170,000 sq ft of commercial uses. The owner wishes instead to build 189 multiple family dwelling units that would be available for rent. Through an assessment of the history of development in this area, existing land uses, and the market for commercial development, this study explores alternatives for consideration by the City as it reviews the applicant’s request.

While commercial development is plentiful in Novi, there is not much within the mile surrounding the subject property, particularly of a community or local nature. Significant regional shopping opportunities exist south of 12 Mile Road, but it is a destination type of retail, as opposed to retail that provides goods and services that people may need on a daily basis. The land use study included the following elements:

- Review of development in the area
- Assessment of existing land use
- Market assessment
- Public input
- Recommendations for land use options

**Review of Development in the Area**

The subject parcel is part of a mixed use development that was originally approved in 1991. The concept included a variety of housing types (ranging from live-work units to multiple family to single family homes) with a commercial center that would serve the nearby neighborhoods. Much of the residential components have been built, or are still being built. Aside from a gas station and drug store, none of the other commercial development has occurred.

**Assessment of Existing Land Use**

The subject property is located with frontage on Novi Road (an arterial) and 13 Mile (a minor arterial) in the north section of the City. The 21-acre parcel is undeveloped and is surrounded by nearby residential developments, including detached single family homes, attached single family townhomes, multiple family dwellings, and manufactured housing. There is a 13,380 sq ft drug store and 8,000 sq ft gas station/convenience store on opposite corners of 13 Mile and Novi Road. The area includes sidewalks on the main roads (13 Mile and Novi Roads). Aside from the drug store and gas station, there are no other commercial uses within walking distance of the property.

**Market Assessment**

The market assessment prepared for the subject property generally finds that the amount of commercial development permitted by the consent judgment (170,000 sq ft) would be more than could be supported by the area, given the current

![Concept provided by the property owner](image-url)
number of households combined with the existing commercial development in the City and assuming 2020 market conditions. The assessment finds a demand for more housing in the City, especially multiple family housing for seniors over age 55 and millennials under age 34.

**Public Input**

A public open house was held on April 13, 2015, and residents had the opportunity to view land use and market information as well as speak with the property owner about his plans for development. Comments provided at the meeting and in follow-up comment cards and emails suggest that many nearby residents are not in favor of big box commercial development or multiple family rental housing, but could see the property developed with single family homes and some neighborhood-type commercial. Some residents did support the multiple family proposal. There was no clear consensus from residents who attended the meeting. See summary of comments included in the Appendix.

**Alternatives**

Given that residential is the dominant land use in the area, it seems reasonable to continue residential uses on this parcel. However, looking at current land use trends and market demands for walkable communities, it also is reasonable to include a commercial component in the development of this parcel. A mix of uses that would incorporate 20,000-25,000 sq ft of commercial uses (about three acres), such as wine bars, restaurants, markets, and office space would provide some local goods and services within walking distance of the many residents who live in this area. Additionally, it is desirable to include some type of community use in this development, such as a playground, sport court, community meeting room, or fitness facility to help this development be incorporated into the existing neighborhoods.

Additional efforts may include outreach to empty nesters in the City to encourage existing residents to consider a new lifestyle. Further, young professionals should be encouraged to get involved in City organizations, such as the Chamber of Commerce and service clubs, to help instill a feeling of belonging, rather than just passing through.

This study identifies two options for consideration if the City Council determines to move forward with a request to change the Consent Judgment. These are in addition to doing nothing, which keeps the current agreement in place. It should be noted that any development will be reviewed in more detail for compliance with the Zoning Ordinance as part of the site plan review process.

**Option 1:** Multiple family residential with a density of up to nine dwelling units/acre on up to 18 acres. The remaining three acres, located near the frontage of one of the two arterial streets (13 Mile and/or Novi Road), would be mixed use with ground floor retail/restaurant. Up to two additional floors could offer residential dwelling units.

**Option 2:** Multiple family residential with a density of up to nine dwelling units/acre on the entire 21-acre parcel. At least one public amenity, such as those noted above, should be included in the development to encourage a community feeling between new and existing residents.
Sandstone/The Vistas Timeline

1986
Original mixed use development concept presented and approved.
City creates PUD zoning standards to facilitate development. Concept included:
- 564 Stacked Flats Units
- 620 Attached Single Family Units
- 309 Detached Single Family Units
- 24,500 sq ft commercial uses

1991
Revised Sandstone PUD Approved.
- Phased mixed use development
- Commercial center
- Detached homes, townhomes, and apartments
- Central plaza served as focus of development in the commercial center

1995
Sandstone PUD Amended - The Vistas.
- Renamed The Vistas
- 1,119 dwelling units: Mix of Single Family Homes, Townhomes, and Multiple Family
- 100,000 sf commercial/retail
- Plan influenced by New Urbanism and City Beautiful movements.
- All residents would be within walking distance of the Village Commercial Center

2002
Litigation results in Consent Judgment.
- Affects the PUD and “Remaining PUD” phases
- Commercial uses increased to 170,000 sf
- Continues residential dwelling components
- Development examples include local strip centers
- One fast-food restaurant with drive-thru permitted

2015
New Development Proposed.
- 189 multiple family dwellings
- No commercial uses

Example of commercial development (Westwind Village, West Bloomfield, MI) included in the 2002 Consent Judgment
Commercial development at 13 Mile/Novi Road. Approximately 24,000 sf
History of Development

**1986.** A development known as “Sandstone” was approved in the 13 Mile Road/Novi Road area. The project contained about 300 acres. Of this, 220 acres was to be open space (about 70% of the entire parcel), 245,000 sq ft of commercial/retail space, and 1,493 units of residential housing. This plan was never implemented, but set the stage for planned unit developments and mixing of residential and commercial uses.

**1991.** Sandstone was acquired by a different property owner and the PUD was amended to reduce the number of housing units to 1,119, reduce the commercial space to 80,000 sq ft and remove the previously planned golf course. The plan continued to envision a mixed use concept.

**1995.** The PUD was amended again in 1995 when the property changed names, going from the Sandstone development to the Vistas. The overall vision was to create a mixed use development that included a variety of detached and attached single family residential housing units along with 100,000 sq ft of commercial uses to serve the new neighborhoods (see map next page). The concept was heavily influenced by the New Urbanist movement of the late 1980’s-early 1990’s and was unlike anything developed in southeast Michigan. The 1995 “Revised Area Plan” describes the plan as having “more in common with small towns such as Northville, Harbor Springs and Birmingham than typical suburban subdivisions found throughout the greater metropolitan Detroit area.” If the property had been built as planned, with residential dwellings all within walking distance of a central commercial core that contained a mix of retail and restaurants, it would likely have influenced similar developments in the region. Even today, a true “village center” concept that successfully blends residential and commercial in a non-resort setting has not been completed in Michigan, where traditional strip style commercial predominates.

The New Urbanism movement emerged in the 1980’s as a way to revitalize urban environments as well as develop vacant property. Early examples include: Seaside and Celebration in Florida, Orenco Station in Oregon, Habersham in South Carolina, and the Kentlands in Maryland. Features of new urban development include compact mixing of uses, walkable human scaled neighborhoods, and shared public spaces.

**2002.** A lawsuit involving this developed resulted in a consent judgment. The subject parcel became known as the “Remaining PUD.” This judgment did not change the mixed use concept for the development, but did allow for a change in the approach to the mixing of uses. Rather than a “village center” type of commercial—live/work units and dense retail/office/restaurant uses—the example developments included as exhibits in the consent judgment were strip commercial developments. The consent judgment allowed an increase of total commercial space, up to 170,000 sq ft on the “Remaining PUD.” While the example developments included some higher quality materials, the building form was not much different than anything else being developed in the region. Following
The Vistas Village Center will include cafes and neighborhood markets. Note: Artist character sketch, actual construction may vary significantly.

Images from the 1995 Vistas PUD application

Phasing Plan included in 1995 PUD amendment for the Vistas of Novi. The subject parcel was known at the time as phases 11, 12 and 13.
this action, housing units continued to be added to the overall development. In 2006, a drug store was built on the southwest corner of 13 Mile and Novi Roads, and in 2009 a gas station with convenience store was built on the southeast corner. The 21-acre subject parcel remained undeveloped.

