130409. txt

1 REGULAR MEETING - ZONING BOARD OF APPEALS 2 CITY OF NOVI Tuesday, April 9, 2013 3 4 Proceedings taken in the matter of the ZONING BOARD OF 5 6 APPEALS, at City of Novi, 45175 West Ten Mile Road, Novi, 7 Michigan, on Tuesday, April 9, 2013 8 BOARD MEMBERS 9 David Ghannam, Acting Chairman 10 Linda Krieger 11 Jeffrey Gedeon 12 Brent Ferrell 13 James Gerblick 14 Mav Sanghvi 15 ALSO PRESENT: Charles Boulard, Building Official 16 Beth Saarela, City Attorney 17 Coordinator: Angel a Pawlowski, Recording Secretary 18 19 REPORTED BY: Jennifer L. Wall, Certified Shorthand Reporter 20 21 22 23 24 25 2 1 **I**NDEX 2 Case No. Page 8 3 PZ-13-0013

Page 1

Ŷ

4	130409. txt PZ-13-0015 24
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
1	Novi, Michigan.
2	Tuesday, April 9, 2013
3	7:00 p.m.
4	** ** **
5	MS. KRIEGER: Call to order the
6	April Zoning Board of Appeals for the regular
7	meeting scheduled Tuesday, April 9, 7:00 p.m.
8	In the absence of our chair, I'd

Page 2

9	130409.txt like to call for an alternate chair to
10	function. If anyone would be interested.
11	MR. SANGHVI: May I proposed
12	Mr. Ghannam's name.
13	MR. GERBLICK: I will second
14	that.
15	MS. KRIEGER: We have a motion on
16	the table. All in favor for Member Ghannam
17	to act as chair.
18	THE BOARD: Aye.
19	CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: Welcome to the
20	Zoning Board meeting.
21	First thing we are going to do is
22	the Pledge of Allegiance. If everybody would
23	please stand.
24	(Pledge of Allegiance recited.)
25	CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: First is the
1	roll call, so Ms. Pawlowski, can you please
2	call the roll.
3	MS. PAWLOWSKI: Member Gedeon?
4	MR. GEDEON: Here.
5	MS. PAWLOWSKI: Member Gerblick?
6	MR. GERBLICK: Here.
7	MS. PAWLOWSKI: Member Ghannam?
8	CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: Here.
9	MS. PAWLOWSKI: Chairman Ibe is
10	absent excused.
11	Member Krieger?
12	MS. KRIEGER: Here.
13	MS. PAWLOWSKI: Member Sanghvi?
	Page 3

14	130409.txt MR. SANGHVI: Here.
15	MS. PAWLOWSKI: Member Skelcy is
16	absent.
17	Member Ferrell?
18	MR. FERRELL: Here.
19	CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: Next we as
20	you can tell, we have a six members here. It
21	is not a full board, but we will have six
22	members here deciding your case.
23	The rules are in the back, if
24	anybody is interested in reading them. I'll
25	go over a few of them.
1	When you're called to the podium
2	
2	for your case, please approach, make sure the
	microphone is on and you speak to the
4	microphone, and spell your name and state
5	your name very clearly for our record.
6	If anybody has any cellphones or
7	pagers, please turn them on silent or off so
8	it's not disruptive.
9	At this point, we are going to
10	approve, or at least consider the agenda. Is
11	there any other changes to the agenda other
12	than what's stated?
13	MS. PAWLOWSKI: Yes, there are.

Ŷ

18

13MS. PAWLOWSKI: Yes, there are.14No. PZ13-0014, has been asked to be postponed15until the May 14th meeting.

16CHAI RMAN GHANNAM: Okay. And do17we need a motion to adjourn that?

MS. SAARELA: You can do a

Page 4

	130409. txt
19	motion.
20	CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: Can we do a
21	voice vote on that?
22	MS. SAARELA: You can.
23	CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: All in favor
24	of first of all, I'd like to entertain a
25	motion to adjourn Case PZ13-0013 (sic.) to
1	the next meeting in May.
•	the next meeting in may.
2	MR. SANGHVI: So moved.

3 MS. KRI EGER: Second. 4 CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: All in favor 5 say aye. THE BOARD: Aye. 6 7 CHAI RMAN GHANNAM: Any opposed? 8 (No audible responses.) CHAI RMAN GHANNAM: 9 Seeing none, that particular case has been adjourned for 10 one month, until the May meeting. 11 Any other changes to the agenda? 12 13 MS. PAWLOWSKI: No. 14 CHAI RMAN GHANNAM: With change, I entertain a motion to approve the agenda as 15 16 amended. 17 MR. SANGHVI: So moved. MR. GERBLICK: 18 Second. 19 CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: All in favor 20 say aye. 21 THE BOARD: Aye. 22 CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: Any opposed?

(No audible responses.)

23

Page 5

24	130409.txt CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: Seeing none
25	our agenda is approved.
1	And we will go to the minutes
	And we will go to the minutes.
2	What we have in our packets is the minutes
3	for the February 12, 2013 meeting.
4	We will consider that at this
5	point.
6	Is there any changes to that
7	particular minutes or transcript? Anybody?
8	(No audi ble responses.)
9	CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: If there is
10	none, I will entertain a motion to approve
11	the February 12, 2013 minutes.
12	MR. GERBLICK: So moved.
13	MS. KRI EGER: Second.
14	CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: All in favor
15	of approving those minutes say aye.
16	THE BOARD: Aye.
17	CHAI RMAN GHANNAM: Any opposed?
18	(No audi bl e responses.)
19	Seeing none, these minutes are
20	approved.
21	CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: And we will
22	move onto our first item for this evening.
23	Case No. PZ13-0014 (sic.) for
24	26401 Novi Road, Odoba Mexican Grill. Is

f

25

8

1	sir.	That's No.	14.	We ta	abl ed	13,	isn't
2	that	accurate? Pa	Wejus age6	st tal	oled N	No. ²	13?