2015. The property owner approached the city with a plan to build 189 units of multiple family residential rather than any of the up to 170,000 sq ft of commercial allowed by the consent judgment. The proposed development limits building height to two stories at a density permissible by the ordinance. The property owner is asking the city to support an amendment of the consent judgment. Before moving forward with this request - which lies within the City Council’s sole discretion - the City Council asked for a land use study to better understand the market, the land use in the area, and the needs of residents surrounding the property. The Consent Judgment covered several areas within the original development area. Much of the compromise on various land uses has already been implemented or taken advantage of by the developer. This property is one piece of that larger compromise.

The 2002 consent judgment includes several examples of commercial development that would guide building form for the subject parcel. These standard strip commercial developments are quite different than the originally proposed compact mix of uses. Starting on top right: Gateway Center in West Bloomfield, Bloomfield Plaza in Bloomfield Township., and Country Creek Commons in Oakland Township.
Existing Conditions

Assessment of Existing Land Use

The subject property is located with frontage on Novi Road (an arterial) and 13 Mile (a minor arterial) in the north section of the City. This portion of the City is largely bounded by Haggerty Road to the east and I-96 to the south. The current 21-acre parcel is currently undeveloped. Surrounding the parcel are residential developments, including detached single family homes, attached single family townhomes, multiple family dwellings, and manufactured housing. There is a 13,380 sq ft drug store and 8,000 sq ft gas station/convenience store on opposite corners of 13 Mile and Novi Road. Additional commercial uses are found to the north at 14 Mile and Novi Roads, 14 Mile and M-5 (the east side), and to the south at 12 Mile and Novi Roads.

Sidewalks are located on 13 Mile and Novi Roads. The City’s non-motorized transportation plan shows high-priority bike lanes proposed along 13 Mile Road between Lakeshore Park to the west of the subject property and M-5 to the east.

The drug store, gas station/convenience store, local schools, and Lakeshore Park are the primary destinations within a walking distance of those living in the area.

The future land use map shows the subject parcel is planned for local commercial; it is zoned PUD. City maps are included in the appendix.

Approximately 850 housing units have been built to date of the 1,119 units originally approved. Construction of detached units is currently ongoing.
City of Novi: 13 Mile/Novi Road Study Area Land Use

An overview of the composition of land uses in the study area and the relationship between them.

Non-Motorized Network
- High-priority bike lanes proposed along 13 Mile Road between Lakeshore Park and M-5
- Sidewalks along Novi Road connect 13 Mile-Nov'i Rd to shopping/restaurant/office at 14 Mile-Nov'i Rd.

The Future Land Use Map shows the subject property is designated "Local Commercial" with the surrounding area designated residential. The Master Plan identifies "local commercial" as lands designated for convenience shopping for residents within nearby neighborhoods. It includes retail, personal service establishments, and small offices.
48377 demographics

48377 – North of 96
About 28% of the City’s population lives in this zip code. It’s about 1/3 of the City’s area.

The percentage of renters in this zip code is higher than in the City overall: 53% rent in 48377, while only 34% is the City average.

Zip Code Median HH Income: $81,029
City Median HH Income: $106,754

The City, and this zip code, exceed State’s Median HH Income of $64,753

Diversity
About 3/4 of the City’s population is White; the remaining 25% is comprised mainly of Blacks (5.9%) and Asians (17.9%)

Age Makeup
13% of the City’s population is over 65 years old.
26% of the City’s population is 19 years or younger.

18.5% of the 48377 population is over 65 years old.
20% of the 48377 population is 19 years older or younger.

One-person households make up 33% of the City's total households.
One-person households make up 48% of the households in 48377.
Market Assessment

Demographics of the Area

The graphic on the preceding page highlights the demographics of the area as defined by its zip code (48377), provided as background. The market assessment that studies the viability of the approved scale of commercial development follows.

National and State Factors Important to Novi and the Proposed Development

There are demographic and other changes within the United States and Michigan that impact the opportunities and the future for Novi and the proposed modification to the Sandstone Consent Judgment. These include but are not limited to:

- Birth and fertility rates have fallen to the lowest level in the history of the country, resulting in fewer numbers of youth and lower long-term future household creation.
- The marriage rates are also at the lowest level in the country’s history and continue to decline. The traditional two parents with two children household is now a minority of the population in general and will become even a smaller segment in the future.
- The average age of residents in the United States continues to increase, impacting the current and future labor force, housing needs, and other segments of the economy.
- The country’s population continues to diversify in terms of origin, ethnicity, race and other related factors.
- Both the Baby Boomers households (between the ages of 50 and 68) and younger adult households (between the ages of 21 and 30) are seeking different housing options, greater mobility and different environments than have past generations. While some seek a more intense urban environment, growing numbers seek rural settings with employment opportunity.
- The two fastest growing components of the population, both the Baby Boomers households (between the ages of 50 and 68) and younger adult households (between the ages of 21 and 30) are increasingly seeking and participating in passive and other recreational activity and new forms of entertainment.
- The young adult population relocates and shifts employment at a faster pace than any previous generation.
- Baby Boomers have been a substantial market force for the past fifteen years. However, their importance in the commercial and residential markets will dwindle in the next fifteen years as they continue to age.
- An aging population will likely increase the demand for office space and related services in various professional areas, such as health care, while diminishing demand in others.
- Aging in place and aging in communities where residents have lived for much of their lives are of increasing importance to larger segments of the population.

There is increased demand for housing that satisfies short-term needs of large population segments.

According to published Population Reference Bureau reports, there were roughly 76.4 million Baby Boomers in the United States in 2014. From 1946 to 1964, which are the years of birth associated with the Baby Boomers, there were 76 million born. Of these, roughly 11 million died, resulting in roughly 65.2 million survivors. The number of residents associated with the ages of the Baby Boomers has increased due to immigration to the United States, as the number of immigrants in this age range has outweighed the number that has died. The Baby Boomers are now between the ages of 50 and 68.
The table above illustrates a breakdown of the number of "baby boomers" by select peak years. In addition and as a result of medical advances and lifestyle changes, there is a large segment of the population living well into their seventies and eighties. There are an estimated 27.8 million people living in the United States who are 70 or older. Collectively, the Baby Boomers combined with the population that is 70 or older represent about one-third of the total population in the country. According to a recently published study by the Joint Center for Housing Studies at Harvard University, the number of households headed by someone at least 70 years of age will grow by 42% between 2015 and 2025; and the actual number of these households will jump by 8.3 million.

### Changes in Manufacturing & Technology

Changes in manufacturing and technology trends within the United States, Michigan and the global economy will impact commercial opportunities. They include but are not limited to those that follow.

- Manufacturing is changing significantly through changing technology, technology application and the introduction of new materials. The changing technology diminishes the importance of labor as a cost factor and increases the importance of transportation relative to other cost factors. Therefore, for many products, production facilities located in population centers or adjacent areas will have a competitive advantage in the future.

- The technological change in manufacturing will result in the return of the production of many products to the United States. Manufacturing is likely to expand rapidly in the next ten years, which could provide local opportunities.

- Manufacturing changes, such as on-demand production through additive manufacturing/3D printing, will impact retail and related space in significant ways in the future, resulting in lower retail space demand as the need to keep large inventories diminishes. The amount of supportable space is likely to diminish as a result.

- The trend among big box stores and other retailers to fulfill online orders from stores versus warehouses could positively impact retail opportunities. (This somewhat counters the need for lower inventories on-site, as a result of increased on-demand production and the expansion of internet sales.)

- Expansion of and new delivery methods will also likely diminish the need for inventory and retail space.

### Local Patterns—Residential & Retail

#### Residential

According to figures noted by MEDC, 38.9% of the population in Michigan resided in the Southeast region in 2012. Roughly 26.1% of the population was 19 years of age or under and almost 38% of the population was 55 years of age or older. The population in the Southeast Region of Michigan was estimated to have declined by 1.4% over the previous five years.

According to the 2010 United States Census, there were roughly 55,000 people in 22,000 households living in Novi. About 35% of the households had children under the age of 18 living at home. About 54% of these households were composed of married couples.

From calendar year 2013 through February of 2015, the total number of permits issued for new housing in Novi was 428. In both 2013 and 2014 the numbers were consistent with just about 200 issued per year. During that time only five units of non single-family housing was permitted. Furthermore, SEMCOG has estimated that Novi’s population is expected to increase marginally through 2035. Assuming continued growth

### Table 1 - US Births for Select Years (Baby Boomers)*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Years</th>
<th>Numbers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1946</td>
<td>3,411,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1954</td>
<td>4,078,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1957 (peak year)</td>
<td>4,300,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1964</td>
<td>4,027,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Developed by The Chesapeake Group based on information from CNN.com.
in housing units, the average number of people living in each unit will continue to decline at a significant rate well into the future.

The primary reason for the decline in the number of people per household is the aging of the population now living in Novi. SEMCOG forecasts that generally the only growth in population will be those 65 years of age or older through 2040.

Retail

Novi has been and continues to be a regional hub for retail activity. Retail serves both the larger region and the local population. For the proposed Sandstone Consent Judgment sites, the retail component was intended largely to serve the needs of Novi residents based on the scale. SEMCOG has forecasted that employment in retail will diminish in the future. Such contraction can result from a number of factors including:

- Contraction of space
- Changes in technology in production and delivery
- Changes in selling methods
- A combination of all of the above

Table 4 indicates that even if household growth continues SEMCOG expects a decline in retail employment of about 5% well into the future.

At the onset of the Great Recession, The Chesapeake Group (TCG) prepared a market assessment for Novi. A major component of TCG’s 2007 Market Assessment was demand forecasts for retail space. While the forecast was based on many factors, future retail space demand was predicated on the construction of between 400 and 600 dwelling units per year from 2008 through 2015. This equated to a total dwelling unit increase of between 3,200 and 4,800 dwelling units through 2015. This estimate of future housing growth was premised upon historic growth patterns in Novi and some potential to capture new households created by those between the ages of 21 and 30.

As previously noted, these figures are well above those that have occurred since the technical end of the Great Recession. Furthermore, future retail space demand in Novi (as is the case elsewhere) will be negatively impacted by:

- The previously defined United States and Michigan demographic trends.

Table 3 - SEMCOG Projected Population for the City of Novi by Age Category for Five Year Intervals Through 2040*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age Group</th>
<th>2010</th>
<th>2015</th>
<th>2020</th>
<th>2025</th>
<th>2030</th>
<th>2035</th>
<th>2040</th>
<th>Change 2010 - 2040</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>75+</td>
<td>3,355</td>
<td>3,791</td>
<td>4,415</td>
<td>5,396</td>
<td>6,545</td>
<td>7,760</td>
<td>8,650</td>
<td>5,295</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>65-74</td>
<td>2,893</td>
<td>4,267</td>
<td>5,413</td>
<td>6,441</td>
<td>6,838</td>
<td>6,495</td>
<td>5,970</td>
<td>3,077</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60-64</td>
<td>2,689</td>
<td>3,405</td>
<td>3,981</td>
<td>3,968</td>
<td>3,675</td>
<td>3,284</td>
<td>3,028</td>
<td>339</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35-59</td>
<td>21,832</td>
<td>21,571</td>
<td>19,770</td>
<td>17,726</td>
<td>16,898</td>
<td>16,682</td>
<td>17,048</td>
<td>-4,784</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25-34</td>
<td>6,723</td>
<td>6,551</td>
<td>6,594</td>
<td>7,433</td>
<td>7,289</td>
<td>6,789</td>
<td>6,715</td>
<td>-8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18-24</td>
<td>3,630</td>
<td>4,806</td>
<td>4,729</td>
<td>4,523</td>
<td>4,246</td>
<td>4,165</td>
<td>4,158</td>
<td>528</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5-17</td>
<td>10,898</td>
<td>10,447</td>
<td>9,635</td>
<td>9,154</td>
<td>9,008</td>
<td>9,047</td>
<td>9,177</td>
<td>-1,721</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Under 5</td>
<td>3,204</td>
<td>3,326</td>
<td>3,268</td>
<td>3,291</td>
<td>3,262</td>
<td>3,122</td>
<td>3,151</td>
<td>-53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>55,224</td>
<td>58,164</td>
<td>57,805</td>
<td>57,932</td>
<td>57,761</td>
<td>57,344</td>
<td>57,897</td>
<td>2,673</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*U.S. Census Bureau and SEMCOG 2040 Forecast.

Table 2 - Number of New Residential Permits Issued in the City of Novi*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>2013</th>
<th>2014</th>
<th>2015 (thru February)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Single-family</td>
<td>197</td>
<td>198</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other than Single-family</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>197</td>
<td>203</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*U. S. Census Bureau.
Table 4 - SEMCOG Forecasted Jobs for the City of Novi by Industry*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Forecasted Jobs By Industry</th>
<th>2010</th>
<th>2015</th>
<th>2020</th>
<th>2025</th>
<th>2030</th>
<th>2035</th>
<th>2040</th>
<th>Change 2010 -2040</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Natural Resources, Mining, &amp; Construction</td>
<td>1,559</td>
<td>1,828</td>
<td>1,904</td>
<td>1,933</td>
<td>1,940</td>
<td>2,009</td>
<td>1,917</td>
<td>358</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufacturing</td>
<td>1,719</td>
<td>1,807</td>
<td>1,764</td>
<td>1,670</td>
<td>1,639</td>
<td>1,547</td>
<td>1,436</td>
<td>-283</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wholesale Trade, Transportation, Warehousing, &amp; Utilities</td>
<td>4,114</td>
<td>4,268</td>
<td>4,145</td>
<td>4,126</td>
<td>4,064</td>
<td>4,225</td>
<td>4,227</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Retail Trade</td>
<td>7,823</td>
<td>7,723</td>
<td>7,561</td>
<td>7,569</td>
<td>7,507</td>
<td>7,476</td>
<td>7,413</td>
<td>-410</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge-based Services</td>
<td>6,982</td>
<td>8,035</td>
<td>8,346</td>
<td>8,456</td>
<td>8,398</td>
<td>8,473</td>
<td>8,858</td>
<td>1,876</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Services to Households &amp; Firms</td>
<td>3,593</td>
<td>4,064</td>
<td>4,183</td>
<td>4,364</td>
<td>4,697</td>
<td>4,855</td>
<td>4,832</td>
<td>1,239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private Education &amp; Healthcare</td>
<td>5,342</td>
<td>6,164</td>
<td>6,657</td>
<td>6,914</td>
<td>7,235</td>
<td>7,522</td>
<td>8,026</td>
<td>2,684</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leisure &amp; Hospitality</td>
<td>5,109</td>
<td>5,328</td>
<td>5,133</td>
<td>5,160</td>
<td>5,220</td>
<td>5,473</td>
<td>5,710</td>
<td>601</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government</td>
<td>1,687</td>
<td>1,685</td>
<td>1,726</td>
<td>1,757</td>
<td>1,782</td>
<td>1,801</td>
<td>1,808</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>37,928</td>
<td>40,902</td>
<td>41,419</td>
<td>41,949</td>
<td>42,482</td>
<td>43,381</td>
<td>44,227</td>
<td>6,299</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* SEMCOG 2040 Forecast produced in 2012.

- The previously defined United States, Michigan and global manufacturing and technology change.

  In the "best case" scenario without any new growth in housing units in Novi, the current retail space will be maintained at the same level it is at the present time. However, a more realistic scenario is that without additional housing unit growth and because of the noted national and local factors there will be a decline in supported space.

  The amount of supported space would decline also as a result of:
  - The diminished size of the average household resulting either in increased vacancies or eventual redevelopment.
  - The aging of the population resulting in a shifting of product purchase and priorities.
  - An increase in numbers of residents on fixed incomes or diminished incomes.

  Therefore, any increases in potential retail space in Novi will most probably be attributable to increases in demand created by growth in housing units/“rooftops” in the foreseeable future. Based upon an anticipated 200 unit per year growth in housing units in the future as achieved in recent years, this study estimated the sales and supportable space associated with the new units for 2015 and 2020.