that applicant here? Please step forward,

Ŷ

3	MR. BOULARD: It was PZ13-0014.
4	MR. GERBLICK: That's the one.
5	So we go to the next one.
6	CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: I apologize.
7	My apologies.
8	Number one has been adjourned.
9	So it's Case No. PZ13-0015, 21050 Haggerty
10	Road, McDonal d's.
11	Sir, please step forward. State
12	your name for the record.
13	MR. MARTIN: My name is Frank!
14	Martin, M-a-r-t-i-n. I'm the architect for
15	McDonald's with Dorchin, Martin Associates.
16	CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: Please raise
17	your hand and be sworn by our secretary.
18	MS. KRIEGER: In Case No.
19	PZ13-0015, do you swear or affirm to tell the
20	truth?
21	MR. MARTIN: I do.
22	CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: Please
23	proceed, sir.
24	MR. MARTIN: McDonald's has gone
25	through the preliminary site plan approval
1	process to rebuild an existing McDonald's
2	restaurant that's on Haggerty Road.
3	McDonal d's restaurant has been
4	there probably 30 years, and this one has
5	been scheduled to be reconstructed, which
6	means essentially raise the building and put
7	
1	one of the newer buildings on. Page 7

8	So we developed a site plan and
9	presented it to the planning department and
10	went before the planning commission.
11	This particular important
12	thing is that this particular McDonald's is
13	going to be a lead building, it will be only
14	the third lead building that McDonald's will
15	have in the United States, which is a company
16	owned store.
17	So everyone is very excited about
18	the opportunity of having that lead building
19	and having it in Novi. We are working with
20	the planning department relative to materials
21	that meet lead requirements, and we, l
22	believe, have that all resolved, so we are
23	preparing to go for final site plan approval.
24	The two issues that we are faced
25	with in terms of our ZBA request are, number
1	one, the location of the trash corral.
2	As you saw in your packet, the
3	trash corral, by ordinance, is to be located
4	in the rear yard.
5	We have a 40 feet wide M.D.O.T.
6	utility easement that runs the very back of
7	our property. You have, I think, a site
8	plan. I also can put on the can I put
9	something
10	CHAI RMAN GHANNAM: You can.
11	MR. MARTIN: As you can see at
12	the rear of the property, the 40 foot line is Page 8

13	right here (indicating).
14	I have positioned our trash
15	corral in the upper right-hand corner, as
16	close to that 40-foot line as I could
17	probably locate it and not interfere with a
18	parking space. In fact, the trash corral is
19	behind the building.
20	As you can see, the location of
21	the building, we positioned it to the rear
22	of it is as far back as possible, it
23	happens to be in a side yard, and we have
24	nowhere else to put that particular trash
25	corral.

11

1	The present trash corral in the
2	existing McDonald's also is located missing
3	that particular easement, which is most
4	likely because of that having been a
5	requirement, so that is our first that is
6	our first request, is to be granted that as a
7	hardship simply because we have nowhere else
8	to put it on the site and this is as far back
9	as we can possibly place it.
10	That particular trash corral as
11	all the trash corrals that we are involved
12	with with McDonald's will be a masonry, a
13	brick trash corral that will match the
14	building. It will have gates on it, and it
15	will, I think, be in a position that will not
16	be an objection in terms of traveling down
17	Haggerty Road. Page 9

18 The second item that we have is 19 the loading zone being located in the front 20 yard. I'm going to point to where that would 21 be (indicating). 22 That loading zone is kind of a duel function zone. It's acting as part of 23 24 our stacking, for our double drive-thru, we have a side-by-side drive-thru. 25 That side-by-side drive-thru, if you haven't been 1 2 through one of these in the newer stores, it's actually two ordering positions that 3 start with one lane spread around, order and 4 then come together to pay. 5 This is a much more efficient way 6 7 of handling the guests at the McDonald's. 8 Majority of McDonald's business is through 9 the drive-thru, so this is an important 10 feature. 11 The loading zone that the 12 drive-thru stacking utilizes also is used by 13 the delivery truck to deliver to the site three times a week. There are three 14 deliveries a week to the McDonald's that last 15 16 about 45 minutes each. And at this particular store, since this is -- there is 17 an existing store there, the deliveries occur 18 19 at 2:00 to 3:00 in the morning. 20 So essentially the loading and --21 the loading of the store with goods and only 22 one truck comes that delivers everything but Page 10

4

23	buns, so to speak. They come on pallets,
24	they're having a new delivery system which is
25	palletized. The delivery driver brings the
1	pallets within the store, and then the crew
2	takes them apart. That's why the truck is
3	only there about 45 minutes.
4	So in terms of the loading zone,
5	compared to a loading zone with a factory or
6	a distribution plant, where trucks are
7	constantly coming and going throughout the
8	day, this is three times a week for 45
9	minutes, in hours that are not prime time.
10	The fact that we have a the
11	side-by-side located at the end of this
12	loading zone, allows that drive-thru lane on
13	the outside, this one, to be utilized even if
14	the truck is there and someone utilizes the
15	drive-thru, because this is 24 hour
16	dri ve-thru.
17	So typically the McDonald's
18	buildings, as you know, are located on the
19	site perpendicular to the road, but because
20	of the site configuration here, and the
21	effectiveness and the design of the
22	side-by-side, it was impossible to make that
23	work on this site, so we have to have this
24	particular design.
25	I brought along a photograph of a

f

Ŷ

14

	130409. txt
1	similar building. That particular photograph
2	is of the non-drive-thru side. And I'II
3	point out where the loading zone is here
4	(indicating). And that is essentially the
5	loading zone and the stacking lane.
6	The delivery doors, two man doors
7	that are one going into the freezer cooler
8	and the other one goes into the dry storage
9	area.
10	And I have more of these photos,
11	if you need a closeup of them, but I'd love
12	to answer any questions, if you have any.
13	CHAI RMAN GHANNAM: Thank you,
14	sir. One thing I forgot is if there is
15	anybody in the audience who would like to
16	make a public comment on a case that's not
17	pending before the board tonight, is there
18	anybody who would like to make any comment?
19	(No audi bl e responses.)
20	CHAI RMAN GHANNAM: Seeing none,
21	I'll close that portion.
22	Now I'm going to ask if there
23	anybody who has a public comment on this
24	particular case. If so, please raise your
25	hand.
1	(No audi bl e responses.)
2	CHAI RMAN GHANNAM: Seeing none,
3	then I will close the public remarks section
4	on this case.
5	I'll just ask our secretary to
-	