  It is noted that total or aggregate retail sales figures represent a compilation of sales associated with ten major categories and the types of operations within those categories. The ten major categories of retail goods and related services are as follows:
  - Food, such as groceries and related merchandise generally purchased for home preparation or consumption
  - Eating and drinking, consisting of prepared food and beverages generally consumed on the premises or carried to another location
  - General merchandise, including variety stores, department stores, and large value oriented retail operators
  - Furniture and accessories, including appliances and home furnishings
  - Transportation, including the sale of new and used automotive and other personal vehicles and parts
  - Drugstores, including those specializing in health and beauty aids or pharmaceuticals
  - Apparel and accessories
  - Hardware and building materials, including traditional hardware stores, garden centers and home improvement centers
  - Auto services, including gasoline and vehicle repair
Table 5 - Estimated Category and Aggregate retail Goods and Related Services Sales and Supportable Square Footage of Space for the City of Novi for 2015, 2020 and the Total*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>2015 Sales</th>
<th>2020 Sales</th>
<th>Total Sales</th>
<th>2015 Space</th>
<th>2020 Space</th>
<th>Total Space</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Food</td>
<td>$2,046,000</td>
<td>$6,820,000</td>
<td>$8,866,000</td>
<td>3,255</td>
<td>10,848</td>
<td>14,103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eat/Drink</td>
<td>1,667,000</td>
<td>5,555,000</td>
<td>7,222,000</td>
<td>3,969</td>
<td>13,226</td>
<td>17,195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General Merchandise</td>
<td>2,238,000</td>
<td>7,459,000</td>
<td>9,697,000</td>
<td>13,284</td>
<td>44,270</td>
<td>57,554</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Furniture</td>
<td>245,000</td>
<td>818,000</td>
<td>1,063,000</td>
<td>565</td>
<td>1,882</td>
<td>2,448</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transportation</td>
<td>2,114,000</td>
<td>7,045,000</td>
<td>9,159,000</td>
<td>6,928</td>
<td>23,088</td>
<td>30,018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drugstore</td>
<td>1,039,000</td>
<td>3,464,000</td>
<td>4,503,000</td>
<td>1,019</td>
<td>3,396</td>
<td>4,415</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Apparel</td>
<td>534,000</td>
<td>1,781,000</td>
<td>2,316,000</td>
<td>1,481</td>
<td>4,941</td>
<td>6,424</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hardware</td>
<td>1,231,000</td>
<td>4,103,000</td>
<td>5,334,000</td>
<td>5,017</td>
<td>16,719</td>
<td>21,736</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vehicle Service</td>
<td>1,583,000</td>
<td>5,278,000</td>
<td>6,862,000</td>
<td>3,854</td>
<td>12,850</td>
<td>16,705</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Miscellaneous</td>
<td>1,403,000</td>
<td>4,677,000</td>
<td>6,079,000</td>
<td>5,605</td>
<td>18,678</td>
<td>24,277</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AGGREGATE</td>
<td>$14,100,000</td>
<td>$47,000,000</td>
<td>$61,101,000</td>
<td>44,977</td>
<td>149,898</td>
<td>194,875</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Developed by The Chesapeake Group, Inc., 2015.

- Miscellaneous, including a plethora of retail goods and services ranging from florists to paper goods.
- When visiting friends, family, or others outside of Michigan.
- At or near second homes for those appropriate.
- Via the internet or catalogs.

A productivity level is the sales per square foot figure essential to pay all costs of operation and provide a reasonable return on investment. Sales productivity levels vary for each sub-category, type of business operation, or store type. The productivity levels vary from low figures for bowling centers to thousands of dollars for others. Supportable space is derived by dividing the amount of sales by the appropriate productivity level. Both the spending patterns and productivity levels are likely to change over time. All year 2020 sales estimates are in 2015 constant dollars, excluding any inflation.

A previous analysis of retail demand prepared for Novi by The Chesapeake Group indicated that long-term viability of commercial areas is dependent upon the market penetration or the share of households that conduct business in an area. Whether through online purchases, vacations, visitations, work, or numerous other means, many dollars and resulting space are exported to commercial not located in the home market of Novi. Furthermore, the proportions of purchases going to space outside the home market is likely to increase in the future because of the previously noted changes in manufacturing and distribution, facilitating continued growth of online and catalog activity.

A minority of the growth in spending and supportable space associated with the new housing is likely to be captured in Novi. Overall growth in space generated from new Novi households is estimated at 195,000 square feet by 2020. Assuming a 40% to 50% capture of dollars or space, new supportable space is likely to be in the range of 78,000 to 97,500 square feet for all of Novi from those living in Novi.

The above newly supported space could result in new construction or filling of existing or future vacant spaces in Novi.
Conclusions with Respect to the Proposed Sandstone Consent Judgment Changes

The proposed modification to the 2002 Sandstone Consent Judgment governing the property seeks to change from permitted commercial land uses to multiple-family housing use. The Consent Judgment allows for up to 170,000 square feet of commercial space. The applicant asserts that the allowance for commercial land uses is no longer reasonable, and the proposed residential development would be an upgrade from what has been anticipated.

The conclusions that can be drawn from this market assessment prepared by are:

- The amount of commercial space allowed under the Consent Judgment is well beyond what the market is likely to be capable of supporting without cannibalization of other space in Novi. If any commercial space is marketable on the site, it is well below that which is allowed under the Judgment.

- If only consideration is given to the existing residents of Novi, there is a growing demand for multi-family housing for seniors alone. Expansion of multi-family unit stock in Novi would afford existing residents the opportunity to continue to live and age in the community in which they have lived for much or the better part of their lives. Giving consideration to only this one segment of the housing market, the proposal to move from commercial to quality multi-family housing units would objectively meet some of the growing market needs.

- As presented, there has not been much real growth in non-single-family housing units in Novi in the last few years. A large proportion of households under the age of 32 are increasingly mobile and are seeking non-permanent residences. Large proportions of these seek quality rental units and plan on living in one community for shorter durations than other generations have in the past. This is a result of many factors not the least of which is the desire or need for mobility in employment. Without significant options for this market segment, Novi will miss the opportunity to attract such residents initially and will result in these households having a lower probability of living in Novi at such time that they may seek greater permanence in the future.

Therefore, the preliminary analysis indicates that a shifting in use from commercial to multi-family housing is possible from a market perspective.

This market assessment cannot address the issue of density, nor the density or change in use compatibility with other immediate area activity or Novi in general, rent levels, or the need for any type of conventional or non-conventional financing at this time.

Additional Background Information

Following the presentation of the initial findings at the open house and to the Planning Commission subcommittee, questions were raised about rental housing in the City of Novi. A comparison between rates of home ownership and number of units in multi-unit structures follows in the table below. The number of housing units in multi-unit structures includes both owned and rented units, but is provided to illustrate the percentage of housing units that are not detached single family homes.

This information illustrates that the City of Novi’s homeownership rate of 66% is just about the same as the United States as a whole, and very similar to nearby Farmington Hills, Walled Lake, and Plymouth. The percentage of housing units in multi-unit structures (non-single family detached homes) of 34% is similar to those same nearby communities. Median gross rents (estimated, and in 2013 dollars) is fairly consistent throughout the area, with the City of Novi’s rate of $994 just about average, given the communities included in the comparison. A current search of rental rates indicates that rents have likely increased since those estimates were calculated.
### Table 6 - Comparison of Selected Housing Information—City of Novi and Regional Communities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>US</th>
<th>Novi</th>
<th>Farmington Hills</th>
<th>Walled Lake</th>
<th>Commerce Twp</th>
<th>Livonia</th>
<th>Plymouth</th>
<th>Rochester Hills</th>
<th>Auburn Hills</th>
<th>Troy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Housing units, April 1, 2010</td>
<td>131,704,730</td>
<td>24,226</td>
<td>36,178</td>
<td>3,689</td>
<td>15,807</td>
<td>40,401</td>
<td>9,132</td>
<td>29,494</td>
<td>21,412</td>
<td>32,907</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Persons per household</td>
<td>2.63</td>
<td>2.42</td>
<td>2.32</td>
<td>2.18</td>
<td>2.71</td>
<td>2.55</td>
<td>2.14</td>
<td>2.57</td>
<td>2.35</td>
<td>2.68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Homeownership Rate</td>
<td>65%</td>
<td>66%</td>
<td>63%</td>
<td>61%</td>
<td>90%</td>
<td>85%</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td>76%</td>
<td>49%</td>
<td>75%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Housing units in multi-unit structures, percent</td>
<td>26%</td>
<td>34%</td>
<td>35%</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>39%</td>
<td>22%</td>
<td>44%</td>
<td>21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Median gross rent</td>
<td>$904</td>
<td>$994</td>
<td>$976</td>
<td>$905</td>
<td>$1,259</td>
<td>$968</td>
<td>$848</td>
<td>$1,064</td>
<td>$906</td>
<td>$1,049</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Median selected monthly owner costs* - with a mortgage</td>
<td>$1,540</td>
<td>$2,047</td>
<td>$1,871</td>
<td>$1,348</td>
<td>$1,703</td>
<td>$1,467</td>
<td>$1,778</td>
<td>$1,889</td>
<td>$1,431</td>
<td>$1,873</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Median household income</td>
<td>$53,046</td>
<td>$80,108</td>
<td>$69,700</td>
<td>$46,319</td>
<td>$78,514</td>
<td>$68,973</td>
<td>$73,389</td>
<td>$78,160</td>
<td>$52,509</td>
<td>$85,685</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: US Census—2009-2013 5-year estimate
*Selected monthly owner costs include: utilities, heating fuel, condo fee, insurance, mortgage

### Traffic

It is appropriate to include information about the impact of traffic generated by the permitted land use (170,000 sq ft of commercial or 189 multiple family residential units) on this area. In the table below, the trip generation comparison shows the considerable number of vehicular trips generated by the scale of commercial development permissible by the Consent Judgment.