Page 12

15

Ŷ

	130409. txt
6	read any correspondence into the record.
7	MS. KRIEGER: In Case No.
8	PZ13-0015, 14 were mailed, zero returned.
9	That's it.
10	CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: Any comments?
11	MR. MARTIN: I'm going to make
12	if I could, a McDonald's construction
13	engineer is here to answer any pertinent
14	questions about the McDonald's.
15	CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: I appreciate
16	that. Thank you, sir.
17	Is there any comments or
18	questions by the city?
19	MS. SAARELA: I have none.
20	MR. BOULARD: I'll just stand by
21	for questions.
22	CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: I'II now open
23	it up to the board for discussion, if anybody
24	has any questions or comments?
25	Member Sanghvi?
1	MR. SANGHVI: What kind of
2	traffic do you expect at 2:00 a.m. over
3	there?
4	MR. KAZARIAN: My name is
5	Mi chael! Kazari an, K-a-z-a-r-i -a-n.
6	CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: Raise your

f

7

8

9

10

16

Page 13

truth?

hand and be sworn by our secretary.

MS. KRIEGER: In Case No.

PZ13-0015, do you swear or affirm to tell the

11	130409.txt MR. KAZARIAN: I do.	
12	And the question was, what kind	
13	of traffic do we expect at 2:00?	
14	MR. SANGHVI: What kind of	
15	traffic do you expect to have at 2:00 when	
16	you are going to have the loading going on?	
17	MR. KAZARIAN: Just for the	
18	record, we will try and push that actually.	
19	Sometimes it shows up at 3:00, so we do get	
20	some traffic, trails in about somewhere	
21	between 12:00 and 2:00, 12:00 and 1:30, which	
22	is why we typically push our deliveries	
23	closer to the 3:00 mark.	
24	We are looking for a percentage	
25	of traffic based on a 24 hour period. I	
		17
1	don't have that kind of data.	
1 2	don't have that kind of data. As Mr. Martin had mentioned, I'm	
2	As Mr. Martin had mentioned, I'm	
2 3	As Mr. Martin had mentioned, I'm on the construction side, but certainly the	
2 3 4	As Mr. Martin had mentioned, I'm on the construction side, but certainly the majority, as Mr. Martin mentioned, 72 percent	
2 3 4 5	As Mr. Martin had mentioned, I'm on the construction side, but certainly the majority, as Mr. Martin mentioned, 72 percent of our business goes to the drive-thru. And	
2 3 4 5 6	As Mr. Martin had mentioned, I'm on the construction side, but certainly the majority, as Mr. Martin mentioned, 72 percent of our business goes to the drive-thru. And typically at a McDonald's probably 94 percent	
2 3 4 5 6 7	As Mr. Martin had mentioned, I'm on the construction side, but certainly the majority, as Mr. Martin mentioned, 72 percent of our business goes to the drive-thru. And typically at a McDonald's probably 94 percent of our business is somewhere between	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	As Mr. Martin had mentioned, I'm on the construction side, but certainly the majority, as Mr. Martin mentioned, 72 percent of our business goes to the drive-thru. And typically at a McDonald's probably 94 percent of our business is somewhere between breakfast and dinner, so we do get some late	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	As Mr. Martin had mentioned, I'm on the construction side, but certainly the majority, as Mr. Martin mentioned, 72 percent of our business goes to the drive-thru. And typically at a McDonald's probably 94 percent of our business is somewhere between breakfast and dinner, so we do get some late hour customers, it's more of a convenience	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	As Mr. Martin had mentioned, I'm on the construction side, but certainly the majority, as Mr. Martin mentioned, 72 percent of our business goes to the drive-thru. And typically at a McDonald's probably 94 percent of our business is somewhere between breakfast and dinner, so we do get some late hour customers, it's more of a convenience thing, more than anything else.	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	As Mr. Martin had mentioned, I'm on the construction side, but certainly the majority, as Mr. Martin mentioned, 72 percent of our business goes to the drive-thru. And typically at a McDonald's probably 94 percent of our business is somewhere between breakfast and dinner, so we do get some late hour customers, it's more of a convenience thing, more than anything else. MR. SANGHVI: Thank you, sir.	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	As Mr. Martin had mentioned, I'm on the construction side, but certainly the majority, as Mr. Martin mentioned, 72 percent of our business goes to the drive-thru. And typically at a McDonald's probably 94 percent of our business is somewhere between breakfast and dinner, so we do get some late hour customers, it's more of a convenience thing, more than anything else. MR. SANGHVI: Thank you, sir. CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: Anybody else?	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	As Mr. Martin had mentioned, I'm on the construction side, but certainly the majority, as Mr. Martin mentioned, 72 percent of our business goes to the drive-thru. And typically at a McDonald's probably 94 percent of our business is somewhere between breakfast and dinner, so we do get some late hour customers, it's more of a convenience thing, more than anything else. MR. SANGHVI: Thank you, sir. CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: Anybody else? Member Krieger?	

130409. txt there ever been any issues? It looks like 16 they're renovated, so either one of you could 17 speak to that. It looks like there has not 18 19 been any -- every time I have been through there, so I don't really have an issue with 20 21 the site. 22 MR. KAZARIAN: The Novi 23 McDonald's at Twelve Oaks Mall was rebuilt 24 actually. We tore that one down and rebuilt 25 that one. I don't -- that was probably close 1 to three years ago, three years ago now. 2 Could be maybe four. 3 At any rate, to answer your question with regards to issues, the only 4 issue, which isn't necessarily an operational 5 issue that we have there, is similar to this 6 7 site, that site was not deep enough to have 8 the side-by-side drive-thru. So actually at 9 that location, we have what we call a tandem, 10 so it's still two order points, but one car is in front of the next. We don't recommend 11 Sometimes, we have to, based on site 12 that. 13 constraints, but with regard to the site 14 circulation and operations during deliveries 15 and things like that, I had not experienced 16 any issues there. 17 I haven't really heard of We haven't received any letters 18 anythi ng. 19 from the city with regards to problems on the site, you know, as far as lunchtime -- when 20

f

130409. txt 21 it's associated with deliveries. You know, I 22 can't tell you what kind of traffic it gets 23 during the lunch period. I don't know what 24 time they get their deliveries. 25 All I can tell you is we don't 1 know of any issues that we have had out 2 there. 3 MS. KRI EGER: Thank you. 4 CHAI RMAN GHANNAM: Member 5 Ferrel I? MR. FERRELL: Had a question, the 6 7 whole inside, is it going to be reconfigured 8 or is it going to be similar to how the store 9 is now? MR. KAZARI AN: 10 The building 11 itself is actually -- this particular site is 12 not a remodel. This will be torn down and completely be rebuilt. 13 14 MR. FERRELL: From ground up? 15 MR. KAZARIAN: From ground up. This site currently sits facing the existing 16 17 McDonald's. This site, as you can see, the 18 existing building is more of a square. The 19 floor plan that you received, that we are 20 proposing is more of a rectangle, so this 21 particular building as it sits today, faces 22 Haggerty. 23 We are basically going to be rotating the building, but essentially to 24 25 answer your question, the entire building is

19

f

Ŷ

1	going to be torn down. We will have new
2	footings, new site engineering, new store,
3	basically all the plumbing, electrical,
4	everything is going to be brand new. We are
5	starting basically fresh.
6	MR. FERRELL: I'm okay with the
7	trash corrals where they're at.
8	Just a question with the loading
9	zone. How come it couldn't be configured to
10	have it in the back? Is there any particular
11	reason for that?
12	MR. KAZARIAN: It's more of how
13	the building itself sits. So in order to
14	rotate the loading zone to the other side,
15	the side that the loading zone is on,
16	obviously for ease of delivery, and in order
17	to get the delivery truck on and off, you
18	want the delivery zone unloading right there
19	where your doors are, so on that side of the
20	building, you may or may not see it. There
21	is a door there and a door there
22	(indicating). Those two doors, one goes
23	directly into our walk-in box, it's a
24	four-foot wide door, that goes directly into
25	the walk-in, the other one goes directly to
1	our dry storage area
1	our dry storage area.
2	So basically you're 10 feet from
3	the Loading zone.
4	In some cases, when we're in Page 17

Ŷ

6like we have, on occasion the loading zone7will be elsewhere in the lot, and they're8able to get pallet delivery and they can get9it across the parking lot.10In cases like Michigan, you know,11I mean we're dealing with weather, snow,12everything else, we can't get those pallets13across the parking lot.14In this case, if we had it15elsewhere in the parking lot, we may have16issues with the amount of parking spaces that17we could get on site, so the way it's set up18now, it's a dual like Mr. Martin said,19it's a dual use. It's being used not only as20a loading zone, but we are also when we21are not loading, using it as part of our22drive-thru lane.23MR. FERRELL: Thank you.24CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: Also in terms25of my comments, I have no problem with this1as you have proposed. We did something very2similar to the Taco Bell that's nearby you.3I know it was torn down, rebuilt, given the4space you have, you have new standards and so5forth, I know they needed some variances and6this seems to be pretty similar to that, so I7have no problem with this.8Anybody else have any comments or9questions?Page 18	5	warmer states, where they don't have weather
8able to get pallet delivery and they can get9it across the parking lot.10In cases like Michigan, you know,11I mean we're dealing with weather, snow,12everything else, we can't get those pallets13across the parking lot.14In this case, if we had it15elsewhere in the parking lot, we may have16issues with the amount of parking spaces that17we could get on site, so the way it's set up18now, it's a dual like Mr. Martin said,19it's a dual use. It's being used not only as20a loading zone, but we are also when we21are not loading, using it as part of our22drive-thru lane.23MR. FERELL: Thank you.24CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: Also in terms25of my comments, I have no problem with this1as you have proposed. We did something very2similar to the Taco Bell that's nearby you.3I know it was torn down, rebuilt, given the4space you have, you have new standards and so5forth, I know they needed some variances and6this seems to be pretty similar to that, so I7have no problem with this.8Anybody else have any comments or9questions?	6	like we have, on occasion the loading zone
9it across the parking lot.10In cases like Michigan, you know,11I mean we're dealing with weather, snow,12everything else, we can't get those pallets13across the parking lot.14In this case, if we had it15elsewhere in the parking lot, we may have16issues with the amount of parking spaces that17we could get on site, so the way it's set up18now, it's a dual like Mr. Martin said,19it's a dual use. It's being used not only as20a loading zone, but we are also when we21are not loading, using it as part of our22drive-thru lane.23MR. FERRELL: Thank you.24CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: Also in terms25of my comments, I have no problem with this1as you have proposed. We did something very2similar to the Taco Bell that's nearby you.3I know it was torn down, rebuilt, given the4space you have, you have new standards and so5forth, I know they needed some variances and6this seems to be pretty similar to that, so I7have no problem with this.8Anybody else have any comments or9questions?	7	will be elsewhere in the lot, and they're
10In cases like Michigan, you know,11I mean we're dealing with weather, snow,12everything else, we can't get those pallets13across the parking lot.14In this case, if we had it15elsewhere in the parking lot, we may have16issues with the amount of parking spaces that17we could get on site, so the way it's set up18now, it's a dual like Mr. Martin said,19it's a dual use. It's being used not only as20a loading zone, but we are also when we21are not loading, using it as part of our22drive-thru lane.23MR. FERRELL: Thank you.24CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: Also in terms25of my comments, I have no problem with this1as you have proposed. We did something very2similar to the Taco Bell that's nearby you.3I know it was torn down, rebuilt, given the4space you have, you have new standards and so5forth, I know they needed some variances and6this seems to be pretty similar to that, so I7have no problem with this.8Anybody else have any comments or9questions?	8	able to get pallet delivery and they can get
11I mean we're dealing with weather, snow,12everything else, we can't get those pallets13across the parking lot.14In this case, if we had it15elsewhere in the parking lot, we may have16issues with the amount of parking spaces that17we could get on site, so the way it's set up18now, it's a dual like Mr. Martin said,19it's a dual use. It's being used not only as20a loading zone, but we are also when we21are not loading, using it as part of our22drive-thru lane.23MR. FERRELL: Thank you.24CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: Also in terms25of my comments, I have no problem with this1as you have proposed. We did something very2similar to the Taco Bell that's nearby you.3I know it was torn down, rebuilt, given the4space you have, you have new standards and so5forth, I know they needed some variances and6this seems to be pretty similar to that, so I7have no problem with this.8Anybody else have any comments or9questions?	9	it across the parking lot.
12everything else, we can't get those pallets13across the parking lot.14In this case, if we had it15elsewhere in the parking lot, we may have16issues with the amount of parking spaces that17we could get on site, so the way it's set up18now, it's a dual like Mr. Martin said,19it's a dual use. It's being used not only as20a loading zone, but we are also when we21are not loading, using it as part of our22drive-thru lane.23MR. FERRELL: Thank you.24CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: Also in terms25of my comments, I have no problem with this1as you have proposed. We did something very2similar to the Taco Bell that's nearby you.3I know it was torn down, rebuilt, given the4space you have, you have new standards and so5forth, I know they needed some variances and6this seems to be pretty similar to that, so I7have no problem with this.8Anybody else have any comments or9questions?	10	In cases like Michigan, you know,
13across the parking lot.14In this case, if we had it15el sewhere in the parking lot, we may have16issues with the amount of parking spaces that17we could get on site, so the way it's set up18now, it's a dual like Mr. Martin said,19it's a dual use. It's being used not only as20a loading zone, but we are also when we21are not loading, using it as part of our22drive-thru lane.23MR. FERRELL: Thank you.24CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: Also in terms25of my comments, I have no problem with this1as you have proposed. We did something very2similar to the Taco Bell that's nearby you.3I know it was torn down, rebuilt, given the4space you have, you have new standards and so5forth, I know they needed some variances and6this seems to be pretty similar to that, so I7have no problem with this.8Anybody else have any comments or9questions?	11	I mean we're dealing with weather, snow,
14In this case, if we had it15el sewhere in the parking lot, we may have16issues with the amount of parking spaces that17we could get on site, so the way it's set up18now, it's a dual like Mr. Martin said,19it's a dual use. It's being used not only as20a loading zone, but we are also when we21are not loading, using it as part of our22drive-thru lane.23MR. FERRELL: Thank you.24CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: Also in terms25of my comments, I have no problem with this1as you have proposed. We did something very2similar to the Taco Bell that's nearby you.3I know it was torn down, rebuilt, given the4space you have, you have new standards and so5forth, I know they needed some variances and6this seems to be pretty similar to that, so I7have no problem with this.8Anybody else have any comments or9questions?	12	everything else, we can't get those pallets