### Table 7 - Trip Generation Comparison, Apartments v. Retail

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Land Use</th>
<th>ITE Use #</th>
<th>Size</th>
<th>Daily Trips</th>
<th>AM Peak-Hour Trips</th>
<th>PM Peak-Hour Trips</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>In</td>
<td>Out</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Apartments</td>
<td>220</td>
<td>189 d.u.</td>
<td>1,269</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shopping Center</td>
<td>820</td>
<td>170&lt;sup&gt;th&lt;/sup&gt; s.f.</td>
<td>9,588</td>
<td>101</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<sup>1</sup> Forecast based on rate data and methodology recommended by the Institute of Transportation Engineers in its *Trip Generation Manual – 9<sup>th</sup> Edition* (2012).
Alternatives

Based on the land use study, market assessment, and public input, amending the Consent Judgment on the property in terms of reducing the prescribed amount of commercial area is an option that is appropriate to consider for this parcel. It does not appear that there is a market for the 170,000 sq ft prescribed. In addition, the amount of traffic generated by such a use would have an impact on of the area.

However, the applicant’s proposal to add 189 units of multiple family housing as the parcel’s only land use, reinforces land use patterns of the past—where residential uses are separated from commercial uses. This isolation of residential away from shopping, restaurants, offices, and entertainment compels people to drive everywhere, when using a non-motorized form of transportation would alleviate local traffic and improve public health.

In much of the region, we see single family homes in some areas, commercial uses in other areas, and multiple-family residential in still other areas. To access these distinct areas often requires getting in the car and driving, sometimes even between adjacent neighborhoods. Our country’s emphasis on home ownership (and, subsequently, the preservation of property values) has also led to land use policies that prioritize single-family neighborhood areas while often marginalizing other types of residential uses, especially multiple-family residential in the form of apartments for rent.

This context (maintaining a separation of land uses and preservation of single family neighborhoods) could be at the root of concerns expressed by residents over the development proposed for the subject parcel. It is understandable that existing residents might be worried that incoming renters will be people who do not care about the neighborhood or the community and will not take care of their surroundings.

And yet, the applicant and the market assessment both suggest that the renters will likely fall into two groups: empty nesters and young professionals. This development could represent an opportunity for the City to do two things: 1) encourage empty nesters to stay in the community as long as possible, and 2) attract young professionals to the City with hopes they become life-long residents.

From the market assessment, we learned that both of these demographic groups are seeking low maintenance housing that will allow them to do other things with their time. In addition, both groups seek walkable communities – whether in dense urban cities or small compact suburban areas. With the proximity of Lakeshore Park and Pavilion Shore Park, along with future plans for bike lanes on 13 Mile Road, this area would benefit from additional reasons to walk or bike. Having small commercial uses within reach may afford local residents with opportunities to incorporate physical activity into their daily lives, such as while shopping and working.

Having small commercial uses within reach may afford local residents with opportunities to incorporate physical activity into their daily lives, such as while shopping and working.

The original vision for the area was to create a small neighborhood commercial center that would have served the residents in the immediate area. Looking at the land use in the area, it seems that there are opportunities to add uses that serve the daily needs of local residents. This could mean restaurants, wine bars, food shops, markets, offices, and the like.
The market assessment suggests that the existing number of households in the area could support 20,000-25,000 sq ft of commercial uses. In addition, the subject parcel might also offer other amenities that could be used by adjacent residents either free or for a fee, such as a community room, playground, sport court, fitness facility, or co-working space. Examples of small mixed use developments and community facilities are provided on the pages that follow.

This study therefore identified two options for the City to consider in regards to this project if the City Council determines to amend the Consent Judgment at all, given the status of the overall consent judgment:

**Option 1:** Multiple family residential with a density of up to nine dwelling units/acre on up to 18 acres. The remaining three acres, located near the frontage of one of the two arterial streets (13 Mile and/or Novi Road), could be mixed use with ground floor retail/restaurant. Up to two additional floors could offer residential dwelling units. Given the proximity of the park and lake, commercial uses that have a recreation or health focus might be a great fit, including equipment rentals, fresh local food, and training facilities. Additionally, given the stated market for multiple family (young professionals and empty nesters), office space geared at those who work from home offices could be a real benefit to the nearby community.

**Option 2:** Multiple family residential with a density of up to nine dwelling units/acre on the entire 21-acre parcel. At least one public amenity, such as those noted above, should be included in the development to encourage a community feeling between new and existing residents.

**Supplemental Reading:** Additional information on community livability, multiple family housing trends

---

Incorporating “placemaking” elements into the project, including public open spaces, art, and gathering areas, will not only enhance the future development, but will also foster a richer community feeling in this area.
Examples of community amenities that would enhance development in this area, including (from top to bottom): public art, a plaza/picnic area, community building, and

A co-working space, like the ones pictured above and below, can offer people opportunities to meet, collaborate, or simply serve as an alternative work environment for those who work at home. There are typically fees associated with these spaces.

Hosting food truck rallies (like the one shown above, located in an office center parking lot on Haggerty Road and High Pointe Boulevard) would be a great way to bring people together.
Appendix

Public Input Summary
Public Input Comments
City of Novi – Open House April 13, 2015 - Area Plan Update – 13 Mile/Novi Roads

1. Open house comment #1
   - The only entry/exit for the future residents of “Manchester” community is located on a bend on Novi Road. This is going to cause MAJOR problems for traffic wanting to turn LEFT – especially in peak hours.
   - Need to make sure there is no negative impact on the existing waterways/water system from runoff.
   - There is no allowance for the abundance of bird & wildlife – where do they “relocate” to?
   - Why can’t this land be used for parkland which it was supposed to be when taxpayers money paid for it? We have no real parkland.
   - What is the impact of these properties on the property values of surrounding subdivisions?
   - The number of heavy vehicles. --PTO

2. Open house comment #2
   - I prefer residential over any commercial use.
   - 189 units can cause a real problem for traffic. At this time, it appears as though there is one exit onto Novi Road. Doesn’t sound too safe.
   - The condition of Novi Road between 12 & 13 Mile presently is in.
   - I’d rather it be residential surrounded by woods like the Woods of Novi development allowing wild life the ability to move around and through the area.
   - If some of the areas surrounding a development could be picnic tables or playgrounds would be good too.

3. Open house comment #3
   - My preference is for the City of Novi to purchase the 21 acres and convert it to a recreational area. Ball diamonds, soccer field, trails, nature area ...
   - There should be additional park area for the northern Novi residents.
   - I am opposed to large retail or fast food restaurants. No bars of cell towers, commercial businesses.
   - 75 acres off of 12 Mile Rd was given as part of a judgement, so no additional park area is on the north side of Novi, which was promised to the residents.
   Please provide feedback and feel free to contact me. Thanks. --Edward Soltysiak
   edward soltysiak@sbcglobal.net
4. Open house comment #4

Prefer:

- Single family detached condo or home
- Like PUD approach to control development
- Passive to Semi Act park space (ie) volleyball; soccer pavilion, esthetic fountain
- Walking access from Community adjacent to and on east side of Novi
- No commercial (?) less than 10%

5. Open house comment #5

- As a nearby resident I am strongly opposed to multiple family homes being built in our area. This area has been slowly improving over time and adding another apartment complex would derail this progress. It will decrease surrounding home values and negatively impact our schools.
- Our school district (Walled Lake) suffers because of the high amount of transient families living in the area. More apartments will contribute to our struggling high school. It doesn’t matter if these apartments are expensive. The families who rent will be transient and not invested in the long-term success of our schools. Owned units would be more appropriate.