15elsewhere in the parking lot, we may have16issues with the amount of parking spaces that17we could get on site, so the way it's set up18now, it's a dual like Mr. Martin said,19it's a dual use. It's being used not only as20a loading zone, but we are also when we21are not loading, using it as part of our22drive-thru lane.23MR. FERRELL: Thank you.24CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: Also in terms25of my comments, I have no problem with this1as you have proposed. We did something very2similar to the Taco Bell that's nearby you.3I know it was torn down, rebuilt, given the4space you have, you have new standards and so5forth, I know they needed some variances and6this seems to be pretty similar to that, so I7have no problem with this.8Anybody else have any comments or9questions?	13	across the parking lot.
16issues with the amount of parking spaces that17we could get on site, so the way it's set up18now, it's a dual like Mr. Martin said,19it's a dual use. It's being used not only as20a loading zone, but we are also when we21are not loading, using it as part of our22drive-thru lane.23MR. FERRELL: Thank you.24CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: Also in terms25of my comments, I have no problem with this1as you have proposed. We did something very2similar to the Taco Bell that's nearby you.3I know it was torn down, rebuilt, given the4space you have, you have new standards and so5forth, I know they needed some variances and6this seems to be pretty similar to that, so I7have no problem with this.8Anybody else have any comments or9questions?	14	In this case, if we had it
17we could get on site, so the way it's set up18now, it's a dual like Mr. Martin said,19it's a dual use. It's being used not only as20a loading zone, but we are also when we21are not loading, using it as part of our22drive-thru lane.23MR. FERRELL: Thank you.24CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: Also in terms25of my comments, I have no problem with this1as you have proposed. We did something very2similar to the Taco Bell that's nearby you.3I know it was torn down, rebuilt, given the4space you have, you have new standards and so5forth, I know they needed some variances and6this seems to be pretty similar to that, so I7have no problem with this.8Anybody else have any comments or9questions?	15	elsewhere in the parking lot, we may have
18now, it's a dual like Mr. Martin said,19it's a dual use. It's being used not only as20a loading zone, but we are also when we21are not loading, using it as part of our22drive-thru lane.23MR. FERRELL: Thank you.24CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: Also in terms25of my comments, I have no problem with this1as you have proposed. We did something very2similar to the Taco Bell that's nearby you.3I know it was torn down, rebuilt, given the4space you have, you have new standards and so5forth, I know they needed some variances and6this seems to be pretty similar to that, so I7have no problem with this.8Anybody else have any comments or9questions?	16	issues with the amount of parking spaces that
19it's a dual use. It's being used not only as20a loading zone, but we are also when we21are not loading, using it as part of our22drive-thru lane.23MR. FERRELL: Thank you.24CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: Also in terms25of my comments, I have no problem with this1as you have proposed. We did something very2similar to the Taco Bell that's nearby you.3I know it was torn down, rebuilt, given the4space you have, you have new standards and so5forth, I know they needed some variances and6this seems to be pretty similar to that, so I7have no problem with this.8Anybody else have any comments or9questions?	17	we could get on site, so the way it's set up
20a loading zone, but we are also when we are not loading, using it as part of our drive-thru lane.23MR. FERRELL: Thank you.24CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: Also in terms of my comments, I have no problem with this1as you have proposed. We did something very similar to the Taco Bell that's nearby you.3I know it was torn down, rebuilt, given the space you have, you have new standards and so forth, I know they needed some variances and this seems to be pretty similar to that, so I have no problem with this.8Anybody else have any comments or 9	18	now, it's a dual like Mr. Martin said,
21are not loading, using it as part of our22drive-thru lane.23MR. FERRELL: Thank you.24CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: Also in terms25of my comments, I have no problem with this1as you have proposed. We did something very2similar to the Taco Bell that's nearby you.3I know it was torn down, rebuilt, given the4space you have, you have new standards and so5forth, I know they needed some variances and6this seems to be pretty similar to that, so I7have no problem with this.8Anybody el se have any comments or9questions?	19	it's a dual use. It's being used not only as
22drive-thru lane.23MR. FERRELL: Thank you.24CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: Also in terms25of my comments, I have no problem with this1as you have proposed. We did something very2similar to the Taco Bell that's nearby you.3I know it was torn down, rebuilt, given the4space you have, you have new standards and so5forth, I know they needed some variances and6this seems to be pretty similar to that, so I7have no problem with this.8Anybody else have any comments or9questions?	20	a loading zone, but we are also when we
23MR. FERRELL: Thank you.24CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: Also in terms25of my comments, I have no problem with this1as you have proposed. We did something very2similar to the Taco Bell that's nearby you.3I know it was torn down, rebuilt, given the4space you have, you have new standards and so5forth, I know they needed some variances and6this seems to be pretty similar to that, so I7have no problem with this.8Anybody else have any comments or9questions?	21	are not loading, using it as part of our
CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: Also in terms of my comments, I have no problem with this as you have proposed. We did something very similar to the Taco Bell that's nearby you. I know it was torn down, rebuilt, given the space you have, you have new standards and so forth, I know they needed some variances and this seems to be pretty similar to that, so I have no problem with this. Anybody else have any comments or guestions?	22	drive-thru lane.
 of my comments, I have no problem with this as you have proposed. We did something very similar to the Taco Bell that's nearby you. I know it was torn down, rebuilt, given the space you have, you have new standards and so forth, I know they needed some variances and this seems to be pretty similar to that, so I have no problem with this. Anybody else have any comments or questions? 	23	MR. FERRELL: Thank you.
1as you have proposed. We did something very2similar to the Taco Bell that's nearby you.3I know it was torn down, rebuilt, given the4space you have, you have new standards and so5forth, I know they needed some variances and6this seems to be pretty similar to that, so I7have no problem with this.8Anybody else have any comments or9questions?	24	CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: Also in terms
 similar to the Taco Bell that's nearby you. I know it was torn down, rebuilt, given the space you have, you have new standards and so forth, I know they needed some variances and this seems to be pretty similar to that, so I have no problem with this. Anybody else have any comments or questions? 	25	of my comments, I have no problem with this
 similar to the Taco Bell that's nearby you. I know it was torn down, rebuilt, given the space you have, you have new standards and so forth, I know they needed some variances and this seems to be pretty similar to that, so I have no problem with this. Anybody else have any comments or questions? 		
 similar to the Taco Bell that's nearby you. I know it was torn down, rebuilt, given the space you have, you have new standards and so forth, I know they needed some variances and this seems to be pretty similar to that, so I have no problem with this. Anybody else have any comments or questions? 	1	as vou have proposed. We did something verv
 I know it was torn down, rebuilt, given the space you have, you have new standards and so forth, I know they needed some variances and this seems to be pretty similar to that, so I have no problem with this. Anybody else have any comments or questions? 	2	
 4 space you have, you have new standards and so 5 forth, I know they needed some variances and 6 this seems to be pretty similar to that, so I 7 have no problem with this. 8 Anybody else have any comments or 9 questions? 	3	
5 forth, I know they needed some variances and 6 this seems to be pretty similar to that, so I 7 have no problem with this. 8 Anybody else have any comments or 9 questions?	4	
 7 have no problem with this. 8 Anybody else have any comments or 9 questions? 	5	
8 Anybody else have any comments or 9 questions?	6	this seems to be pretty similar to that, so I
9 questions?	7	have no problem with this.
	8	Anybody else have any comments or
	9	

10	lf not, I will entertain a
11	motion.
12	Member Gerblick?
13	MR. GERBLICK: In Case No.
14	PZ13-0015, 21050 Haggerty Road, I move that
15	we approve the variances as requested, as
16	these variances, there are no unique
17	circumstances or physical conditions of the
18	property, such as narrowness, shallowness
19	there are unique circumstances, such as the
20	40 feet easement at the rear of the property.
21	In addition, these variances are
22	not self-created, strict compliance with
23	regulations governing setback, area, other
24	dimensional requirements will unreasonably
25	prevent the property owner from using the
1	property for a permitted purpose, or will
2	render conformity with those regulations
3	unnecessarily burdensome. Again, due to the
4	size and shape of the lot.
5	The requested variance is the
6	minimum variance necessary to do substantial
7	justice to the applicant, as well as other
8	property owners in the district.
9	The requested variance will not
10	cause an adverse impact to surrounding
11	properties, property values or the use and
12	enjoyment of the property in the neighborhood
13	or zoning district.
14	MR. SANGHVI: Second. Page 19

Ŷ

15	CHAI RMAN GHANNAM: Seeing a
16	motion and second, any further discussion?
17	(No audi bl e responses.)
18	CHAI RMAN GHANNAM: Seeing none,
19	Ms. Pawlowski, can you call the roll.
20	MS. PAWLOWSKI: Member Gedeon?
21	MR. GEDEON: Yes.
22	MS. PAWLOWSKI: Member Gerblick?
23	MR. GERBLICK: Yes.
24	MS. PAWLOWSKI: Chairman Ghannam?
25	CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: Yes.
1	
-	MS. PAWLOWSKI: Member Krieger?
2	MS. KRIEGER: Yes.
3	MS. PAWLOWSKI: Member Sanghvi?
4	MR. SANGHVI: Yes.
5	MS. PAWLOWSKI: Member Ferrell?
6	MR. FERRELL: Yes.
7	MS. PAWLOWSKI: Motion passes six
8	to zero.
9	CHAI RMAN GHANNAM:
10	Congratul ati ons.
11	MR. KAZARIAN: Thank you very
12	much.
13	MR. MARTIN: Thank you.
14	CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: Next on the
15	agenda is item number three, Case No.
16	PZ13-0016, 27500 Novi Road, Cheesecake
17	Factory.
18	Sir, how many people will be
19	speaking tonight?
	Page 20

24

Ŷ

25

20 MR. DETERS: Two. 21 CHAI RMAN GHANNAM: If both, 22 whoever the speakers are going to be, can 23 raise your right hands and be sworn by our 24 secretary. 25 MS. KRIEGER: State your names, please, and spell your last names. 1 2 MR. DETERS: My name is Paul 3 Deters, D, as in David, e-t-e-r-s. I'm with Metro Detroit Signs. 4 MR. FERRIS: Tracy Ferris, 5 F-e-r-r-i-s, with Cheesecake Factory, 6 construction. 7 MS. KRIEGER: In Case No. 8 9 PZ13-0016, do you swear or affirm to tell the 10 truth? MR. DETERS: 11 Yes. 12 MR. FERRIS: Yes. 13 CHAI RMAN GHANNAM: PI ease 14 proceed. 15 MR. DETERS: Thank you for considering our case this evening. 16 17 As you may know, Cheesecake Factory is undergoing construction to open 18 their first store in Michigan. 19 We are very 20 excited to be here, and we are excited to 21 work on the project. We have submitted some 22 applications for signage already through the 23 building department and have received 24 approval for what they would consider their Page 21

entrance marker sign.