6. Open house comment #6

- I am drastically opposed to having the “high end” apartments built. There are numerous apt buildings in the area. I am concerned that this will bring in transition families or individuals rather than true residents. When asked what the benefit to current residents are, the developer was silent and couldn’t supply any benefits. As a new Novi resident, (November 2014) in The Woods of Novi, at age of 31 about to start a family, I am hoping to see commercial or mix commercial with maybe a specialty grocery store be added to the community rather than apartments. –Darcy Donakowski

7. Open house comment #7

Opposed to one large rental community. Renters do no usually care about upkeep as well as property owners. How about a mixed community of owners and renters

8. Open house comment #8

- Don’t think we need 189 rental apartments in this area. I would favor mixed use or single family homes

9. Open house comment #9

I live in the Woods of Novi and while I believe the area is in need of more residential I do not believe it should be rental properties. There is a sector of the population within the Baby Boom Group that are looking for “transition” housing with main level master suites. Many of my neighbors are in the empty nester group and are looking for main level living. If they don’t find this option in the area,
where they would like to stay. They will move out of Nov where the transition housing options are available. I don’t believe Novi wants to lose its desirable citizens, but that will be the end result. The transition options could be more multilevel with spare bedrooms on the second level for family and guests, as long as the master suite is on the first floor. Thanks. -- John Hulyk  248-669-8286 (I am resident board member for the Homeowners’ Association of the Woods of Novi Subdivision.)

10. Open house comment #10

- I feel we can use a combo of residential and commercial use for local residents.

11. Open house comment #11

- I think that you should include a child care facility in the development.  --David Baratta

12. Open House Comment #12

- Mixed use development would be optimal in my opinion.
- More rental in this part of Novi, even $2000/mo rentals don’t seem necessary given the %age of current rental property.
- I would love to see mixed-use development similar to what Cherry Hill tried to be, with architectural consistency between commercial and residential.
- I fear an all commercial development would end up being a strip mall.
- Distinguish Novi with the uniqueness

13. Open house comment #13

- We already have so many rentals in our area. However, a mixed-use development would sure add so much to our area. Thanks for allowing this input and don’t be fooled by developers.  --Joan Koeppen

14. Open house comment #14

- I would prefer mixed use in this area. The “high end” development would bring too much congestion to the area.
- Mixed use with possibly some open area for a small park would be ideal.
- I am strongly opposed to building apartment at this site. There are already multiple apartments in this area.

15. Open house comment #15

- This section of the city already has a large renter population. More than half at 54%. We do not need more renters.
- A subdivision of higher valued single-family homes will increase surrounding property values, thus increasing tax revenue.
- What does more transients and “temporary” living do to our schools?
• Mixed use might work but what draws residents to the area? They can’t walk to anything (restaurants, bars, shops) as it stands now. This will be another failed attempt just like Main Street.

• Single family homes with a higher price tag will improve the median HH income which is currently well below city median.

• Park and recreation in this space is preferred to draw more people into the area and fill the vacancies that already exist.

• Let’s bring single family homes in to make Novi, 48377 area, a better family environment as opposed to the 48% of single person households.

• I am against any level of rented dwellings add to the city. We have enough.

16. Open house comment #16
• Do not mind a housing development, however, would prefer possible high end condos or single family. (Too many rentals in the area) --Sam Lot 7 Vistas

17. Open house comment #17
• I would like to see that land developed – supermarket & residential. The supermarket should be high end (not like Walmart).

• I would like to see all the roads improved ... Holmes Rd., 13 Mile Road and Novi Road.

18. Open house comment #18
• The area in discussion has much apartment already. I am against the addition of more apts. Especially feel it affects our school district (W. Lake) of residents of northern Novi.

• Concern of what happens if apt units are not filled. Strongly opposed to idea of apartments for 13/Novi land. Would prefer mixed development; however concerned that other areas of Novi – “Main Street” has not been able to strive. Concerned that this will be the same case. Mixed use is the lesser of the evils.

• No more rental properties should be added to this area.

19. Open house comment #19
• I would like this area to become a natural area for the public. The city lost a lot of park area as a result of the lawsuit and this is an ideal way to get it back.

• Novi need to balance its building and development plans with some green areas that improve the quality of life. Thank you.

20. Open house comment #20
• Concern: is just more apartments. Single family side-condo or homes is much more desirable. I would be open for mixed use such as “story board” with retail & apartment style condos.
21. Open house comment #21
- Please stop the building and reserve land for a park. Think about the wildlife!! We are being selfish & money hungry!

22. Open house comment #22
- What is the market on high end rentals?
- What might be the effect on property values at Tollgate Ravines?
- Would prefer to see high end single family homes.
- Could price of the proposed units vary to a lower limit than proposed, thereby, lowering the existing property values, eg. Tollgate Ravines? ie. Below the $2000 min.

23. Open house comment #23
- Mixed use seems best use and should include residency, park. & commercial (coffee shop, yogurt, etc – not chains).

24. Open house comment #24
- No multi-family dwelling. Mixed use only with dedicated park space!

25. Open house comment #25
- I have no problems with a mixed type of development, but I do feel a good portion of the development should be commercial. I live in Meadowbrook Townhomes less than ½ mile from the area in question. We do not have a grocery store within 2 miles – the closest Kroger is 12 Mile & Halsted. I do think having some restaurants in walking distance can help promote a healthier lifestyle – increasing walking or biking to the area.
- If residential units are built, there should at least be some that allow option to purchase. Thanks.

26. Open house comment #26
- The apartments would be better than commercial, not mixed use. --Mark Adams

27. Open house comment #27
- We live in the neighborhood in front of the land. Ideas we thought would be:
  - Grocery store – Kroger & Meijer are 15 minutes away
  - Community pool for surrounding neighborhoods.
- Nothing that would bring too much traffic.

28. Open house comment #28
- Would like a community pool
- Would like a grocery store. Others are far away in each direction.
Email comments:

1. I'm a home owner in Novi (sub: Novi Woods), and I just learned the proposed plan to build and apartment complex in the land located in 13 mile and Novi Rd. I think that land would be better used, if single family homes are built there. Please consider the opinion of the residents of the city, when deciding on this important subject. Regards, Omar Guzman

2. I'm a resident of Novi, Mi and we live at 13 mile and Novi Rd. This is right where there is a new proposed land development of rental properties by a developer or potential commercial use. We have a young family of four plus paws and feel that with our wonderful community being very residential and family oriented, that this property should be used for permanent single family homeowners versus rentals. We care for our beautiful and safe community and want it to stay this way. Homeowners have more stake and concern along with responsibility versus a one year rental tenant. Also, please do not allow more commercial properties to go up there. We would like to keep any feel of a peaceful residential community left without over-saturating our area with strip malls, office buildings, store/business fronts which could change the last bit of quaintness we may have. Another option for this land could be a functional community shared space such as walking trails, tennis courts, basketball courts, community pool etc., that the north end of Novi could greatly benefit from.

   Thank you listening to our concern and voicing our opinion and thoughts for us and the community we love! --Angie Savani

3. I attended the Open House regarding the 21acre vacant parcel of land at 13 Mile Road and Novi Road. I submitted a lengthy comment indicating I agreed with residential use, but not in favor of rental property. I also mentioned the need for "transitional" housing for empty nesters. I didn’t think to put my name or phone number on the comment sheet, so I thought I would email that information in case anybody wishes to discuss it further. --John Hulyk 248-669-8286. (I am resident board member for the Homeowners’ Association of the Woods of Novi Subdivision.)
Ms. McBeth:

Hello, my name is Paul Mercier. I have been a Novi resident for just over one year, and my wife and I live with our 2 ½-year-old son (with one on the way) in the Woods of Novi neighborhood just north of 13 Mile. We moved to Novi from the east side of Livonia because we were seeking a safer, more welcoming community for our growing family. Unfortunately, my wife and I were unable to attend the recent open house in regard to the undeveloped land south of 13 Mile on Novi Rd. My wife is a physician, and I am a high school teacher who coaches baseball, so our schedules prevented us from making it. However, I am writing this e-mail to express my displeasure with the proposed development ideas for the land, and to suggest some possible alternatives.

To start, the 189 multiple-family dwellings that have been proposed would be a bad idea. My wife and I, like the majority of our neighbors, bought our home for a few main reasons: proximity to the lake, high home values, and security. While proximity to the lake will not change, I fear that the latter two reasons could be negatively impacted with the addition of more rental units.

Currently, there are quite a few multi-family dwellings in the area with a transient population. It is within these communities that the majority of the crime within our nearby community takes place. Every year, at our annual neighborhood association meeting, a member of the Novi Police will report that, “Woods of Novi is a safe place with very little crime; the majority of our calls in this area are for break-ins or other crimes in the nearby apartments.” If this is true, which I assume it would be coming from a Novi officer, then adding another site with similar properties seems quite foolish. Furthermore, a simple Google search for reviews of the Singh properties on the same plot of land will reveal many unhappy residents who complain about the existing properties. Families want to feel secure in their homes, in their neighborhoods, and in the surrounding community; however, if a rise in crime occurs in a nearby development, those securities fade away quite quickly. The city spent a lot of money completing sidewalks for easier accessibility. That money will go to waste if citizens do not feel as safe walking, and even though the level of crime may not rise to a devastating level, perception is reality. If people perceive the properties to be unsafe, they will believe it, and avoid them.

Additionally, we paid a handsome sum for our home which was worth it to us because of the aforementioned reasons. Within the last year, the value of our home has only risen, and the investment we made into the local
community seems like a good one. However, adding more rental units to the area will surely only decrease our home’s value. The people looking to buy homes in a new community tend to be people around my age-range (I am 32). But, these people are looking for neighborhood homes that are built within a safe, welcoming, aesthetically-pleasing community. It is for these reasons that some of the neighboring cities to the west (South Lyon, New Hudson, Milford, and Brighton) are booming with newer homes and younger residents. Adding a multi-family dwelling will only bring more transient residents who care much less about the surrounding community.

Surely, I understand that the city would like to use the undeveloped land to make money; however, if not used properly, that area of the city could suffer greatly in the years following. Take note of the downslide in the schools and home values along Pontiac Trail in Wixom, or call our neighbors to the southeast in Livonia and Westland. The multi-family dwellings have impacted the communities in those cities negatively. I know, I was a 30-year-resident, and I work within those school systems.

Instead of the current proposal, I beg that the city consider other options. A development for single-family homes would be a welcomed proposal by many in the community. Novi was, and still is, a destination city for adults looking to move into a nice community. Tollgate Woods has resumed development; the city should consider selling to Singh, or a similar builder, to add single-family homes to the community.

Alternatively, if the city is reluctant to build more single-family homes, perhaps it should consider selling to a company to build commercial buildings with residential units attached. Buildings such as those in Downtown Plymouth or Walled Lake in which condos can be purchased atop of commercial ventures such as restaurants or stores which offer a more aesthetically-pleasing development which allows for both new residents and more options for current residents.

In sum, I understand that it makes sense, economically, to develop the land that is sitting unused. However, the city must look at the big picture and the future of the area. Adding more rental units would only attract residents who will stay for a short amount of time, with no real investment in the community. Allowing this to happen might just cause the current residents, who have made an investment in the community, to pack up and leave. I know that it would definitely be a consideration for my family.

I know that your job and the decisions you must make are not easy, so I thank your for taking the time to read this e-mail. Please consider the impact this may have on the CURRENT Novi residents.

Thank you,

Paul Mercier
Komaragiri, Sri

To: McBeth, Barb
Subject: RE: 13 and Novi Road development

From: Lacolla, Jennifer (jennifer) [mailto:jiacolla@med.umich.edu]
Sent: Tuesday, April 14, 2015 10:36 AM
To: McBeth, Barb
Cc: larry.hammons@gm.com
Subject: 13 and Novi Road development

Dear Ms. McBeth,

My husband, two children and I are current residents of the Woods of Novi neighborhood. We understand that there is a possibility of development of apartments on the land near 13 and Novi road. As residents of this area, we would like to voice our opinion that we adamantly do NOT wish to have the development of apartments/condominiums/mobile homes in this area. We would recommend either an adult playground/work-out area or a small neighborhood of single family homes or keep area commercial. Please take this into consideration.

Thank you for your time and attention.

Regards,

Larry and Jennifer Hammons
42753 Wimbleton Way
Novi, MI 48377

Ph. 586-709-9734 (Jennifer)
Ph. 419-343-8405 (Larry)

*****************************************************************************
Electronic Mail is not secure, may not be read every day, and should not be used for urgent or sensitive issues
To: McBeth, Barb  
Subject: RE: Development of land at 13 Mile and Novi Rd.

From: Brent [mailto:brntjns8@gmail.com]  
Sent: Tuesday, April 14, 2015 3:13 PM  
To: McBeth, Barb  
Subject: Development of land at 13 Mile and Novi Rd.

Mr. or Ms. McBeth,

I am a resident of the Woods of Novi sub-division. I was not able to attend the open house regarding the use of the land south of 13 Mile and west of Novi Road, but I understand that an apartment complex is being considered for the land. I would like to express my objection to the use of the land for that purpose.

I would much rather see the land used to create some type of a park or recreational facility. Especially given the fact that we already have two large apartment complexes on 13 Mile west of Novi, and given the fact that undeveloped land at the intersection has been recently used to build both a large gas station and a pharmacy.

I hope and trust that the city will consider my concerns and wishes as well as those of several of my neighbors in our sub.

Thank you for your time, attention, and consideration.

Respectfully
Brent L. Jones
42723 Lancelot Ct.
Novi, Mi. 48377
248-420-5875
Hello,

I live in the Vista Hills subdivision off Novi Road, b/w 12 and 13 mile roads.

Been here for over 10 years and absolutely love it, and the city as well.

One of the best things is that the mall is close by, but once we are north of 12 mile, the traffic volumes comes down and it is very pleasant for walks and the overall ambiance is excellent. The RiteAid built a few years ago and the gas station have provided convenience without any impact to the ambiance.

If the City of Novi does want to utilize the large land available, it would be preferred to be used for low traffic establishments. Single-Family homes would be the best choice (would generate revenue for the city), or perhaps a park/track (tennis courts would be great!). An apartment complex would make this location too crowded. While it may generate more revenue for the city, an apartment complex would impact the peace and quite of the area.

Thanks.

Regards,
Srinivas
Good Morning Barbara,

I attended the civic center meeting regarding the current proposal for the "high end" rental apartments. I am a new resident to Novi in the Woods of Novi subdivision. My husband and I are in our early 30s and looking to start a family as we just purchased our forever home. There are many negatives to having some many rental communities within the city limits. Many people who move into a rental are within a transition period of their life. There are multiple rental homes in that location that are now outweighing the single family home population. My other concern is the demographic this type of development will bring into the city of Novi and the Walled Lake School District. When I asked the developer what the cost of the "high end" rental will be he indicated $2000.00 a month. With a follow up of "what happens when you can not rent these for $2000.00 a month?" He was unable to answer. $2000.00 a month is more than my current mortgage with taxes and insurance within the subdivision of Woods of Novi. Although the developer stated the market study shows that the need is there for this type of development and would be supported at the $2000.00 a month rental I just personal feel this isn't the best choice for the city. My mother is in her 60s and near retirement and would never image to increase a rental payment to 2000.00 a month while in retirement. The developer stated he was looking to grab the individual in their 20s who do not want home ownership and those in retirement looking to downsize. I am not aware of any 20 year old that would be able to spend 2000 a month. I also asked if he was to keep the zone commercial would he be willing to put a Trader Joe, Whole Foods, or another grocery store. He stated that no grocery store wants to go into that area. I would like to know what type of proof he has that no grocery store is interested in that property. We have no grocery stores that close to us with out having to cross over an expressway. I then asked the developer what if any was the benefit to the current residents in and near this area. His response was silence.