1 However, what we would like to do this evening is have you consider a second 2 sign request that we have in light of a few 3 4 different factors. One, this site is critical to 5 6 help the Cheesecake Factory establish their 7 brand in Michigan. And a number of people don't really know a lot about them or what 8 9 their offerings are. 10 They happen to be going into an 11 area that does not have visibility from any of the public thoroughfares. 12 13 So maybe you see a little bit of 14 it right now from Twelve Mile Road, but once the foliage comes in, there really won't be 15 16 much visibility. 17 So what we are hoping this 18 evening is to be able to get an approval for 19 the secondary sign which will allow traffic 20 that they're looking to attract, which will primarily be going around the perimeter road 21 22 of the mall to be able to identify where they're located, and what some of their 23 offerings might. 24 25 We think that the sign that's proposed here is very in scale with what the 1

Ŷ

25

27

Page 22

building is, in fact, most of the letters,

Ŷ

3	130409.txt you know, the majority of the letters are
4	only 16 inches. It just had happens to be
5	that here is a real large C and a real large
6	F that are part of their logo.
7	We have a couple of pictures
8	here, and Tracy is going to put these up to
9	give you an idea.
10	To give you an idea of what the
11	building will look like, they're undergoing a
12	pretty serious facade renovations right now,
13	and Tracy can probably address any of those,
14	and some of the branding they have done in
15	other markets, if you might have some
16	concerns about what we are proposing here
17	this evening.
18	CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: Thank you,
19	sir. Is there anybody in the public who
20	would like to make a comment about this
21	particular case?
22	(No audi bl e responses.)
23	CHAI RMAN GHANNAM: Seeing none, I
24	will close the public remarks section and ask
25	our secretary to read any correspondence.
1	MS. KRIEGER: In Case No.
2	PZ13-0016, 42 were mailed, five returned, one
3	approval, zero objections.
4	The approval is "I see no problem
5	with this sign", from Bruce Lloyd property
6	manager of the Novi office center. That's
7	it.

8	130409.txt CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: Thank you.
9	Any comments from the city?
10	MS. SAARELA: I have none.
11	MR. BOULARD: Nothing to add.
12	CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: I will open it
13	up to the board for discussion. Any
14	questions?
15	Member Sanghvi?
16	MR. SANGHVI: Do we have
17	permission from the Taubman
18	MR. BOULARD: Yes. On the second
19	page of the application, you will see a
20	signature of Laura Cunningham. She is their
21	current tenant coordinator.
22	MR. SANGHVI: Thank you. I have
23	no other questions.
24	CHAI RMAN GHANNAM: My own
25	personal opinion. I have no problem with
1	this. I understand the what you call it,
2	the requirements of chain restaurants and
2	their logos and so forth. I'm very familiar
4	with this space. I've been there many times.
5	I say thank you for coming, in my opinion.
6	But I think it's appropriate
7	given the size of this particular location,
8	so I have no problem with it.
9	Anybody else? Any comments,
10	concerns? If none, I will entertain a
11	motion.
12	MR. GEDEON: I will take it.
	Page 24

13	130409.txt CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: Member Gedeon.
14	MR. GEDEON: In Case No.
15	PZ13-0016, 27500 Novi Road, Cheesecake
16	Factory I move to approve the variance as
17	requested.
18	The request is based on
19	circumstances or features that are
20	exceptional and unique to the property and do
21	not result from conditions that exist
22	generally in the city or that are
23	self-created.
24	Specifically this restaurant is
25	going into a large multi-tenant facility, and
1	there is low visibility of this particular
2	
2	space from the main roads, and with respect

space from the main roads, and with respect to the size of the sign, there is significant amounts of white space which reduces the -you know, the actual visual space taken up by the letters. 30

7 The failure to grant relief will unreasonably prevent or limit the use of the 8 9 property and will result in substantially 10 more than a mere inconvenience or inability 11 to attain a higher economic or financial return. The grant of relief will not result 12 in a use of structure that is incompatible 13 14 with or unreasonably interferes with adjacent 15 or surrounding properties, will result in substantial justice being done to both the 16 17 applicant and adjacent or surrounding

Page 25

Ŷ

3

4

5

10	130409. txt
18	properties, and is not inconsistent with the
19	spirit of the ordinance.
20	MR. FERRELL: Second.
21	CHAI RMAN GHANNAM: Seeing a
22	motion and a second, any further discussion?
23	I just had one comment. Can
24	we if we grant this, this would be, in a
25	sense unlimited, regardless of the tenant, I
1	presume and we can limit this to the tenant?
2	MS. SAARELA: Yes.
3	CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: I will just
4	ask to amend that we grant this, but we limit
5	it to this tenant, so long as it's there. If
6	that's okay with the movement and the second?
7	MR. GEDEON: I think the factors
8	might be applicable to future tenants as
9	well, but I'm happy to amend that,
10	notwi thstandi ng.
11	MR. FERRELL: I second that.
12	CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: Any further
13	di scussi on?
14	(No audible responses.)
15	CHAI RMAN GHANNAM: Seeing none,
16	Ms. Pawlowski, can you call the roll.
17	MS. PAWLOWSKI: Member Gedeon?
18	MR. GEDEON: Yes.
19	MS. PAWLOWSKI: Member Gerblick?
20	MR. GERBLICK: Yes.
21	MS. PAWLOWSKI: Chairman Ghannam?
22	CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: Yes.

Page 26

23	130409.txt MS. PAWLOWSKI: Member Krieger?
24	MS. KRIEGER: Yes.
25	MS. PAWLOWSKI: Member Sanghvi?

1 MR. SANGHVI: Yes. MS. PAWLOWSKI: Member Ferrell? 2 3 MS. SKELCY: Yes. 4 MS. PAWLOWSKI: Motion passes six 5 to zero. CHAI RMAN GHANNAM: 6 7 Congratul ations. MR. DETERS: Thank you. 8 9 CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: Next on the agenda is other matters. And one of them 10 11 that we have listed is election of officers. It's that time of the year. 12 13 So at this point what we do is 14 simply take nominations, is that correct? 15 MS. SAARELA: Yes. CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: We don't do it 16 17 in any particular order, do we? First I think we should start 18 19 with secretary. If anybody has any 20 nominations for secretary, we will entertain 21 that. We are missing two members, 22 Member Ibe and Member Skelcy, but I know 23 24 Member lbe knew he would not be here this 25 month.

4

Ŷ

1

MS. SAARELA: Do we have Page 27

33

2	knowledge that either of them wants to be
3	secretary?
4	CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: I don't in
5	particular. Anybody have any knowledge
6	whether they want to be secretary?
7	MR. SANGHVI: I was going to
8	propose Member Gedeon.
9	CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: Member Gedeon
10	has been nominated. Anybody second that?
11	I will second that.
12	Any other nominations for
13	secretary?
14	(No audi bl e responses.)
15	CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: Mr. Gedeon, do
16	you accept the nomination of secretary?
17	MR. GEDEON: Sure, I will accept
18	that.
19	CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: Any other
20	nominations for secretary?
21	(No audi bl e responses.)
22	CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: I will close
23	them at this point and have voice votes
24	are okay?
25	MS. SAARELA: Yes.
1	
1	CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: All in favor
2	of Member Gedeon being secretary say aye.
3	THE BOARD: Aye.
4	CHAI RMAN GHANNAM: Any opposed?
5	(No audible responses.)
6	CHAI RMAN GHANNAM: Seei ng none, Page 28

7	congratulations, Member Gedeon, you are our
8	secretary for this upcoming year.
9	Next we will entertain a motion
10	for vice chairman.
11	Any nominations for that?
12	MR. SANGHVI: Nominate
13	Ms. Krieger for that.
14	CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: Member Krieger
15	. Any second to that?
16	MR. GEDEON: I will second that.
17	CHAI RMAN GHANNAM: Seeing a
18	motion and a second, Member Krieger, do you
19	accept that nomination?
20	MS. KRIEGER: Sure.
21	CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: Any other
22	nominations for vice chair?
23	(No audi bl e responses.)
24	CHAI RMAN GHANNAM: Seeing none, I
25	will close that and ask for a voice vote.
1	All in favor of Member Krieger
2	being vice chair say aye.
3	THE BOARD: Aye.
4	CHAI RMAN GHANNAM: Any opposed?
5	(No audi bl e responses.)
6	CHAI RMAN GHANNAM: Seeing none,
7	congratulations, Member Krieger, you are our
, 8	new vice chair.
9	Now for chairman. I will
, 10	entertain nominations for that.
10	MR. SANGHVI: I was going to
	Page 29

12	nominate Ms. Skelcy, but she is not here.
13	And I don't know whether it's appropriate to
14	do it in her absence.
15	MS. SAARELA: Well, doesn't say
16	she can't be nominated because she is absent.
17	If we have knowledge that she wants to be
18	nominated and would accept the nomination, we
19	could go ahead with that. I guess if we came
20	to find out she didn't want to be, we could
21	redo it at the next
22	CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: We can do it
23	that way.
24	MS. SAARELA: Yeah.
25	MR. SANGHVI: Can we nominate her
1	with the provision that she needs to accept
2	it?
3	CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: I think we can
4	nominate and approve it, if everybody is in
5	agreement, or the majority is in agreement,
6	but if for some reason she is not interested
7	next month, we could renominate someone else
8	to be the chair. Does that make sense?
9	MS. SAARELA: We could.
10	MR. SANGHVI: I nominate
11	Ms. Skelcy for the chairmanship.
12	MR. GERBLICK: I will second
13	that.
14	CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: Seeing a
15	nomination and a second. Any other
16	nominations to be chair for next year? By
. •	Page 30

36

17	all means, if anybody wants to nominate
18	themselves, they could.
19	(No audi bl e responses.)
20	CHAI RMAN GHANNAM: Seei ng no
21	other nominations, we will take a voice vote.
22	All in favor of Member Skelcy
23	being our next chair say aye.
24	THE BOARD: Aye.
25	CHAI RMAN GHANNAM: Any opposed?

37

1	(No audible responses).
2	CHAI RMAN GHANNAM: Seeing none,
3	Member Skelcy is our new chairperson, subject
4	to her hopefully her confirmation.
5	Is there any other matters other
6	than the election of officers?
7	MR. BOULARD: No.
8	CHAIRMAN GHANNAM: Nothing else.
9	I will entertain a motion to adjourn.
10	MR. SANGHVI: So moved.
11	MR. GERBLICK: Second.
12	CHAI RMAN GHANNAM: Seeing a
13	motion and second, all in favor say aye.
14	THE BOARD: Aye.
15	CHAI RMAN GHANNAM: Any opposed?
16	(No audible responses).
17	CHAI RMAN GHANNAM: Seeing none,
18	we are adjourned.
19	(Meeting was adjourned at 7:35 p.m.)
20	** ** **
21	Page 31
	raye Si

Ŷ

22 23 24 25 38 1 STATE OF MICHIGAN) 2) SS. COUNTY OF OAKLAND 3) 4 I, Jennifer L. Wall, Notary Public within and for the 5 County of Oakland, State of Michigan, do hereby certify that the witness whose attached deposition was taken before me in the 6 7 above entitled matter was by me duly sworn at the aforementioned 8 time and place; that the testimony given by said witness was 9 stenographically recorded in the presence of said witness and 10 afterward transcribed by computer under my personal supervision, 11 and that the said deposition is a full, true and correct 12 transcript of the testimony given by the witness. 13 I further certify that I am not connected by blood or 14 marriage with any of the parties or their attorneys, and that I 15 am not an employee of either of them, nor financially interested 16 in the action. 17 IN WITNESS THEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand at the 18 City of Walled Lake, County of Oakland, State of Michigan. 19 20 21 Date Jenni fer L. Wall CSR-4183 Oakland County, Michigan My Commission Expires 11/12/15 22 23 24 25

Ŷ

Page 32