I am really hopeful that the city will listen to their current residents and take our concerns into consideration when bringing another possible rental community to the city rather than single family homes. With mortgage rates at their lowest in many years this is a great opportunity for home ownership where younger families can make Novi their forever home.

Please take our voice into consideration when reviewing his current proposal.

Thank you for your time in this matter,
Darcy Donakowski 29752 English Way Novi, MI
734-231-9018.
I am a resident of the Vista Hills subdivision at 12&1/2 mile and Novi roads and am writing to voice my concern about the proposed apartment complex that could potentially be built on vacant land along Novi Road, south of 13 Mile road.

Adding another large, multi-family complex to an area that already has several large multi-family complexes just to the north and east of there will add significant traffic to an area that is already very congested and with extremely poor road conditions (Novi Road is in terrible condition between 12 and 13 mile roads). This additional traffic will only worsen the existing problems.

Also, the addition of another large apartment complex will increase the transient nature of the surrounding area, significantly altering the makeup of the overall neighborhood.

I am not opposed to development of this site and respect the rights of the property owners to do so.

However, I believe that a large apartment complex is not the best use of that site - single family housing would be a much better overall fit for the area from an economic and demographic perspective.

Sincerely

Don Goshorn
28707 Stonewall Ct.
Novi, Michigan 48377
I would like to see a skateboard park, soccer field, ball diamond, and an amphitheater, possibly a section for a small dog park, and a playground. Not another apartment complex or condos.

Jim and Kerry Wittman
To: McBeth, Barb
Subject: RE: 13 mile and novi development

-----Original Message-----
From: Mandi [mailto:mandisokana@gmail.com]
Sent: Tuesday, April 14, 2015 8:50 PM
To: McBeth, Barb
Subject: 13 mile and novi development

Ms. McBeth,

My family has recently moved to Novi and love the area. We became aware yesterday of the city's plan to add an apartment complex in the area of 13 and novi. We strongly oppose this and feel the land should be used for either residential homes or possible a park for our kids to play in or something of that nature. I do not support an apartment complex at all and don't think it is in the city's best interests.

Thank you for your time.
Mandi Sokana
Woods of Novi

Sent from my iPhone
Dear Barbara,

I am writing to express my deep concern about the proposed apartment complex at 13 Mile and Novi Road. I live in the Woods of Novi subdivision at that intersection and as a resident of the area, I believe another apartment complex would be a blow to our area. My kids attend school in the district and we already have a problem with transient families coming through the schools with very little investment in long-term education. This has been starting to turn around with the development of more single family homes near us, but adding more apartments will hurt the progress we have made.

Also, the home buying market has finally started to turn around in our area. Another large apartment complex nearby will have a negative impact on our home values. We already have a large rental complex at the intersection of 13 Mile and Novi Road. Another one is the last thing we need.

Commercial use would be much more appropriate for this land. We do not have a convenient grocery store in the area and that is what we need. I understand that the developer has not had any luck in attracting a grocery store to that land but if he is patient it will happen. With new home development happening all over our area a grocery store is bound to see the value of that space in the near future.

My second preference would be for single family homes or the proposed mixed use of the space with condos for sale rather than apartments for rent, with retail space below. This is also a good idea.

Thank you for your consideration. Please think about the long term affects to our area when making your decision.

Brian Kasal
248-207-8254
Komaragiri, Sri

To: McBeth, Barb
Subject: RE: Land Development at Novi and 13 Mile Road

From: Emily [mailto:emilylark@gmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, April 15, 2015 8:24 AM
To: McBeth, Barb
Subject: Land Development at Novi and 13 Mile Road

Dear Barbara,

As a resident of the Woods of Novi Subdivision at 13 Mile and Novi Road, I am writing to oppose the apartment complex that has been proposed for the land just south of our intersection. Our area has been slowly improving over the past few years and our schools are right on the brink of becoming more successful. If you add a large rental complex will will have an influx of more transient families to our area and the problems that we currently face in our Walled Lake schools will be exasperated.

The northern section of Novi has been struggling to keep up with the success of the southern part of Novi. We have been making great progress over the past few years. Please do not derail the long-term success of our area for a short-term financial gain. I believe the city as a whole will benefit more long-term by using this land for commercial use or for single family homes. I also believe that the proposed mixed use buildings (with retail space below and living spaces above) would be a much better idea than an apartment complex.

Thank you for your consideration.

Emily Kasal
42528 Wimbleton Way
Novi, MI 48377
248-770-0144
Hello,

I am a resident of Vista Hills subdivision at Novi rd and Old Novi rd in Novi. I understand that there are plans to develop the land just south of 13 mile on Novi Rd.

This is a very beautiful piece of land with water and woods. I'd like to express my preference, and the preference of the numerous Novi residents in the area, for the use of the land. Ideally, this could be converted into a park or nature preserve given the natural beauty of the land.

Alternatively, the land could be developed into additional single family homes. Given the number of and quality of residential homes in the area, an additional neighborhood would be well received.

Finally, a commercial development with stores that would compliment the gas station and pharmacy on the corner would be well received.

The worse case scenario would be a rental or condo complex as it would reduce the value of the homes in the area and provide little value for the current residents of the area.

Thank you and please keep me informed of any petitions or channels to voice our opinions.

Charles Mockridge
28748 Quarry Ct.,
Novi, MI 48377
To: McBeth, Barb  
Subject: RE: New apartments on 13 and Novi

-----Original Message-----
From: Michael Agrusa [mailto:michael.agrusa@gmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, April 15, 2015 9:10 AM
To: McBeth, Barb
Cc: Sheryl Agrusa
Subject: New apartments on 13 and Novi

Barbara,

My wife and I live in the Woods of Novi on 13 and Novi road. We understand there is consideration for new development on Novi road north of 13 mile next to the Sunshine Market. We also understand there is talk of building an apartment complex and we vehemently oppose the idea of the apartments. The area was originally zoned for commercial, if my home owners association information is correct, and has now been rezoned for residential. Why not add a new subdivision of nice homes instead?

We have lived in Novi for 14 years and the area has changed so much, I wish I could say it's improved but that is not the case. There are plenty of apartments in Novi, especially in that area. I have friends in the police department and I know crime has increased in the area and many of them say the apartments are a significant cause of the crime.

Our home owners association is prepared and willing to petition against the development of apartments.

We recently have made the decision to move our children to private schools. That was not an option for us 14 years ago.

PLEASE let us know how to get involved to help prevent this from happening.

Thank you.

Mike and Sheryl Agrusa
Hello Barbara,

I am a resident in Novi Woods homes and I was reviewing the proposed plan in the area. My first preference would be a commercial area with coffee shops and restaurants with sidewalks, playground and offices above. Something similar to downtown Northville where you can walk, grab something to eat and perhaps have a small park with a fountain where you can seat with a friend or or kids to play around.

The second preference would be to have residential homes, no apartment buildings.

Kind regards,

Markela Skenderi
I am completely against an apartment complex in the area South of 13 mi/East of Novi Road.

I suggest the following options, with this order of preference
1) adult playground/work-out area;
2) single family homes;
3) commercial.

Definitely no apartments/mobile homes/condos.

Thank you,

Prakash Kulkarni

42945 Brookstone Drive, Novi, MI 48377
I am writing to provide input regarding the planning area study mentioned above. I do not believe that this area is in need of any additional multi-family rental developments, unless that development is devoted to those 55 and over. There are already multi-family developments directly next to and across from this area being studied, I do not think the area needs more. Further, the area under study surrounds Walled Lake, which already has a very active young professional rental community.

As an individual who lives .5 mile away from the area, I would rather see mixed use if the area cannot support more retail development of 100% of the area. We are desperately in need of a grocery store in the area, as all stores are located at least 3 miles away. The assisted living center located nearby seems to have done very well and the addition of owned or rental senior living centers would not put additional pressure on nearby schools. Further, the major growing sector in the US currently is the medical sector. There are very few medical office buildings located in the area under study.

The demographics and trends provided look very slanted to favor the developer's desires. While the demographics of 48377 may differ from those of 48375, that does not mean that those of us living in 48377 wish to see those demographic changes continue to grow in the direction the developer would wish. I do not believe that exacerbating these differences in demographics will increase property values in the area or improve the lives of those that have already settled here. It seems that it will only improve the lining in the pockets of the developer.

Regards,
Kimberlee Levy, JD